

DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
SITE RESTORATION SUB GROUP MEETING

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001

**MINUTES OF THE SITE RESTORATION SUB GROUP MEETING HELD ON
TUESDAY 20TH JULY AT 1330 HOURS IN THE PENTLAND HOTEL, THURSO.**

Present:	Bob Earnshaw	DSG Chairman
	Brian Mutch	SGRPID
	Hamish Pottinger	Caithness Against Nuclear Dumping
	Deirdre Henderson	Buldoo Residents Group
	Gordon Jenkins	North Highland College
	Alan Scott	Caithness Contractors Consortium
	Anne Chard	Caithness West Community Council
	Cllr Katrina MacNab	Highland Council
	John Deighan	Dounreay Unions
In addition:	June Love	DSRL/DSG Secretariat
	Simon Middlemas	DSRL, Managing Director
	Stuart Chalmers	NDA Programme Manager
	Michael Moreland	Vulcan (MOD)
	Roger Wilson	SEPA
	Jill Callander	Chapelcross SSG Secretariat (observing)

MINUTES

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Bob Earnshaw, DSG Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting. He noted that this was a combined meeting of the site operations sub group and environment sub group (as described in DSG(2010)P010: reformatting of the DSG sub groups). This was a trial of the two groups meeting as one and there would be a discussion at the end of the meeting to agree the way forward.

Bob also welcomed Jill Callander, Chapelcross SSG secretariat, to the meeting. Jill was attending in observer capacity. For the benefit of all those attending introduced themselves.

2. APOLO IES RECEIVED.

Apologies have been received from:

- Pauline Craw Health Service
- Peter Dickenson NII (Dounreay)
- Stuart Currie DNSR (Vulcan)
- Ian Bramwell NII (Vulcan)
- Trudy Morris Chamber of Commerce
- Cllr Rick Nickerson Shetland Island Council
- Cllr George Farlow Highland Council
- Alastair MacDonald DSG honorary member
- Roy Blackburn NDA
- Phil Cartwright DSRL

3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

Two sets of minutes were tabled for endorsement.

The site operations sub group minutes (DSG/SOSG(2010)M002) were proposed as a true record by John Deighan and seconded by Anne Chard.

The environment sub group minutes (DSG/ESG(2010)M002) were proposed as a true record by Deirdre Henderson and seconded by Hamish Pottinger.

No issues were raised from the minutes.

4. PRO RESS ON ACTIONS

The secretary reported progress on the actions. Of note:

- M002/A003: Roger Wilson to provide timetable for consultation on DSRL's site discharge authorisation. *Action complete* - Roger Wilson noted that the first phase of consultation had gone out to statutory consultees (Scottish Government, NII, Food Standards Agency, etc). At present it was with these bodies for their feedback. It was expected that public consultation would be carried out by the end of the calendar year.
- M002/A004: Alan Scullion to consider how best to present sampling results and discuss with Deirdre Henderson to ensure that the information is what is required. *Action ongoing*.
- M002/A006: All members to provide comments/views on Correspondence 47 NDA waste inventory. This was discussed later in the agenda.
- M001/A001: Elizabeth Gray to update DSG on low level waste issues relating to policy and including licensing issues. *This is still ongoing*.
- M001/A007: Shetland Island Council to circulate its response to Scottish Government's higher activity waste consultation. *Action complete* – DSG(2010)C069.
- M004/A009: Secretary to invite COMARE to present their findings once the extended study on cancer excesses in the vicinity of Seascale and Dounreay is complete. *This action continues – secretary as emailed twice with no response. A formal letter will now be sent.*

5. VULCAN UPDATE

DSG(2010)P016 (Vulcan update – June 2010) and DSG(2010)P015 (DNSR report) were tabled. Michael Moreland provided a verbal update, of note:

- The Shore Test Facility remains shutdown while a mechanical problem is addressed. A programme of maintenance has been carried forward to align the plant, refurbish components. It is hoped that the facility will be operational in November.
- The Lonestar exercise held in June went well and was currently awaiting formal feedback from the regulators.
- About 28 days ago a person on the site fell down the stairs which resulted in a lost time accident. The person involved has recovered.

- Confirmation on the future of the site was still awaited. While the plant was shutdown at present it was essential that the burn on the current core would be completed. Any decisions on the future must take cognisance of that and timescales adjusted as required.
- MOD was looking at value for money and some elements of the site programme will be competed in the future.
- The review of the Defence budget was continuing and expected to be complete in October.

John Deighan asked whether the workforce was stable and for how long could this be maintained. He noted that DSRL were already shedding jobs. Michael Moreland responded that at present workforce numbers remained stable. He noted that the majority of people who worked on the Vulcan site were local people and that he recognised this was an important issue for everyone in the community.

Michael added that Rolls-Royce were looking at other avenues to continue a presence in Caithness and were looking at providing support to civil nuclear projects, marine energy, etc to look to maintain an industrial base in Caithness. Bob Earnshaw responded that he was aware, through the Socio Economic sub group that Rolls-Royce was looking at alternatives.

6. **DOUNREAY UPDATE**

DSG(2010)P017 (DSRL performance update, May 2010) was tabled. Simon Middlemas provided a verbal update. Of note:

- A letter had been sent to DSG (DSG(2010)C071 refers) explaining that DSRL would be applying for a landfill permit to designate the current on-site storage area for rubble as a landfill to comply with legislation. The landfill would be for Dounreay non-radioactive waste only.

Roger Wilson, SEPA noted that this will now close out the item contained within the SEPA report on this subject. SEPA would be considering the application and conditions appropriate to the protection of the environment will be placed.

- The high hazard destruction continued with 142 batches of liquid metal now destroyed at DFR (Dounreay Fast Reactor). The plant would be shutdown shortly for scheduled maintenance.
- The investigation into the PFR fire had now been completed and a number of actions have been identified.
- A number of small scale incidents had resulted on the site over a period of time and as a result a safety stand-down was instigated on the 29th June. This allowed everyone on site to assess their areas and identify improvements.
- A lot of work has been carried out in support of the NDA competition. The lifetime plan was currently being revised to align with the £150M flat funding. This entailed a huge amount of work and the final version would not be available until December. It was likely that the end date would go out to the right (ie beyond 2025). There was an NDA team auditing the changes being made to the programme and further audits will be undertaken to ensure the lifetime plan is

NDA compliant before being finalised.

- The offshore particles retrieval project is due to start on Thursday this week (22nd July). Discussions had taken place with D Innes, Buldoo regarding concerns he had with fishing while the barge was anchored. DSRL had asked the contractor to meet with Mr Innes before clean-up operations commenced.

The secretary noted that Phil Cartwright had been invited to the meeting to provide an update of the PRAG(D) (Particles Retrieval Advisory Group (Dounreay)). Phil was not available for this meeting but would be invited along to future meetings to provide this update. Simon Middlemas noted that the PRAG(D) Chairman, Keith Boddy was seriously ill and a replacement chairman was being sought.

John Deighan noted that the Dounreay Unions were concerned about the job situation, especially in light of the work being carried out on the lifetime plan. Simon Middlemas responded that once the lifetime plan was complete DSRL would look at the staffing profile over the longer term. Discussions had taken place with the unions and supply chain and for this financial year DSRL were looking to shed 102 posts and then over the next two years it was anticipated to be about 70-80 job losses. Simon stated that this had not changed from current projections. He added that when the competition was complete in April 2012 the new PBO (Parent Body Organisation) may have different ideas and the date for site closure would potentially change.

It was noted that, as a rule of thumb, for every job lost at Dounreay it would impact on 3 indirect job losses, therefore if the site lost 180 jobs this could be multiplied by 4 for the whole area (Dounreay Travel to Work area).

Anne Chard asked if the remotely operated vehicle (ROV) for the particle clean-up was more efficient than the last system used. Simon Middlemas said that work pattern would change to allow a longer working day (weather permitting). The new ROV had slightly bigger detectors and could go travel further than the original ROV used in previous clean-up campaigns. The results of the off-shore clean-up would be given to PRAG(D) to review.

Alan Scott noted that the site was currently working to a budget of £161M. He asked if the site was maintaining the spending profile. Simon Middlemas responded that the budget had changed, in the last few months, to £150M and DSRL was currently carrying out the scope of work for less money. In regards the predicted spend the site was actually aligned with procurement. He asked Alan to come and see him separately if the Caithness Contractors Consortium had any concerns.

Deirdre Henderson asked if monitoring at Sandside beach had resumed. Simon Middlemas said that currently access had been withdrawn but discussions were ongoing with the landowner.

Katrina MacNab asked if the 102 job losses this year would be targeted. Simon Middlemas said that they were currently looking for volunteers. He noted that until this was finalised he did not want to go into detail because discussions had to take place with those involved and with the unions.

DSG(2010)P019: NII quarterly report (Dounreay) April to June 2010 was tabled. It was noted that Peter Dickinson, NII had tendered his apologies for this meeting. The paper had not been circulated earlier. Members agreed they would read the paper

outside the meeting and if there were any issues would contact the secretary who would ask for a response.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A001: All members to read DS (2010)P019, NII report and raise any issues or questions with the Secretary.

Roger Wilson, SEPA noted that he had provided a paper for the Environment sub group meeting held on 16th June. He had no further topics to raise at this time.

7. NDA UPDATE

Stuart Chalmers, NDA provided a verbal update. Of note:

- The NDA had published a report entitled “Geological Disposal: Steps towards implementation” which set out how geological disposal would be taken forward. A DVD had also been produced.
- Bruce McKirdy had been appointed as the Managing Director of the RWMD (Radioactive Waste Management Directorate). This would operate in a similar fashion to the SLCs (site licence company).
- Richard Waite would be leaving the NDA in September to take up a new position with CH2MHILL.
- In terms of the overall re-organisation of the NDA this was ongoing. There would be a reduction of approximately 100 posts and the formal consultation on this would due to be complete at the end of this week.
- The revision of DSRL’s lifetime plan should not be under-estimated. This was a huge task and the site was doing a good job at progressing this. Currently DSRL had brought the plan in to ±£5M of the target cost of £150M.
- The NDA competition for the Dounreay site had been delayed and NDA were currently trying to pull back some of the slippage by looking at providing participants with early access to the site to do reviews and information gathering. At present the March 2012 date was still achievable.

Bob Earnshaw said that DSG was aware that those bidding for the site were spending money now. Stuart Chalmers responded that NDA continue to be in dialogue with the participants.

John Deighan said he was disappointed that only two participants had come forward, he had expected at least four major companies to be interested. There was also discussion on the criteria and measures for socio economics within the contract.
[Secretary’s note: DSG(2010)C070 is the note for the record on the meeting held with NDA competition team and covers fully these topics].

Katrina MacNab asked how many NDA people were based locally. Stuart Chalmers responded there was eleven in the site facing team based out at Forss.

Alan Scott noted that he had asked Simon Middlemas about the spend on site because of rumours that were circulating that DSRL was £30/40M underspent. Stuart Chalmers said this was not true and that the spending profile was on track.

8. TOPICS FOR DISCUSSION

Bob Earnshaw noted a items of correspondence for discussion. These were:

- DSG(2010)C047: NDA's waste inventory questionnaire. A response is due by the 31st July and this was tabled at the last Environment sub group meeting. Members were asked to consider this and respond to the secretary who would compile the response and distribute for approval before submitting back to the NDA. *[Secretary's note – action DSG(2010)M002/A006 refers]*.
- DSG(2010)C054: Minutes of the Scottish Sites meeting held in April. Members were reminded that DSG is represented on this group which is made up of Scottish Government, NDA, Site licence companies and site stakeholder groups from Scotland. Members were asked to read the minutes and provide the Secretary with any comments, issues or concerns they would like to see raised at this meeting.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A002: All Site restoration sub group members to read DS (2010)C054 and provide the Secretary with any issues they would like to see raised at the Scottish Sites meeting.

- DSG(2010)C064: Minutes of a workshop held in Edinburgh and Manchester which was a pre-consultation on HSE's bulk quantities consultation. It was noted that DSG had been invited to attend but the invitation had come in at very short notice and the workshop was being held the day after the DSG which made it impossible to travel in time for the workshop. Therefore no-one from DSG attended.

The draft minutes were received and it is worthwhile noting that Dounreay was mentioned. Comment had been made from those attending about the licensing of the low level waste site at Dounreay. The secretary had responded to the facilitator or the work to highlight the fact that DSG were monitoring the situation with the low level waste facility and that there is an action on Elizabeth Gray to keep DSG updated. She has received an acknowledgement of her email from the facilitator and the corrected workshop notes are expected shortly. The next stage will be a consultation on this issue and it will be placed on the agenda for discussion when available to allow DSG to submit a response.

9. TOPICS FOR NOTIN

Bob Earnshaw noted the following correspondence for noting:

- DSG(2010)C061 (KIMO), DSG(2010)C062 (Highland Council) and DSG(2010)C069 (Shetland Island Council) were copies of responses from the respective organisations to the Scottish Government's consultation on higher activity wastes.
- As noted previously NDA had published a booklet and DVD on geological disposal: steps towards implementation. It was noted that while geological disposal is not a policy adopted by Scottish Government the information from NDA was available and if any members were interested they could obtain copies of these from the Secretary.
- The NDA has published a notice on its website regarding the NDA's undertaking to an initial feasibility study on spent nuclear fuel management. Stuart Chalmers

responded that this was primarily for new build and should not impact on the Dounreay site.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Bob Earnshaw asked if there was any other business.

- The Secretary noted that she had received a telephone call from the Secretary of SCCORS (Scottish Councils Committee on Radioactive Substances). They would like to visit the site and have a discussion with DSG to understand the issues and challenges for the site and the community. The secretary had suggested that the September DSG would be a busy one with the NDA presenting its strategy and had suggested that perhaps it would be easier to meet with one of the sub groups at a convenient date. Following a decision on whether this sub group would continue she would firm up a date for SCCORS to visit.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A003: Secretary to organise a convenient date for members of SCCORS to meet with DS members (and visit site).

- Katrina MacNab said she would like to raise a question on apprentices. The secretary noted that this would be part of the discussion at the socio economic sub group meeting to be held on 21st July. She suggested that Katrina email her with this question and she would ensure it was tabled at the meeting.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A004: Katrina MacNab to email Secretary with question on apprentices to table at Socio Economic sub group meeting on 21st July.

- **Review of this meeting format**

Bob Earnshaw noted that the meeting today had been unusual in that it had combined the site operations and environment sub group. He asked members to consider whether they were happy for this to continue. If it was to continue it would be renamed the Site Restoration sub group meeting and dates for future meetings would be identified by the Secretary and circulated to all sub group members shortly.

He noted there was some positives to having the combined sub group as inevitably the issues quite regularly overlapped and it also gave the secretary time to draft the minutes to allow the DSG business meeting to consider these and agree on the main topics for discussion at the main DSG.

He did recognise that this could cause problems for the Shetland and Orkney representatives in that they would need to travel twice to attend a sub group and the main meeting.

He asked members for their thoughts on this so that agreement could be reached.

It was agreed by those sitting at the table that the combined sub group was beneficial in that site operations and environment issues did inevitably overlap and therefore the complete picture could be discussed at one meeting.

Some members, who attended the Environment sub group, did not then attend the main DSG because they were both held on the same day. They agreed that by holding the sub group in advance of the main DSG would allow them to attend both.

It was felt that, while it was important for Shetland and Orkney to be represented, they could make the decision whether it was more beneficial for them to attend the sub group, the main meeting or both. If they could not justify two journeys on current funding constraints it was suggested that they could either feed their views in before the sub group meeting (papers were circulated in advance to allow them to do this) or attend the sub group and if they wished to see a specific topic placed on the main DSG agenda this could be actioned at the sub group meeting.

After discussion it was agreed that the Site Restoration sub group was beneficial and should continue. It would be held in the evening to accommodate the majority of members who could not attend during the day because of work commitments.

John Deighan noted that this sub group was set up to scrutinise both the NDA and the site and it was important to do that.

The Secretary said she would update the sub group membership/topics to remind members of the topics identified under each sub group.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A005: Secretary to recirculate sub group membership to all members.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A006: Secretary to identify and circulate dates for Site Restoration sub group up to end of March 2011.

It was also noted that the Terms of Reference may need to be revised to take the change in sub groups into account. This would be discussed at the first DSG business meeting.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A007: Secretary to put Terms of Reference on next DS business meeting to identify any changes that need to be incorporated with the change in sub group format.

Bob Earnshaw asked members to consider nominating a chairman for this sub group. Following discussion it was agreed to approach Councillor George Farlow to ask if he would be willing to take on the chairmanship of this sub group.

Action: DS /SRS (2010)M001/A008: Secretary to write to George Farlow asking him to consider taking on the role of chairman of the Site Restoration Sub group.

There being no further business Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for attending and closed the meeting.

Bob Earnshaw
DSG Chairman
20th July 2010

APPENDIX 1 - ACTIONS

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A001: All members to read DSG(2010)P019, NII report and raise any issues or questions with the Secretary.

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A002: All Site restoration sub group members to read DSG(2010)C054 and provide the Secretary with any issues they would like to see raised at the Scottish Sites meeting.

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A003: Secretary to organise a convenient date for members of SCCORS to meet with DSG members (and visit site).

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A004: Katrina MacNab to email Secretary with question on apprentices to table at Socio Economic sub group meeting on 21st July.

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A005: Secretary to recirculate sub group membership to all members.

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A006: Secretary to identify and circulate dates for Site Restoration sub group up to end of March 2011.

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A007: Secretary to put Terms of Reference on next DSG business meeting to identify any changes that need to be incorporated with the change in sub group format.

DSG/SRSG(2010)M001/A008: Secretary to write to George Farlow asking him to consider taking on the role of chairman of the Site Restoration Sub Group.

ACTIONS ON GOING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

M002/A004: Alan Scullion to consider how best to present sampling results and discuss with Deirdre Henderson to ensure that the information is what is required. *Action ongoing.*

M002/A006: All members to provide comments/views on Correspondence 47 NDA waste inventory. This was discussed later in the agenda.

M001/A001: Elizabeth Gray to update DSG on low level waste issues relating to policy and including licensing issues. *This is still ongoing.*

M004/A009: Secretary to invite COMARE to present their findings once the extended study on cancer excesses in the vicinity of Seascale and Dounreay is complete. *This action continues – secretary as emailed twice with no response. A formal letter will now be sent.*

ACTIONS COMPLETED SINCE LAST MEETING

M001/A007: Shetland Island Council to circulate its response to Scottish Government's higher activity waste consultation. *Action complete – DSG(2010)C069.*

M002/A003: Roger Wilson to provide timetable for consultation on DSRL's site discharge authorisation. *Action complete* - Roger Wilson noted that the first phase of consultation had gone out to statutory consultees (Scottish Government, NII, Food Standards Agency, etc). At present it was with these bodies for their feedback. It was expected that public consultation would be carried out by the end of the calendar year.