

DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
ENVIRONMENT SUB GROUP

DSG/ESG(2010)M002

**MINUTES OF THE DSG ENVIRONMENT SUB GROUP MEETING HELD ON
WEDNESDAY 16TH JUNE 2010 AT 1330 HOURS IN THE PENTLAND HOTEL,
THURSO**

Present:	Cllr George Farlow	Highland Council (sub group chair)
	Alastair MacDonald	DSG Honorary member
	Hamish Pottinger	Caithness Against Nuclear Dumping
	Deirdre Henderson	Buldoo Residents Group
	Cllr Steven Heddle	Orkney Island Council
	June Love	DSG Secretariat, DSRL
	Alan Scullion	DSRL, Director of Assurance
	Phil Cartwright	DSRL, for item 6
	Jim Gemmill	SEPA
	Paul Dale	SEPA

MINUTES

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

George Farlow welcomed everyone to the meeting. For the benefit of Jim Gemmill and Paul Dale those present introduced themselves.

2. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from the following:

- Brian Mutch (SGRPID)
- Cllr Rick Nickerson (Shetland Islands Council)
- Gordon Jenkins (North Highland College)
- Pauline Crow (Health Board)
- Randal Angus (Caithness Young Farmers)
- Roy Blackburn (NDA)
- Roger Wilson (SEPA)

3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

DSG/ESG(2010)M001 refers. There were no amendments to these minutes and therefore were taken as a true reflection of the meeting. This was proposed by Hamish Pottinger and seconded by Steven Heddle.

George Farlow asked that the group's thanks to be recorded to Ian Webster (Buldoo Residents Group) for his contributions at the sub group meeting.

Hamish Pottinger suggested that the inclusion of an additional agenda item should be included after agreement of the minutes so that any issues to be discussed are recorded following acceptance of the minutes.

Action: DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A001: Secretary to include additional agenda item following item 3 (minutes of the meeting) to allow follow up discussion on the minutes.

4. PROGRESS ON ACTIONS

See appendix 1 for an update on progress.

- DSG(2010)M001/A005: date of consultation for DSRL's discharge authorisation. This action was complete and new action was minuted.

Action: DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A002: Roger Wilson to provide timetable for consultation on DSRL's site discharge authorisation.

- DSG(2009)M004/A003: DSRL to provide a presentation to ESG on environmental monitoring.

Deirdre Henderson noted that as the closest farmer to the site she had been approached for the first time last year for sampling to be undertaken. She stated she would like to see the information gained from sampling, in an understandable form.

Steven Heddle asked for reassurance that the measurements in the reduced monitoring regime would allow comparison with previous measurements. Alan Scullion responded that this would be the case.

Action: DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A003: Alan Scullion to consider how to best to present sampling results and discuss with Deirdre Henderson to ensure the information provided is understandable.

5. PROPOSAL TO REFORMAT DSG SUB GROUPS

DSG(2010)P010 was tabled. The secretary summarised the paper and set out the thinking behind the proposal. Of note:

- Socio economic sub group would remain as is
- Admin and procedures sub group would change to a business meeting of the chair, vice-chair and sub group chairs to allow key issues to be discussed and actions identified which would come forward to the main DSG for endorsement by DSG members. The business group will not be a decision making body.
- The biggest change was the proposal to combine the site operations and environment sub group. The reasoning behind this was that the topics for discussions inevitably overlap and it was felt that the sub group would be stronger if combined.

The site operations sub group raised the issue of timing, given that the site operations sub group meets in the evening (and if this proposal is to go ahead it would mean that the ESG would move away from the afternoon of the main meeting and would be scheduled for the site operations sub group meetings. The site operations sub group suggested a trial meeting to see if the combination of both sub groups was useful.

This obviously has the advantage that this sub group – which would be renamed – site restoration sub group – would meet well in advance of the main DSG and this means that any issues of concern could be raised at the business meeting to discuss and identify a way forward.

It also means that instead of simply reporting the discussions held at the sub

group the key issues would be identified and would then give more time for a more open discussion at the main meeting.

Rick Nickerson had provided written comments as follows:

"I also noted somewhere that there is a proposal to merge the ESG with the Site Operations Group and that the likely meetings will be scheduled for the Site Operational Group dates. You will of course be aware that the ESG and DSG dates enable us to participate during one trip. If this proposal goes ahead this will not be very convenient for Shetland and will also incur additional travel costs if they do not coincide with the DSG meetings. In these difficult financial times we may not be able to justify two separate trips. "

Alastair MacDonald noted that there was a problem with attendance at sub groups and often the discussions at site operations and environmental were on the same topics. It had also been noted that the workrate of some sub groups were far greater than others and by combining this would take the pressure of a small group of members.

Councillor Steven Heddle said that he understood the reasoning behind the combination however the change of timing of the meeting could be a problem for those travelling. He asked if there was scope for holding the combined sub group in the afternoon instead of evening.

Following discussion it was agreed that the environmental sub group would agree to a trial meeting but that the timing of the meeting should be considered before going ahead.

Action: DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A003: Secretary to contact all site operations and environmental sub group members with a view to confirming a suitable date and time for a trial meeting.

6. PARTICLES UPDATE

DSG(2010)C051 (Particles progress report) and DSG(2010)C039 (update from PRAG(D) were tabled. Phil Cartwright provided an update. Of note:

- The offshore cleanup will commence in July. The new remote operated equipment is being built and trials of the location and retrieval equipment have been completed which were fairly successful. The results of the trials would go to PRAG(D) next week.
- The support barge would be a 60m vessel and it was intended to cover 12.5 hectares of the area where the main plume of particles is recorded to be.

There had been some concerns from local fisherman relating to the size of the working platform (the barge) and whether the anchoring of the barge would impinge on fishing gear.

Deirdre Henderson stated that the local fisherman who lived at Buldoo was horrified at the size of the barge which he believes is bound to cause disruption. As a local person living next to the site he was disappointed that he had not even received a letter on this. Phil Cartwright agreed to follow this up and ensure the local fisherman was contacted. *[Secretary's note: following this up after the meeting it has been confirmed that the local fisherman was one of the signatories of a letter sent raising concerns about the deployment of the 60 metre barge.]*

George Farlow stated that it appeared that the line of communication had broken. Deirdre Henderson responded that the problem with the local resident's livelihoods depended on fishing and farming. George responded that communication was two-way thing and asked Deirdre what she would like to see in increased communication from DSRL.

Phil Cartwright stated that extensive consultation had led to the decision to target seabed clean-up and the use of a professional offshore contractor was part of this.

Paul Dale said that the objective of the work was to allow removal of any specific restrictions to the area which included the fishing ban zone and George responded that it had to be done by taking people with you.

Steven Heddle asked whether anchoring in the main plume would potentially disturb what was there. Phil Cartwright said that from extensive studies they know that even with winter storms the largest particles had not moved very far. Last year the area to the west had been cleared and this year efforts would be concentrated to the east. He noted that the anchoring would be arranged to minimise anchor moves and the anchor sites would be monitored.

- Onshore monitoring continued – DSRL had been given access to Sandside beach and monitoring had taken place with the detection and retrieval of 5 particles (two relevant and 3 minor). Access for monitoring was not available in June (so far) and discussions with the landowner were ongoing.
- PRAG(D) – the Particles Retrieval Advisory Group (Dounreay) had written to DSG asking them to provide a representative. Alastair MacDonald had been nominated but due to circumstances outwith his control had not attended. It had been previously agreed that Phil Cartwright would provide an update at this meeting.

Members discussed representative and agreed that the present arrangements that Phil Cartwright provide an update at these sub groups continued. As there was a meeting next week members were asked to provide any questions or issues to be raised to June who would ensure they were passed to Phil to bring up at PRAG(D).

Action: DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A004: All members to provide any questions or issues to be raised at PRAG(D) to June as soon as possible (meeting to be held on 23rd June).

7. UPDATES

DSRL

DSG(2010)P012 and P013 were tabled. Alan Scullion provided a verbal update including:

- An employee had broken his ankle on site resulting in a lost time accident. Prior to that the site had gone 469 days without a lost time accident.
- Discharges remain within the discharge authorisation with no significant environmental impacts.

- On 28th May there had been a fire in PFR which had been extinguished promptly and reported.
- SEPA had confirmed they were content with the site's operational performance assessment.
- The information required for the discharge authorisation would be ready by the end of July.
- DSRL were assessed and found to be compliant against the environmental legislation.
- The site's emergency exercise had taken place and was deemed satisfactory.
- The site received the British Council Safety Award for 2009.
- The site wide safety challenge had been met and new one looking to identification of best practices would be set shortly.
- High hazard reduction continues with almost 40% of the liquid sodium now destroyed at DFR.

SEPA

DSG(2010)P014 was tabled. Jim Gemmill noted the following:

- SEPA had currently undergone restructuring with a reduction of 10% of posts.
- As part of the restructuring the policy and regulator areas would be merged and it likely to take place in September.

In relation to action 11 (RIFE report) Paul Dale provided a presentation. See DSG(2010)C056.

Paul Dale noted that sampling would be repeated in 2010. Hamish Pottinger asked whether it was rabbits and venison which were in the area to which Paul confirmed that they did not identify the specific source they were samples which would have entered the local supply chain.

8. LOW LEVEL WASTE UPDATE

DSG(2010)C027 was tabled. This was a letter from DSRL providing notification of the contract for design and construction of the first two phases on the low level waste facility.

Deirdre Henderson said that the front page of the local newspaper today carried a story of concerns raised by Buldoo with regards to a report which had been sent to SEPA detailing areas where monitoring had taken place following the contamination finds on the low level waste facility ground. The information sent to SEPA indicated that a field belonging to her had been monitored and this had not been the case.

Phil Cartwright said that there had been an error in the map that had been included in the report sent to SEPA and that it had been an admin error rather than an attempt to mislead. He noted that following the contamination find they had asked whether local farmers wished to have their fields monitored and this offer had been declined.

9. NDA WASTE INVENTORY

DSG(2010)C047 refers. The NDA had written asking whether stakeholder groups felt that the information on NDA's radioactive waste inventory was adequate. It was agreed that members would consider this and provide comment to the secretary to collate a response.

Action: DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A005: All members to provide comment/views on DSG(2010)C047 (waste inventory) to secretary for collation. Views to be submitted to NDA by 31st July 2010.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The secretary noted that she had had a written question asking SEPA to clarify an entry in the SEPA's report related to waste management. The report stated that SEPA were considering what action to take on the unlicensed retention of waste. Jim Gemmill stated that the site needed to be compliant with regulations and SEPA would ensure this. Bob Earnshaw (attended meeting part time) noted that this had been a discussion with the DSG at the March meeting which had resulted in DSG writing to the Environment minister to see if there was a pragmatic solution.

There being no further business the meeting was closed.

George Farlow
Environment sub group chairman
19th June 2010

APPENDIX 1 – STATUS OF ACTIONS

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A001: Secretary to include additional agenda item following item 3 (minutes of the meeting) to allow follow up discussion on the minutes.

DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A002: Roger Wilson to provide timetable for consultation on DSRL's site discharge authorisation.

DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A003: Alan Scullion to consider how to best to present sampling results and discuss with Deirdre Henderson to ensure the information provided is understandable.

DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A004: All members to provide any questions or issues to be raised at PRAG(D) to June as soon as possible (meeting to be held on 23rd June).

DSG/ESG(2010)M002/A005: All members to provide comment/views on DSG(2010)C047 (waste inventory) to secretary for collation. Views to be submitted to NDA by 31st July 2010.

ACTIONS ONGOING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

DSG(2010)M001/A001: Elizabeth Gray to update DSG on low level waste issues relating to policy (and including licensing issues) at the appropriate time.

DSG(2010)M001/A007: : Rick Nickerson to circulate Shetland Islands Council response to Scottish Government's consultation on high activity waste when available.

DSG(2010)M001/A009: George Farlow to circulate Highland Council's response to Scottish Government's consultation on high activity waste when available.

DSG(2009)M004/A008: Secretary to invite COMARE to present their findings once the extended study on cancer excesses in the vicinity of Seascale and Dounreay was complete..

ACTIONS COMPLETED

DSG(2009)M001/A018: ESG to write to Scottish Government and HSE to stress that a date for a decision on whether the low level waste facility should be licensed was given greater priority to allow a decision to be made. *Action ongoing* – Scottish Government have responded as follows: "There are currently actions outstanding arising from the last meeting with HSE and other interested parties which require to be completed but due to other priorities in each of the organisations we have not been able to progress this matter as quickly as we would have wished. The Scottish Government will continue to work closely with HSE and others to progress the issue of licensing facilities such as that planned for Dounreay". [DSG(2009)C098 asks for this action to be closed out as a matter of urgency]. Action now complete – this action has been superseded by DSG(2010)M001/A001

DSG(2009)M004/A003: Tony Wratten, DSRL to provide a presentation to the ESG on environmental monitoring (current regime and into the future). *Action complete* – Alan Scullion provided a presentation on this. See DSG(2010)C055.

DSG(2009)M004/A006: Tony Wratten to circulate the Highland Council's Planning Framework document to ESG members when complete. *Action complete – Alan Scullion reported that because the two major build projects had been deferred it was uncertain whether the framework document would be required in the short term.*

DSG(2009)M004/A005: June Love to organise a visit to the Dounreay site for Councillors Steven Heddle and George Farlow (and extend to other DSG members) at a convenient time. *Action complete – visit organised for 17th June 2010.*

DSG(2010)M001/A003: Secretary to contact COMARE to ask if they were considering KIKK (German) study on leukaemia clusters in young people while carrying out their own extended study. *Action complete: Paul Dale stated that while he could not speak on behalf of the COMARE chairman he could confirm that the KIKK report had been taken into account.*

DSG(2010)M001/A004: Secretary to circulate PRAG(D) minutes and list of paperwork to ESG members on a regular basis. *Action complete – this will be done as appropriate via Environment sub group.*

DSG(2010)M001/A005: Secretary to ask SEPA when consultation on DSRL's site discharge authorisation was expected. *Action complete – DSRL had sent the application to SEPA and further information was requested. Once SEPA has determined the application it will go forward to statutory consultation (Scottish Government, NII, Food Standards Agency, etc) before going out for public consultation which is likely to be at the end of 2010 or early 2011.*

DSG(2010)M001/A006: Alan Scullion to clarify review periods for the site discharge authorisation. *Action complete – Alan Scullion reported that looking back at history there has been a number of reviews based on the site's requirements and the authorisation has matched that. It is expected that the review would be 2012 to 2014 unless there was a major change. Jim Gemmill confirmed that SEPA would normally undertake the review but if circumstances changed a review could be undertaken earlier.*

DSG(2010)M001/A008: Steven Heddle to circulate Orkney Islands Council response to Scottish Government's consultation on high activity waste when available. *Action complete – DSG(2010)C033.*

DSG(2010)M001/A010: James Gunn to check whether DFR is scheduled to be painted this coming financial year. *Action complete – there are no plans to paint the sphere this year – it is currently in the plan for 2011 (budget permitting)*

DSG(2010)M001/A011: Roger Wilson to provide response in relation to questions from RIFE report. *Action complete – Paul Dale provided a brief presentation which was discussed under item 7 (SEPA update).*

DSG(2010)M001/A018: June Love to request presentation from DSRL on the potential impacts for the site of the Scottish Government's consultation on higher activity waste. *Action complete – Elizabeth Gray, Scottish Government, will attend to provide presentation. A working group has been set up to consider the consultation document and will include a DSRL representative for factual information.*