

DSG(2010)M003

DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 15th September 2010 at 1900 hours in the Pentland Hotel, Thurso.

Present:	Bob Earnshaw Cllr David Flear Alastair MacDonald Donald Mackay Murray Lamont Deirdre Henderson Roy Kirk John Deighan Derrick Milnes Pat Gallagher Cllr Steven Heddle Koreen MacDougall Trudy Morris Alan Scott	Thurso Community Council (Chair) Highland Council (Vice-chair) Honorary member Association of Community Councils North Highland Tourism Buldoo Residents Group HIE Dounreay Unions Thurso & Wick Trade Union Council Rolls-Royce, Vulcan Orkney Islands Council Caithness Partnership Caithness Chamber of Commerce Caithness Contractors Consortium
In addition:	June Love Cdr Michael Moreland Simon Middlemas Stuart Chalmers Adrian Simper Richard Arnott Bill Hamilton Andrew Edwards Linda Buchan Peter Dickenson Stuart Currie Vic Hawthorne	DSRL, DSG Secretariat MOD, Vulcan Managing Director, DSRL NDA NDA NDA NDA NDA SEPA NII DNSR, Vulcan Highland Council, Planning

MINUTES

1. CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS

Bob Earnshaw welcomed everyone to the meeting, introducing Adrian Simper, Richard Arnott, Bill Hamilton and Andrew Edwards, NDA who were attending the meeting to provide updates on the site competition and NDA's strategy.

He congratulated Simon Middlemas, on behalf of DSG members, who will take up a new position within Babcock International Group, and thanked him for his input over the years. He noted that Simon would continue to have a role in DSRL.

Bob Churchill, NDA socio economic manager had recently left the NDA and recorded DSG's thanks for Bob's input over the last few years.

In addition, Randall Bargelt, NDA Programme Director, would also be leaving at the end of October. Bob noted that Randall had been a great ambassador for the NDA and his commitment to Caithness had been obvious in all that he had done.

Members unanimously agreed that thanks should be extended to Randall for his open and honest approach and for his commitment to our community.

Bob Earnshaw noted that since the last meeting in June there has been a lot of activity. Of note:

- Five DSG members visited site on 17th June for a familiarisation tour.
- The Site Stakeholder Group chair's forum visited on 29th June. This visit had been to allow the chair's to understand the decommissioning challenges and progress at the site. The visit was extremely well received and thanks were due to Randall and Simon for hosting this visit.
- Members of the DSG socio economic sub group met with John Thurso on 18th June. This meeting had been useful with John Thurso providing an update to the group on issues he was currently pursuing on behalf of Caithness.
- Bob Earnshaw and Derrick Milnes met with David Brookfield to discuss the Viewfirth redevelopment project on 30th June. This resulted in a full discussion at the socio economic sub group meeting held in July. This would be discussed later in the agenda.
- DSG members have been meeting regularly with the bidders for the Dounreay site. Discussions with Caithness Solutions had taken place on 5th and 6th of July as well as the official launch of Caithness Solutions Ltd at a reception in Caithness Horizons on 30th July. Further discussions took place on 17th August and again on 1st September.
- Both bidders also attended the Halkirk Games on 31st July.
- Members of DSG socio economic sub group met with Graeme Rankin on 14th July on issues relating to the site competition.
- Members of DSG attended the Health Service consultation held in Caithness Horizons on 15th July.
- DSG representatives attended the public meeting on the Ferries Review on 19th August. A draft response to this consultation has been written and is currently being finalised.
- David Flear and Bob Earnshaw met with Randall Bargelt on 1st September.
- Adverts for Board Directors for the Caithness and North Sutherland Fund were published and a total of 18 applications were received. It was pleasing to note the quality of all the applications. Interviews have now taken place with 5 candidates with a further two rescheduled to 24th September. DSG, along with NDA and DSRL, would hope to be in a position to appoint Board members by the end of September.
- The competition for the site it has been a busy period and is likely to continue at this pace for sometime to come. Bob thanked DSG members who have been actively involved in meetings and input into correspondence outwith normal DSG meetings.

2. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from:

- Ronnie Johnstone, Church of Scotland
- David Mudie, HC Planning (Vic Hawthorne deputising)
- Gordon Jenkins, North Highland College
- Pauline Crow, Health Service
- Anne Chard, Caithness West Community Council (Derrick Milnes deputising)
- Ian Bramwell, NII, Vulcan
- Gordon Mackenzie, Scrabster Harbour Trust
- Rick Nickerson, Shetland Islands Council
- Roger Wilson, SEPA (Linda Buchan deputising)
- Katrina MacNab, Highland Council
- John Green, Caithness Voluntary Group
- Eann Sinclair, Caithness & North Sutherland Regeneration Partnership
- Hamish Pottinger, Caithness Against Nuclear Dumping
- George Farlow, Highland Council

3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

DSG(2010)M002 refers. The minutes were accepted as a true record. This was proposed by Derrick Milnes and seconded by John Deighan.

4. PROGRESS ON ACTIONS

See appendix 1 for progress on actions.

5. BUSINESS MEETING UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw provided an update. The Business meeting had met on 30th August. The Admin and Procedures sub group meeting had now been replaced with the Business meeting and was now attended by the chairman, vice-chairman and the two sub group chairmen.

The draft minutes of the meeting had been circulated to all members – DSG/BM(2010)M001 refers. Of note:

- Attendance at various events/meetings were discussed including:
 - SNP political conference
 - Labour party political conference
 - Scottish Governments post consultation on higher activity wastes
 - Transport Scotland 2010 Conference
 - NDA National Stakeholder Group
- DSRL's monthly performance report was discussed and it was agreed that DSG should request a more in-depth written report in time for each site restoration sub group meeting which would cover all the topics in line with the sub group's remit. This was agreed by DSG members.
- Insurance arrangements for members was discussed and it was agreed to investigate this further to ensure that members were completely covered. The secretary would take this forward on DSG's behalf.
- Anna MacConnell, NDA had organised a learning journey to Cumbria which included two DSG representatives. Those attending found the visit very useful and a number of follow up actions have been identified in relation to the

Caithness & North Sutherland Regeneration Partnership. DSG had submitted an initial response to the CNSRP Advisory Board with recommendations for actions that could be implemented in the short and longer term. Thanks were recorded to Anna for organising the visit.

John Deighan noted that it would be important to ensure that deputies were identified for the sub group chairmen to ensure a full attendance at the business meeting. This was agreed and an action was placed to discuss at the two sub groups.

For completeness all actions raised at business meeting are recorded here:

DSG(2010)M003/A001: June Love to amend Terms of Reference to take account of change in sub groups and send draft version to DSG business group members for agreement to take forward to main DSG meeting.

DSG(2010)M003/A002: June Love to register Derrick Milnes at the SNP conference on 14th-17th October.

DSG(2010)M003/A003: June Love to register David Flear's attendance at Transport Scotland 2010 Conference.

DSG(2010)M003/A004: June Love to circulate note to all DSG members to see if anyone wanted to attend Scottish Government post consultation workshop on higher activity wastes.

DSG(2010)M003/A005: June Love to request DSRL to produce a more detailed report for the site restoration sub group covering the topics assigned.

DSG(2010)M003/A006: June Love to draft briefing note on Viewfirth redevelopment project, and following approval, circulate to all DSG members for discussion at the DSG on 15th September.

DSG(2010)M003/A007: June Love to investigate insurance arrangements for members when on DSG business.

DSG(2010)M003/A008: June Love to send a letter of invitation to Sir Anthony Cleaver to attend DSG meeting to update on CNSRP Executive Board.

DSG(2010)M003/A009: June Love to draft note for DSG representative to take to CNSRP Advisory Board taking on board discussions relating to the organisation and representation of the CNSRP bodies.

DSG(2010)M003/A010: June Love to include deputy sub group chairmen on both site restoration and socio economic sub group meetings.

6. SITE RESTORATION SUB GROUP UPDATE

It was noted that this meeting had been a trial meeting to combine the site operations and environmental sub groups. Those members who had attended agreed that this was an improvement as the subject matter between the two sub groups overlapped. It was agreed that the site restoration sub group would remain.

As there was no chairman for this meeting Bob Earnshaw chaired the sub group. It was agreed, in George Farlow's absence, to invite him to take over the role as sub group chairman. [*Secretary's note: George Farlow subsequently agreed to take on this roll*].

The minutes of the site restoration sub group had been circulated in advance to all DSG members. DSG/SRSG(2010)M001 refers.

Main highlights of the meeting included:

- **Vulcan**

- the main point being that the plant was still shutdown and undergoing maintenance.

Michael Moreland noted that the maintenance of the plant was continuing and it was now likely that the plant would be started up in January 2011.

Stuart Currie, DNSR added that the results of site inspections had been encouraging. Vulcan is a mature, well run site with a strong safety culture.

- **DSRL update**

- DSRL had applied for a landfill permit to designate the current on-site storage area for rubble as a landfill to comply with legislation. The landfill would be for Dounreay non-radioactive waste only.
- The high hazards continue to be destroyed in DFR.
- The investigation into the PFR fire had now been completed and a number of actions for improvement have been identified.
- The site held a safety stand-down on 29th July.
- The new lifetime plan would be available in December. A presentation would be provided at the December meeting.
- Update on the offshore particles clean up programme which was just about to commence when the sub group met.

Simon Middlemas provided a verbal update. Of note:

- Performance and delivery of decommissioning on site is good and he was very pleased with the efforts of the site staff and supply chain.
- High hazards continue to be reduced. Almost half the liquid metal in DFR has now been destroyed.
- The lifetime plan was progressing well. The plan had to be rephased due to the flat funding from the NDA of £150M per year. At present the interim end state has extended to 2039 but is expected to be brought back in to 2032 in December when the planning was complete. Following that the two participants in the site competition would be looking at ways of bringing the date back to around 2025. A presentation on the lifetime plan would be provided in December to DSG and would also be provided to the CNSRP Advisory Board.
- The site was on target to shed 102 posts this year with a total reduction of 182 posts over three years. For this financial year 92 posts have been identified by voluntary retirements and it is expected that the remaining 9 would be through the same route. Therefore there will be no compulsory redundancies this year.

Staff talks had taken place to outline the issues surrounding the post reductions.

- Particle retrieval was continuing. The system was working quite well but the weather conditions had resulted in the barge sheltering in Thurso bay.
- **SEPA update**
 - There was no report from SEPA since Roger Wilson had provided a written report for the June environment sub group meeting. A written report would come forward for the next sub group meeting.

Linda Buchan had no additional issues to raise.

- **NII update**
 - There was no report from NII for this meeting.
 - NII had now completed their investigation in the incident relating to the source and this was now with the procurator fiscal for consideration.

Peter Dickenson noted that NII had held initial discussions with the procurator fiscal on the investigation into the source but the report was still with NII.

Peter also noted that the NII's quarterly report would be available shortly and would be distributed to DSG.

There were no further issues to be raised.

- **NDA update**
 - The NDA has published a report entitled "Geological Disposal: Steps towards implementation" which set out how geological disposal would be taken forward. A DVD had also been produced. Copies were available from the secretary if required.
 - Bruce McKirdy had been appointed as the Managing Director of the RWMD (Radioactive Waste Management Directorate). This would operate in a similar fashion to the SLCs (site licence company).
 - Richard Waite is leaving the NDA. In terms of the overall NDA re-organisation this is still ongoing. The re-organisation will be a topic at the National Stakeholder Group next week.

Stuart Chalmers had no further issues to raise.

Bob Earnshaw noted that correspondence had been received in the last couple of days which had not yet been distributed to members. These were:

- Final report on the HSE's bulk quantities pre-consultation stakeholder workshops. Members were reminded that DSG did not have a representative available to attend but commented on statements that had been made regarding Dounreay by others. DSG's comments were now included in the final document and these would be circulated to members and brought forward for the site restoration sub group meeting in November. This workshop and the notes were the precursor to HSE in finalising its thinking for formal consultation on bulk quantities of waste in the near future.

- DSG members had also received correspondence from Shetlands Island Council who were unable to attend DSG. DSG(2010)C095 refers and relates to the recent transport of enriched uranium to the USA from Wick by air. The Council believed that this option would no longer be used in relation to waste shipments from Dounreay and asked that justification be sought for these shipments. Shetland have grave concerns about shipments of radioactive material by air and would like information on what other shipments of nuclear material are expected to leave Dounreay during decommissioning.

Shetland asked DSG to request a report on this matter from DSRL with information on the type of nuclear material, the quantity and potential number of transports, destination of material and the likely method of transport along with likely timescales.

Simon Middlemas responded that he had responded to Shetland Islands Council and noted that he was well aware of the Council's concerns regarding shipment of material. This particular shipment was an international agreement between Russia, USA and UK and DSRL was instructed to carry this out. The response to Shetland had included information which DSRL could provide because of security implications and he was happy to share this response with DSG members. Simon added there was approximately 100 tonnes of nuclear fuel on the site.

Action: DSG(2010)M003/A011: Simon Middlemas to provide response to Shetland Islands Council to DSG on shipment of radioactive material.

Bob Earnshaw also noted that:

- The Scottish Government had issued an annex to the strategic environment assessment report with regard to higher activity wastes. The annexe covers environmental effects of deep geological disposal. Whilst Scottish Government position remains that it does not consider deep geological disposal to be a reasonable alternative it recognises that others may view this as reasonable. Therefore there would be an opportunity to comment on this issue. The deadline for submission was 21st October and this has been circulated to the site restoration sub group members as any response by DSG will have to be developed outwith DSG meetings.

Bob then invited members to raise any issues.

Deirdre Henderson asked Simon Middlemas how the particle retrieval was progressing. Simon responded that the system had had teething troubles but it was expected that 10 out of the 12.5 hectares would be completed by the end of the season. Deirdre asked whether he thought that this had been the right time of the year to carry out such operations and Simon responded that the weather had been particularly poor and that the barge had had to take shelter on a number of occasions. Simon stated that land and marine were trying to recover the programme, weather permitting.

Deirdre Henderson noted that Simon would be taking over a new role and asked whether this would include looking for more decommissioning work to be taken into the county which may result in more waste being generated. Simon responded that the low level waste facility had been granted planning approval for Dounreay and Vulcan waste only. Linda Buchan, SEPA confirmed that this was the case. He added that if there was decommissioning work identified as alternative employment this would mean that the expertise would need to travel outside the county to

undertake such work.

John Deighan asked how many jobs were tied to decommissioning in the county. Simon Middlemas responded that, as a rule of thumb, for every 1 DSRL job there was 3 associated jobs in the county. Therefore the loss of DSRL jobs would have a big impact.

Steven Heddle raised the issue of the Shetland Islands Council letter regarding shipment of radioactive material. He noted that Shetland had asked for DSG to request a report. Simon Middlemas responded that he would provide DSG with a copy of the response he had sent to Shetland. The Secretary noted that she would put this on the agenda for the next Site Restoration sub group meeting for discussion.

Action: DSG(2010)M003/A012: Secretary to put Shetland Islands Council letter and DSRL's response on next Site Restoration Sub group meeting.

There were no further issues raised in relation to site restoration sub group. For completeness the actions from the sub group meeting are recorded here:

DSG(2010)M003/A013: All members to read DSG(2010)P019, NII report and raise any issues or questions with the Secretary.

DSG(2010)M003/A014: All Site restoration sub group members to read DSG(2010)C054 and provide the Secretary with any issues they would like to see raised at the Scottish Sites meeting.

DSG(2010)M003/A015: Secretary to organise a convenient date for members of SCCORS to meet with DSG members (and visit site).

DSG(2010)M003/A016: Katrina MacNab to email Secretary with question on apprentices to table at Socio Economic sub group meeting on 21st July.

DSG(2010)M003/A017: Secretary to re-circulate sub group membership to all members.

DSG(2010)M003/A018: Secretary to identify and circulate dates for Site Restoration sub group up to end of March 2011.

DSG(2010)M003/A019: Secretary to put Terms of Reference on next DSG business meeting to identify any changes that need to be incorporated with the change in sub group format.

DSG(2010)M003/A020: Secretary to write to George Farlow asking him to consider taking on the role of chairman of the Site Restoration Sub Group.

7. SOCIO ECONOMIC SUB GROUP UPDATE

Derrick Milnes provided an update. The sub group had met on 20th July and the minutes had been circulated to all members. DSG/SESG(2010)M002 refers. Of note:

- A full discussion on the Viewfirth redevelopment project had taken place. This would be discussed fully later in the agenda.

- A number of community fund requests were approved. DSG(2010)C066 refers.
- Eann Sinclair had provided a written update on the CNSRP progress which included updates on Scrabster, the ESF funding application for workforce transition (which DSG has provided a letter of support for), Digital connectivity, the potential for a pilot project for next generation access to super fast broadband, and the CNSRP workshop held on 2nd July which focussed on identifying the main activities for the next 3-5 years. DSG(2010)P018 refers.
- Updates were also provided from DSRL, NDA and the Chamber of Commerce.
- Babcock International had been represented by Philip Behan. Philip is working for the current parent body organisation and concentrates on stakeholder and socio economic activities. Philip had spent the last couple of months speaking to a number of people and organisations to consider how best Babcock can assist. He was speaking with various bodies on a number of issues and is currently working out how Babcock's can support some of the work already underway.
- John Thurso had raised the issue of attracting IFMIF to Caithness at Prime Minister's question time. The DSG socio economic sub group had previously written expressing an interest in hosting this facility in Caithness. DSG were currently awaiting a response from a letter sent to the UK Government Science Department.
- Caithness Partnership had provided details on the North Ferries consultation document. DSG would submit a response to this consultation and this had been drafted. The public meeting held in August was attended by members of DSG and as a result the 2nd draft has been issued to members for agreement before submission.
- DSG had written to Chris Huhne and Vince Cable to invite them to visit Dounreay and re-iterated how important it was for predictability of funding for the Dounreay site back-dropped against the good progress being made and the impact to the community if funding is reduced. A response has been received saying that he would be visiting Caithness at some point but could not identify a date as yet.
- The CNSRP Advisory Board met on Monday 13th September. DSG representative, Ronnie Johnstone, had not been available to attend and therefore the DSG secretary had been asked to attend on behalf of DSG. A brief note for the record was produced for members – DSG(2010)C096 refers.

Derrick Milnes invited members to provide a verbal update.

- **Highlands and Islands Enterprise** (Roy Kirk)
 - At the CNSRP Advisory Board held on 13th September the priorities being focussed on were a range of energy services (including renewables, oil and gas and biomass) and business services. Some of the account managed companies were beginning to diversify into different energy sectors.
 - HIE's focus would be on employment for young people and the potential for people to relocate to Caithness. The business services being identified would be for high value work including homeworking, contact centres, etc John Thurso, MP had indicated some opportunities in the public sector and these

would be pursued.

- At the CNSRP Advisory Board a question on the Pensions office and its business development had been raised. Roy Kirk indicated that he would be pleased to work with the Pensions office to see how they could assist in developing this business.
- HIE had awarded a contract to Caithness Chamber of Commerce and a start up meeting would take place this month to put this into action.
- It had been identified that the range of jobs required to offset the decommissioning rundown would be between 1,000 to 2,000 jobs over the next 10 years. CNSRP believed this was achievable, although there would be considerable challenges.
- Early indications are that about 120 jobs were being created each year. Over the last three years there had been 360 jobs through activities with a wide range of partners. CNSRP were continuing to move forward with a more focussed direction which is starting to show some success.

Cllr David Flear noted that he and Derrick Milnes had met with Roy Kirk to discuss the spend against the additional £12M. He noted that it was believed that the £7M remaining should be used for infrastructure projects. These meetings would continue on a 2-monthly basis and David felt that once the £12M of additional funding was committed DSG should support the identification of further funding coming forward.

- **Caithness Chamber of Commerce**

- Trudy Morris reported that the Caithness Chamber of Commerce had taken over as lead organisation for the ESF bid for the workforce transition programme. The 2nd stage submission had gone to ESF and all other funding commitments is required by 30th November. The NDA's funding application will be ratified at the end of September and they were awaiting confirmation by SDS (Skills Development Scotland) and DSRL. The Chamber was confident that everyone was on board with this project and Trudy noted that this had been a good example of partnership working. If the ESF bid is successful this will be a £2.2M project over three years.
- The Chamber fully supported the IFMIF project and had discussed this with Scottish Government.
- The Chamber's annual dinner will be held on 24th September with Secretary of State for Scotland, Michael Moore being one of the guest speakers.
- The Chamber would be attending Renewable UK event in Glasgow in November to promote the skills and capabilities of the area.
- A number of other projects were currently awaiting confirmation on funding applications which is hoped will be confirmed at the end of September. These would be further examples of partnership working.

- **DSRL**

- Simon Middlemas noted that IFMIF was moving forward quite well and indicated there had been a lot of support for this project. At present, DSRL is pulling together the information required and working together as a team right across the CNSRP. He noted that there was a slim chance of IFMIF coming

to Caithness but indicated that if a few of these types of projects came forward then there was more likelihood of attracting something.

- DSRL is also working on developing a business case for radiopharmaceuticals which is an important service worldwide. The case for this would be taken forward in partnership.
- DSRL were in early discussions with Babcock International Group on utilisation of the site's workforce and apprentices.
- DSRL were working with North Highland College to consider a proposal to collocate the DSRL apprentice training function into the new Engineering Skills Centre. This would assist in the development of the community apprentice scheme which is being developed.
- DSRL were still working on the laboratory spin out project. At present this service would be kept in-house and would try and build a virtual business unit.
- The Training Department spin out was continuing. Discussions had taken place with others to identify potential opportunities.

John Deighan stated that there appeared to be a lot of good news. He noted that Subsea 7 had recently announced substantial contracts and questioned whether it would be possible to cross train the young people with local companies that are already established in the area, Simon Middlemas agreed and noted that the process for upskilling young people had started, via the Windmills programme. DSRL was committed to apprenticeship intakes until 2014 but agreed that there needed to be a partnership approach to take forward initiatives for the future.

- **NDA**

- Stuart Chalmers noted that NDA would announce its decision on funding for workforce transition programme at the end of September. In addition, the funding application for Scrabster Harbour redevelopment was now with Treasury for approval.

- **Caithness Partnership**

- Koreen MacDougall noted that the Caithness Transport Forum had submitted a response to the Northern Isles Ferry consultation. In addition they were working closely with The Highland Council to progress the feasibility study for the Berriedale braes.

Derrick Milnes then invited members of DSG and the public to raise any issues.

- David Alexander asked Roy Kirk if he could expand on the 120 jobs created with a breakdown on the type of sectors and posts. Roy Kirk agreed to provide the information.

Action: DSG(2010)M003/A021: Roy Kirk, HIE to provide a breakdown of the 120 jobs created by sectors/types of jobs.

There were no further issues raised in relation to the socio economic sub group. For completeness the actions from the sub group meeting are recorded here:

DSG(2010)M003/A022: Secretary to circulate Willie Roe's written response to questions raised by David Flear.

DSG(2010)M003/A023: Derrick Milnes to write to NDA with regards the funding for the sale of the Viewfirth land.

DSG(2010)M003/A024: Derrick Milnes to summarise discussion on Viewfirth project and ask for endorsement at the full DSG meeting on the way forward.

DSG(2010)M003/A025: All socio economic sub group members to provide comments on DSG(2010)C067 to Anna MacConnell by close of play 26th July 2010.

DSG(2010)M003/A026: Secretary to finalise letter (DSG(2010)C073) to Graeme Rankin on issues related to socio economics and the closure contract.

DSG(2010)M003/A027: All members to consider the table of spend against NDA socio economic funding and provide the Secretary with any comments or questions

DSG(2010)M003/A028: Anna MacConnell to provide a written update for the national nuclear archives

DSG(2010)M003/A029: Secretary to draft letter to Chris Huhne (copied to Vince Cable) inviting them to Caithness to visit Dounreay and learn about opportunities/challenges in the county.

DSG(2010)M003/A030: Ken Nicol to provide a briefing note on Fusion for SESG members.

DSG(2010)M003/A031: Koreen MacDougall/Trudy Morris/June Love to get together and draft a response to the Northern Isle Ferry Services consultation for approval by DSG.

DSG(2010)M003/A032: Secretary to put Transport for Scotland 2010 event on DSG business meeting for discussion on representation by DSG.

DSG(2010)M003/A033: Secretary to put insurance arrangements for members on the DSG business meeting agenda for discussion.

DSG(2010)M003/A034: Eann Sinclair/Trudy Morris to update Cllr Katrina MacNab on the ESF funding application for workforce transition, including apprentices.

DSG(2010)M003/A035: Secretary to invite Keith Muir, HIE to the next DSG Socio economic sub group meeting to provide an update on the nuclear decommissioning supply chain development project.

DSG(2010)M003/A036: All DSG socio economic sub group members to consider questions that could go forward to the public meeting with the First Minister on 27th July.

8. NDA COMPEITION UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw noted that DSG had been taking an active involvement in the NDA's competition process for the Dounreay site and this had taken up a lot of time at sub

group meetings as well as ad hoc meetings. He thanked everyone who had been involved.

DSG members had asked that socio economics be given prominence in the new contract for the site since Dounreay was not a Sellafield which had a very long lifetime plan. Jobs at Dounreay were going now which was a stark reminder to the community that the closure of the site is drawing nearer.

Last week NDA had provided an update on the socio economic progress – DSG(2010)C094 refers. Bob Earnshaw noted that the update was very positive. DSG members would also receive a copy of the descriptive document when it was provided to the bidders.

He thanked the NDA competition team and the site facing team for taking a positive approach to the issues and concerns highlighted by a number of stakeholders.

Adrian Simper, Director of Strategy, thanked DSG members and the wider stakeholder community for their input into discussions relating to the socio economic aspect of the site competition. The NDA had listened to the issues raised and acknowledged that this had helped shape the NDA's approach. He noted that, unlike Sellafield, the NDA will contractualise socio economics for the Dounreay competition and at present they were considering how best to do this.

Adrian added that the socio economic would be a threshold criteria but noted that this was still subject to final approval. He stated that he hoped that DSG members felt that their issues had been taken on board and indicated that NDA were pleased with the outcome.

Derrick Milnes thanked Adrian Simper for his update and added that he was pleased to hear that the NDA had taken issues raised on board noting that DSG and other stakeholders had fought for this since the industry days.

David Flear added that the site facing team had also had a part to play and Randall Bargelt and Anna MacConnell had been extremely helpful. He was pleased that the difference between Dounreay and Sellafield had been accepted and looked forward to moving forward in a positive manner.

Andrew Edwards, NDA provided an update on the next steps. He noted that the socio economic requirements paper was being finalised and NDA believed that all issues raised had been taken on board. The final paper would be made public very soon.

At present the NDA were considering the evaluation criteria and this would go up through Government for approval. If approval is given it was expected that the ITPD package would be issued to bidders at the end of October. When NDA were in formal dialogue with the bidders they would facilitate some formal discussions with stakeholders and the two bidders to ensure that the bidders understood the community's requirements.

Dialogue process will continue through November to early April 2011. Following that briefings will be organised to inform stakeholders of what is in the package. NDA will then issue final tender in May 2011 and follow up with a briefing. Submissions are then expected to come in during the middle of next year and there will be an internal evaluation process before the new bidder is announced in late 2011.

In early 2012 some more stakeholder briefings with the successful bidder will take place to ensure their bid will be transferred through to the contract.

John Deighan noted that the NDA were in the middle of a comprehensive spending review and while he acknowledged it was a difficult question to answer he wondered how this review will affect the NDA .

Adrian Simper said that the Comprehensive Spending Review would be complete in October. The NDA had a pre-settlement for the Dounreay site, which was less than the NDA would have liked, but the £150M was a good result in uncertain times. He noted that he had met with Treasury officials many times and the NDA have high confidence that the £150M will be part of that settlement.

Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone from the NDA for a very open discussion and stated that he believed that with everyone working together this had achieved a positive result.

9. DISCUSSION ON VIEWFIRTH REDEVELOPMENT PROJECT

Derrick Milnes introduced this item for discussion. He noted that a briefing note had been circulated to all DSG members – DSG(2010)C090 refers.

Derrick asked that DSG members recorded their thanks to David Brookfield for all his work and effort he had personally put into this project.

He noted that a full discussion had taken place at the Socio Economic sub group meeting and it had been recommended by the group that the Viewfirth project be disbanded. This was based primarily on the economic climate and the project had found themselves in a situation where DSG could not see a way forward. A number of aspects had been considered including the lack of a champion to lead this project.

While the Socio economic sub group had not made the decision lightly those who had discussed this project could not see a way through and therefore reluctantly agreed that the project should be disbanded.

Derrick then opened up the discussion to members.

Alan Scott asked how far the project had got. Derrick Milnes responded that the project had got to the concept design stage. David Brookfield and his team had held a number of public meetings and a full meeting in Caithness Horizons had taken place with the concept design available for members of the public to comment on.

Alistair MacDonald stated that one of the things that was disappointing was the lack of input from members of the public.

Deirdre Henderson stated that, if she had been one of the residents living nearby, she would have been relieved that the project was not going ahead since it was a much bigger building than what was there previously.

Derrick Milnes noted that he did not want to go back over the project and its history and unless anyone had any ideas for funding or to volunteer to champion this project the decision for DSG was whether the project should continue or not.

Donald Mackay said it was sad that Thurso did not have a reasonably sized venue for public performances.

David Flear added that the Highland Council capital programme had been published and there would be no money available from there to help fund this particular project. The organisations that previously had used the town hall were all now accommodated at various premises in the town. Even if the Viewfirth project could raise the funding for the capital build it would have been very difficult to sustain in operational years.

Derrick Milnes noted that DSG had written to NDA “without prejudice” to ask if the land was sold whether the money from the sale could go towards one of the community projects already underway. Stuart Chalmers stated that the land was an NDA asset and it would be unlikely that this could happen. .

Adrian Simper added that, while he was not sure he knew all the specifics, the selling of land turns into cash which goes directly back to Government and he thought it would be very unlikely that the funding could be provided to a community project.

Derrick Milnes responded saying that a letter had been written and DSG were currently awaiting a response

DSG members endorsed the paper which disbanded the Viewfirth project.

10. DSRL HERITAGE STRATEGY

Simon Middlemas updated the DSG on the heritage strategy. He reminded members that this had started with whether the Dounreay Fast Reactor (DFR) should remain after the site was decommissioned and this had led the site to look at the wider picture of heritage which had culminated in developing a strategy.

WS Atkins were awarded a contract to assist the site in developing a strategy and this had been a trail-blazing piece of work which had never been done for a nuclear site before. The strategy had also been worked up alongside Historic Scotland and they had provided a foreword for the final strategy document.

Public engagement had taken place over a 12 week period and 38 responses had been received. There had been a 50/50 split on the DFR debate. DSRL had reviewed all the responses and there were many issues considered which affected the outcome, including maintaining the decommissioning programme, funding, security and safety, low visitor numbers, etc. The NDA and DSRL believed that the retention of any buildings on the Dounreay site was not sustainable. A number of activities had been identified to ensure that the heritage of the site was retained and James Gunn had been appointed as heritage officer to take forward these initiatives.

A summary document of the strategy was handed out at the meeting and the full strategy document can be found on DSRL’s website or hard copies are available in Dounreay.com (Thurso).

11. NDA STRATEGY PRESENTATION

Bob Earnshaw stated that the NDA had launched its consultation on its strategy on the 1st September and this would also be the subject of discussion at the National Stakeholder Group. He handed over to Adrian Simper who confirmed that the strategy consultation would run from 1st September to 24th November. Adrian then handed over to Richard Arnott to provide a presentation.

The presentation is available on DSG’s website (DSG(2010)C101 refers).

The strategy would be finalised during December to January 2011 then forwarded to ministers for approval in February/March with the aim to publish the final strategy on the 31st March 2011.

The discussion was then opened up for questions.

Roger Stewart (member of the public) noted that he had already written to the NDA regarding the issue of being a facilitator. While he recognised that the NDA have to decommissioning the site safely and cost effectively he felt that they should also have a remit for research especially at a time when the Japanese and French were considering fast reactor technology. Roger added that the site was being stripped apart and no-one is using the information from decommissioning to ensure lessons are learnt for the future. He asked how the information can be made available for future designers.

Adrian Simper responded that the NDA did not have a role to play in future generators and nuclear power and that there was no plans in the UK for a fast reactor programme. The NDA were looking at ensuring that they manage the information they did own and one of the key strategy themes is on knowledge management. He acknowledged that it was hard to accurately predict the research for future programmes when the future was, as yet, unknown.

Roger Stewart responded that Caithness and Dounreay had a proud heritage and those living here should never forget the wonderful work that had been carried out on the site over the 50 years. He added that the national nuclear archives would be an asset and having talked to people in Europe he felt there was some money available to carry out research.

Adrian Simper added that the National Nuclear Centre of excellence had been set up by Government and at present the National Nuclear Laboratory was in discussion to agree their remit.

John Crowden (member of the public) noted that the NDA prioritised the high risks. He asked what happens to the funding of the Dounreay site when the high hazard reduction is completed. Adrian Simper responded that through competition the NDA would be looking at accelerating the reduction of risk and hazards within the £150M cap. John Crowden replied if that was the case would the bidders see less money as time went by. Adrian Simper responded that while this was true there was a counterbalance that the site still had to complete the clean-up strategy. The mission is to do the decommissioning and clean-up. John Crowden asked how the NDA expected the bidders to predict the reduction of funding overtime. Adrian Simper responded that the £150M provided was to take the site to its interim end state and that is the basis on which the bidders are competing. To that extent the NDA had isolated this particular programme and the interim end state was a priority for the NDA.

12. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

Bob Earnshaw noted that he had opened up much of the earlier discussion to members of the public as well as DSG members. He felt that with the topics discussed it was important to ensure that everyone who had attended the meeting had an opportunity to raise issues or questions.

He invited the members of the public to raise any further questions.

Roger Stewart stated that he had worked at Dounreay for 15 years and was fortunate that he had had the experience of also working in Japan and France. He said that PFR (Prototype Fast Reactor) was seen as a major success despite some of its issues. He added that Caithness delivered a success and in all the work that is being undertaken today it is possible to deliver for the future.

John Deighan responded that the people on the site were all good people and agreed that everyone should be proud of what the site has achieved, past and present. However, he pointed out that the Scottish Government has no desire to adopt nuclear.

13. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Bob Earnshaw noted the following dates of forthcoming meetings:

- 3rd November: Socio economic sub group and the Site Restoration sub group
- 12th November: DSG business meeting
- 8th December: full DSG meeting

He then invited members to raise any other issues.

Deirdre Henderson stated that, as a resident of Buldoo, she could assure DSG that the decommissioning on the site is going ahead faster than anyone would think. The Buldoo Residents Liaison group had been set up to liaise with the site on the new low level waste facility and yesterday one of the residents had been shocked to discover that the normal route to access the shore had been blocked off with 'no entry' signs.

Simon Middlemas responded that the signs that had gone up should have been for DSRL personnel and that if these had not been changed already they would have new signs up shortly.

Deirdre Henderson responded that there was a lot of construction going on already with diggers, new roads, etc. This raises problems with Buldoo residents, as it affects their way of life which has always been to access the shore via the route currently blocked off. To be faced with this without provision of a safe path to the shore was unacceptable.

Simon Middlemas replied that this had been the subject of discussions in the last four meetings with Buldoo and options had been provided to ensure access to the shore.

Deirdre Henderson responded that access for her was through the first vault. Simon Middlemas responded that the site had tried to identify an alternative route and that it was impossible to put access in without a construction site to build the paths and roads to the shore to allow access.

Deirdre Henderson added that she felt that the Buldoo liaison group was not working. Simon Middlemas replied that he could not allow access through a construction site as he was responsible not only for the safety of the workforce but for public safety as well. Deirdre responded that their right of way had been stopped and stated that he would be happy to take this discussion outside the DSG to try to find a way forward.

Action: DSG(2010)M003/A037: Simon Middlemas to arrange to speak to Buldoo residents regarding access to the shore.

Bob Earnshaw noted that when the Buldoo liaison group had been set up DSG originally had a representative on the group. However, Buldoo Residents did not want DSG at the

meeting and therefore it was difficult for DSG to understand what Buldoo wanted. He noted that DSRL had offered to meet with Buldoo and felt that the Buldoo residents take up the offer and consider an alternative path to the shore.

There being no further business Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for attending and closed the meeting.

Bob Earnshaw
DSG Chairman

21st September 2010

APPENDIX 1 – PROGRESS ON ACTIONS

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG(2010)M003/A001: June Love to amend Terms of Reference to take account of change in sub groups and send draft version to DSG business group members for agreement to take forward to main DSG meeting.

DSG(2010)M003/A002: June Love to register Derrick Milnes at the SNP conference on 14th-17th October.

DSG(2010)M003/A003: June Love to register David Flear's attendance at Transport Scotland 2010 Conference.

DSG(2010)M003/A004: June Love to circulate note to all DSG members to see if anyone wanted to attend Scottish Government post consultation workshop on higher activity wastes..

DSG(2010)M003/A005: June Love to request DSRL to produce a more detailed report for the site restoration sub group covering the topics assigned.

DSG(2010)M003/A006: June Love to draft briefing note on Viewfirth redevelopment project, and following approval, circulate to all DSG members for discussion at the DSG on 15th September.

DSG(2010)M003/A007: June Love to investigate insurance arrangements for members when on DSG business.

DSG(2010)M003/A008: June Love to sent a letter of invitation to Sir Anthony Cleaver to attend DSG meeting to update on CNSRP Executive Board.

DSG(2010)M003/A009: June Love to draft note for DSG representative to take to CNSRP Advisory Board taking on board discussions relating to the organisation and representation of the CNSRP bodies.

DSG(2010)M003/A010: June Love to include deputy sub group chairmen on both site restoration and socio economic sub group meetings.

DSG(2010)M003/A011: Simon Middlemas to provide response to Shetland Islands Council to DSG on shipment of radioactive material.

DSG(2010)M003/A012: Secretary to put Shetland Islands Council letter and DSRL's response on next Site Restoration Sub group meeting.

DSG(2010)M003/A013: All members to read DSG(2010)P019, NII report and raise any issues or questions with the Secretary.

DSG(2010)M003/A014: All Site restoration sub group members to read DSG(2010)C054 and provide the Secretary with any issues they would like to see raised at the Scottish Sites meeting.

DSG(2010)M003/A015: Secretary to organise a convenient date for members of SCCORS to meet with DSG members (and visit site). *Action ongoing – visit likely to be 3rd November – visit site and attend Site Restoration sub group.*

DSG(2010)M003/A016: Katrina MacNab to email Secretary with question on apprentices to table at Socio Economic sub group meeting on 21st July. *Action complete – this was tabled at socio economic sub group and a response provided.*

DSG(2010)M003/A017: Secretary to re-circulate sub group membership to all members..

DSG(2010)M003/A018: Secretary to identify and circulate dates for Site Restoration sub group up to end of March 2011.

DSG(2010)M003/A019: Secretary to put Terms of Reference on next DSG business meeting to identify any changes that need to be incorporated with the change in sub group format.

DSG(2010)M003/A020: Secretary to write to George Farlow asking him to consider taking on the role of chairman of the Site Restoration Sub Group.

DSG(2010)M003/A021: Roy Kirk, HIE to provide a breakdown of the 120 jobs created by sectors/types of jobs.

DSG(2010)M003/A022: Secretary to circulate Willie Roe's written response to questions raised by David Flear.

DSG(2010)M003/A023: Derrick Milnes to write to NDA with regards the funding for the sale of the Viewfirth land.

DSG(2010)M003/A024: Derrick Milnes to summarise discussion on Viewfirth project and ask for endorsement at the full DSG meeting on the way forward.

DSG(2010)M003/A025: All socio economic sub group members to provide comments on DSG(2010)C067 to Anna MacConnell by close of play 26th July 2010.

DSG(2010)M003/A026: Secretary to finalise letter (DSG(2010)C073) to Graeme Rankin on issues related to socio economics and the closure contract.

DSG(2010)M003/A027: All members to consider the table of spend against NDA socio economic funding and provide the Secretary with any comments or questions

DSG(2010)M003/A028: Anna MacConnell to provide an indicative timescale for the national nuclear archives.

DSG(2010)M003/A029: Secretary to draft letter to Chris Huhne (copied to Vince Cable) inviting them to Caithness to visit Dounreay and learn about opportunities/challenges in the county.

DSG(2010)M003/A030: Ken Nicol to provide a briefing note on Fusion for SESG members..

DSG(2010)M003/A031: Koreen MacDougall/Trudy Morris/June Love to get together and draft a response to the Northern Isle Ferry Services consultation for approval by DSG..

DSG(2010)M003/A032: Secretary to put Transport for Scotland 2010 event on DSG business meeting for discussion on representation by DSG.

DSG(2010)M003/A033: Secretary to put insurance arrangements for members on the DSG business meeting agenda for discussion.

DSG(2010)M003/A034: Eann Sinclair/Trudy Morris to update Cllr Katrina MacNab on the ESF funding application for workforce transition, including apprentices.

DSG(2010)M003/A035: Secretary to invite Keith Muir, HIE to the next DSG Socio economic sub group meeting to provide an update on the nuclear decommissioning supply chain development project,

DSG(2010)M003/A036: All DSG socio economic sub group members to consider questions that could go forward to the public meeting with the First Minister on 27th July.

DSG(2010)M003/A037: Simon Middlemas to arrange to speak to Buldoo residents regarding access to the shore.

ACTIONS ONGOING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

DSG(2009)M003/A003: Secretary to invite National Nuclear Archives Project Manager to the next DSG socio economic sub group meeting for an update.

Ongoing – project manager has November date in diary

DSG(2009)M004/A008: Secretary to invite COMARE to present their findings once the extended study on cancer excesses in the vicinity of Seascale and Dounreay was complete. *Action ongoing: As per recommendation in COMARE's 11th report (2006) for the incidence of childhood cancers around both Sellafield and Dounreay to be kept under surveillance and reviewed periodically.*

The review of childhood leukaemia in the vicinity of Sellafield and Dounreay is listed on the current work programme for the committee. The work programme (which can be found on the COMARE website (http://www.comare.org.uk/comare_work.htm)) is reviewed and updated on a regular basis and is liable to changes in priority through requests for advice by Government departments. Arrangements for the Sellafield and Dounreay childhood leukaemia review are still in the early stages and I am afraid at this point it is not possible to give a timescale on the work. We will update the information on this item on the COMARE website as work progresses. We have noted your interest in this work and will be happy to advise you once definite timescales have been established.

.DSG(2010)M001/A001: Elizabeth Gray to update DSG on low level waste issues relating to policy (and including licensing issues) at the appropriate time. *Awaiting update.*

DSG(2010)M002/A004: Alan Scullion to consider how to best to present sampling results and discuss with Deirdre Henderson to ensure the information is what is required.

DSG(2010)M002/A007: Simon Middlemas to provide a presentation on the revised decommissioning programme at December DSG.

DSG(2010)M002/A012: Roy Kirk to develop a model on the economic impact and how this could be monitored to be shared with DSG and CNSRP Advisory Board.

ACTIONS COMPLETED

DSG(2010)M001/A007: : Rick Nickerson to circulate Shetland Islands Council response to Scottish Government's consultation on high activity waste when available. *Action complete – see DSG(2010)C069.*

DSG(2010)M001/A009: George Farlow to circulate Highland Council's response to Scottish Government's consultation on high activity waste when available. *Action complete – HC and KIMO responses have been received (DSG(2010)C062 and C061).*

DSG(2010)M002/A001: Secretary to organise a trial meeting of the combined site operations and environment sub groups and to take on board the identification of deputies for the DSG business meeting. *Action complete – trial meeting was held on 20th July 2010.*

DSG(2010)M002/A003: Roger Wilson to provide timetable for consultation on DSRL's site discharge authorisation. *Action complete - Roger Wilson noted that the first phase of consultation had gone out to statutory consultees (Scottish Government, NII, Food Standards Agency, etc). At present it was with these bodies for their feedback. It was expected that public consultation would be carried out by the end of the calendar year.*

DSG(2010)M002/A005: All members to provide any questions or issues to be raised at PRAG(D) to June as soon as possible (meeting to be held on 23rd June). *Action complete – meeting has taken place – no issues were raised.*

DSG(2010)M002/A006: All members to provide comment/views on DSG(2010)C047 (waste inventory) to secretary for collation. Views to be submitted to NDA by 31st July 2010 – *Action complete.*

DSG(2010)M002/A009: David Flear to speak to Alistair Dodds on progress of discussions with NDA on socio economic criteria for the Dounreay site closure contract. *Action complete – this had been done and reported in DSG/SESG(2010)M003.*

DSG(2010)M002/A011: David Flear to discuss the spend against the £12M additional funding with Roy Kirk. *Action complete – meeting held on 3rd September 2010.*

DSG(2010)M002/A023: DSG to write to Graham Rankin regarding the weighting of the socio economic criteria within the Dounreay site closure contract. *Action complete – see DSG(2010)C073*