

DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9th March 2011 in the Pentland Hotel, Thurso.

Present: Bob Earnshaw DSG Chairman (Thurso Community Council)
 Alastair MacDonald DSG Honorary member
 Anne Chard Caithness West Community Council
 Chris Jones SGRIPD
 Trudy Morris Caithness Chamber of Commerce
 Alan Scott Caithness Contractors Consortium
 Gordon Jenkins North Highland College
 Pauline Crow Highland Health Board
 Ronnie Johnstone Church of Scotland
 John Deighan Dounreay Unions
 Derrick Milnes Thurso & Wick Trade Union Council
 Eann Sinclair CNSRP Programme Manager
 Roy Kirk Highlands and Islands Enterprise
 Deirdre Henderson Buldoo Residents Group

 Tony Wratten Deputy MD, DSRL
 Stuart Chalmers NDA
 David Mudie Highland Council, Planning
 Peter Dickenson NII (DSRL)
 Roger Wilson SEPA (DSRL and Vulcan)
 Michael Moreland MOD, Vulcan
 Ian Bramwell NII (Vulcan)
 Stuart Currie DNSR (Vulcan)

In addition: Nicola Dreaves Caithness Chamber of Commerce
 Kenneth Naismith Church of Scotland
 Stephen Saunders NII inspector for Vulcan
 June Love DSG Secretariat, DSRL

MINUTES

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for attending the meeting. He stated that the AGM had been held earlier in the evening and that he and David Flear had been re-elected as chair and vice-chair respectively.

Bob also welcomed Kevin Naismith, who is currently working with Ronnie Johnstone and was attending DSG to get a flavour of community interests and issues. Also in attendance was Nicola Dreaves, recently appointed Business Development Manager, Caithness Chamber of Commerce.

Bob also noted that DSG had received Hamish Pottinger's resignation from DSG as CAND representative. Hamish had written to DSG intimating that since the decommissioning of Dounreay was progressing well CAND felt that they could no longer add meaningful input to the meeting. CAND would continue in existence and keep a watching brief on future developments.

In addition, there was a vacancy for a Highland Council representative with the recent resignation of Katrina MacNab.

Continuing on membership issues, an invitation had been sent to the Vulcan Trade Unions to rejoin the DSG. A response was currently awaited.

It was noted that at the Annual General Meeting a query had been raised about membership and non-attendance. This would be discussed at the next DSG business meeting to identify new organisations for potential membership.

For completeness the actions raised at the AGM are recorded here:

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A001: Secretary to write to Hamish Pottinger thanking him for his involvement with DSG over the years. [Secretary's note – a letter would also go to Katrina MacNab].

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A002: Secretary to put attendance report on next DSG business meeting

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A003: Secretary to amend Terms of Reference as per circulated document.

Bob Earnshaw also stated that Elizabeth Gray, Scottish Government Radioactive Waste Team had sent the DSG a letter which read as follows:

"As many of you know I will be leaving the Scottish Government shortly and I want to record my personal thanks to all presently and previously on the Site Stakeholder Group (and previously on the liaison committee) for their help and support over the nearly 10 years I have led the Radioactive Waste Team in the Scottish Government.

We have been through some very interesting times together but I think that throughout the years we have been able to work very constructively and learnt to appreciate and understand our different roles and responsibilities.

I am sure you will offer that same constructive approach to Stuart Hudson who is taking over leadership of the Team on my departure and to other members of the Team who you will be working with in the future.

I wish everyone all the best for the future both personally and as members of the Site Stakeholder Group. Regards Elizabeth"

On behalf of the DSG, Bob asked the secretary to record DSG's thanks to Elizabeth Gray for her dedication and commitment over the years she had been involved with Scottish Government and more importantly with the Site Stakeholder Groups.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A004: Secretary to send card to Elizabeth Gray wishing her well for the future.

2. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from:

- Simon Middlemas - Tony Wratten deputising.
- Rick Nickerson, Shetland Islands Council
- David Flear, Highland Council
- John Hook, Rolls Royce
- Koreen MacDougall, Caithness Partnership
- John Green, Caithness Voluntary Group
- Stephen Heddle, Orkney Islands Council
- George Farlow, Highland Council
- Sandy Mackie, Scrabster Harbour Trust

3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

The minutes of the last meeting had been circulated to members in advance of the meeting – DSG(2011)M004 refers. Bob Earnshaw asked if there were any amendments to the minutes. As there were no amendments the minutes were taken as a true reflection of the meeting were proposed by Derrick Milnes and seconded by Alastair MacDonald.

Members were then invited to raise any issues arising from the minutes.

Ronnie Johnstone stated that the minutes made mention of the Pensions Administration Office review. He had heard that the Pensions office would be relocating to Forss which was contrary to initiatives to develop the town centre. As there was no-one from Babcock International Group to respond it was agreed that the secretary should write to Babcock to ask for an update on the Pensions review and the proposed relocation to Forss.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A005: Secretary to write to Babcock International to ask for an update on the Pensions Review and the proposed relocation to Forss.

4. PROGRESS ON ACTIONS

Progress of the actions had been circulated to members in advance. See appendix 1 for an update on actions.

Of note:

- DSG(2010)M001/A001: Elizabeth Gray to update DSG on low level waste issues relating to policy (and including licensing issues) at the appropriate time. *Awaiting update.*

The Secretary noted that she had received an update from the Scottish Government.

Peter Dickenson, NII noted that the HSE was working with Scottish Government on these issues. He stated that while bulk quantity waste was a long standing issue and defined in UK law no-one had defined what 'bulk quantity' meant. Confirmation is being sought from Brussels and will take time to clarify.

The update from Scottish Government was as follows:

Low Level Waste Issues

There are two separate lines on this subject.

- Bulk Quantities for storage
- Paris and Brussels Convention (liability insurance)

The Bulk Quantities for storage is being taken forward by the Health and Safety Executive (HSE) and a consultation exercise will get underway shortly. This is a follow up to the pre consultation workshops and meetings which took place in 2010 and which assisted in shaping the consultation.

The consultation paper on the implementation of amendments to the Paris and Brussels Convention on nuclear third party liability has been published and the consultation period finishes on 28 April 2011. There is a dedicated web page on the DECC website. The papers include the consultation paper, draft Order and impact assessment. The link is as follows: www.decc.gov.uk/en/content/cms/consultations/paris_brussels/paris_brussels.aspx

The revised Paris and Brussels Convention now brings nuclear waste disposal facilities within the definition of a “nuclear installation” and therefore within the liability regime.

The UK Government proposes to bring such facilities within the 1965 Act liability regime but considers that the liability regime should only apply to nuclear waste disposal facilities which present the level of hazard which the Paris and Brussels Convention was designed to cover. Government therefore proposes to amend the 1965 Act to apply all of the aspects of the liability regime in the revised Convention (and the Brussels Convention) to disposal sites but without extending the scope of the existing nuclear licensing regime to cover them.

- DSG(2011)M004/A016: Roger Wilson, SEPA to provide information on comparisons of levels of Caesium in Caithness & North Sutherland against other areas.

Roger Wilson noted that this action was ongoing. He stated the Dr Paul Dale would attend the next site restoration sub group meeting (20th April) to go through in detail the comparisons of levels of caesium.

5. BUSINESS MEETING UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw provided an update. The business meeting met on the 11th February – DSG/BM(2011)M003 refers. Of note:

- A review of the paperwork for the AGM took place.
- The NDA were continuing to consider their engagement process and recently distributed a questionnaire on topics of interest to stakeholders. The business meeting had considered this and a response had been submitted. (DSG(2011)C152 refers).

- Agreement that Anne Chard would attend the Forum on Stakeholder Confidence in Sweden at the beginning of May. Anne had produced a proposed work package to follow up while attending the workshop. The proposal would be circulated to members for comments.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A006: Secretary to circulate work package for attendance at the Forum of Stakeholder Confidence in Sweden for comment.

- DSG had received an invitation to attend the National Skills Academy, Nuclear annual awards dinner in Manchester. Since there was no other meetings in Manchester on that date it was agreed that the invitation be declined.
- The secretary had received correspondence on a European study into stakeholder research which would commence in April 2011. This study would include 2 project workshops for site stakeholder groups to be involved in. A response has been submitted indicating that DSG would be interested in taking part and offering to host one of the workshops in Caithness. Information on this research would be circulated to members as soon as it is available.

For completeness the actions arising from the business meeting are recorded here:

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A007: Secretary to update financial report at end of February for distribution to members for AGM on 9th March 2011. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C147.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A008: Bob Earnshaw to comment on draft chairman's report for AGM. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C151.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A009: June Love to update DSG agenda for March and distribute to members. *Action complete.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A010: Secretary to complete NDA questionnaire on stakeholder preferences and also respond to the NDA draft national engagement plan. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C152.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A011: : Secretary to speak to Anne Chard to check availability for attendance at FSC conference in Sweden. *Action complete.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A012: Secretary to write to National Skills Academy, Nuclear declining invitation to the awards dinner. *Action complete – emailed confirming no DSG attendance.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A013: Secretary to write to Vulcan Trade Unions to invite them to become a member of the DSG. *Action complete – an invitation has been sent to the Vulcan unions inviting them to become a member of DSG and to indicate their representative and deputy arrangements.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A014: Secretary to write to Anne Bergmans indicating DSG's interest in being involved and also offering to host one of the project workshops in Caithness. *Action complete – emailed Anne Bergmans on 14th February confirming DSG's interest and offer to host a project workshop in*

Caithness. Response received saying that they would keep invitation on file to consider when project is developed in full.

6. VULCAN UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw noted that at the last Site Restoration Sub group meeting a number of papers relating to the Vulcan site had been tabled for discussion. At that meeting it was hoped that Vulcan would be up and running in March. He invited Commander Michael Moreland to provide a verbal update.

Michael Moreland stated that Vulcan was now operational and that critical operations would resume in the near future.

Ian Bramwell, NII noted:

- The quarterly report had been sent to the DSG secretary (Secretary's note – this had been circulated to the DSG Site Restoration sub group members and tabled at last meeting).
- An inspection due to take place in December had been cancelled due to the inclement weather. The current visit includes a follow up inspection to that undertaken last year on the Ionising Radiations Regulations.
- Ian Bramwell would be moving on to become site inspector for Devonport and his replacement would be Stephen Saunders. *(NB: Stephen attended meeting as a handover from Ian Bramwell).*
- UK Government is currently considering the future of the UK nuclear regulatory body. It was announced to Parliament in February that the Government intends to create a new Office for Nuclear Regulation which brings a number of departments together including Nuclear Directorate, Transport, Security and Safeguards into one department. There would be no effect on the legislation but does mean some internal re-organisation for HSE on the 1st April 2011. In the future a statutory corporation would be created once the legislation had been passed. The key message was that there will be no change to how sites are regulated or the standards expected.

Stuart Currie, DNSR noted:

- DNSR had provided a quarterly report to DSG (Secretary's note – this had been circulated to the DSG Site Restoration sub group members and tabled at the last meeting).
- Inspections had been undertaken in January and March. There had been no findings of any consequence.

No further issues were raised relating to Vulcan.

7. SITE RESTORATION UPDATE

In the absence of George Farlow, Bob Earnshaw provided an update on the site restoration sub group meeting. The sub group met on the 19th January 2011 and the

draft minutes circulated to all members (DSG(2011)M003 refers). Of note:

- Reports were submitted from DSRL and SEPA (Papers 38 and 40 respectively).
- The sub group was pleased to note that DSRL is currently considering the award of credits to tenders for work which bring local economic benefit to the area. DSRL has an action to circulate the criteria when available.
- The site is on track to deliver the reduction of posts identified last year. This has been achieved by retirements, redeployment and natural wastage.
- The site's safety and performance record continues well and both staff and contractors were to be congratulated on this achievement.
- SEPA is continuing to work with DSRL to develop a site wide discharge authorisation. In addition SEPA is working with the Environment Agency to look at conditions and authorisations for low level waste facilities at Dounreay and Drigg to ensure there are not differing approaches to legislation.
- DSRL provided an update on the particles off-shore retrieval project and the findings of the Particles Retrieval Advisory Group.
- NDA indicated that the site had now been provided with guidance to plan for £150M funding per year. In addition, the local NDA team had received additional funding which would only be used for decommissioning activities if the site could justify the additional spending.
- The Department of Energy and Climate Change (DECC) have launched a consultation on low level waste from the non-nuclear industry (DSG(2011)C134 refers). It had been agreed at the sub group that if organisations had an interest they would respond to the consultation individually. DSG would not submit a collective response.
- DECC has also launched a consultation on the management of UK's plutonium stocks. DSG(2011)C154 refers and will be discussed at the next sub group meeting.
- DSG is currently working on a response to the Scottish Government's consultation on Dounreay's Radioactive waste substitution (DSG(2011)C133). This consultation closes on the 11th March and members were reminded to provide the secretary with any issues or comments they wish to make.
- Correspondence had been received from individuals who are opposed to the demolition of the Dounreay Fast Reactor. DSG have responded that they will continue to take an interest in the retention of heritage of the site.
- The Scottish Government have now issued their policy for higher activity waste.
- Alastair MacDonald represented DSG at a DSRL workshop to identify the optimised approach to remediating and restoring the site. This work is being undertaken to

underpin the chosen end state.

- Scottish Government provided a written update to DSG – DSG(2011)C160 refers. This will be brought forward for the next site restoration sub group meeting.

Bob Earnshaw then invited verbal updates from the following:

DSRL

Tony Wratten noted the following:

- Simon Middlemas had been signed off work for a few weeks. It was hoped that he would be returning to work soon.
- There had been no lost time accidents for the last nine months. The site continues to take any injury to personnel seriously and it was a credit to both staff and contractors that the safety record is good.
- Work is ongoing to review safety posts and competencies.
- There has been no issues relating to site discharges which have been well within the limits set by SEPA.
- Lightning strikes in the winter resulted in a number of electronic systems failing. The back-up systems worked which shows that the infrastructure can cope with events such as this.
- The Civil Nuclear Constabulary held an exercise recently to test their preparedness in the event of security issues.
- The DFR dome would not be painted this year thus diverting funding to decommissioning activities.
- The 212th batch of sodium potassium coolant had been destroyed in DFR which equates to two thirds of the material. The site is on track to complete this programme of work next year.
- A contract had been placed with Grahams Construction for phase 1 of the low level waste facility. The work includes construction of the first two vaults as well as the production of safety and environment documentation.
- Sandside beach has been monitored on a regular basis over the last few months. Work will commence in May to resume particle recovery off-shore. Weather permitting this will continue until October.
- Looking forward to next year (financial year 1st April 2011 onwards) the site is gearing up to finish the NaK destruction programme and start extracting the breeder fuel out of the reactor. Cementation of waste will continue as will fuel cycle area decommissioning.

- NDA had now confirmed that the site's level of funding for this coming financial year is £150M.
- Interactions between the two competitors for the site and DSRL staff has continued.

NII

Peter Dickenson noted:

- The next quarterly report from NII is due to be published at the end of April/beginning of May.
- The NII re-organisation was ongoing (see Vulcan report above for detail). Another key area for NII will be transformation with the organisation moving towards a more open approach. A Board will also be formed for the Office of Nuclear Regulation and the Chief Inspector and one of his Deputy Chief Inspectors will be members.
- NII were working with SEPA on issues relating to contaminated land following the demolition of buildings. NII, SEPA and DSRL were working together to ensure practical clean-up procedures are in place.
- NII were working with DSRL and SEPA on radioactive waste issues including the treatment and safe storage of higher activity wastes. The work carried out so far has been outstanding and the site is leading the country in how best to deal with this.
- While NII recognise that the site's conventional safety is excellent, they continue to emphasise nuclear safety aspects of the site.

SEPA

Roger Wilson noted:

- That there was a lot of work in progress but not quite ready to report. It was expected by the April sub group meeting more detail would be provided.

NDA

Stuart Chalmers noted:

- That DSRL had had an excellent year and had delivered all its targets, some of which were very challenging and these had been carried out safely.
- Looking ahead to next year (April 2011) a new set of challenging targets had been identified.
- The strategic position of co-location of nuclear materials was continuing and DSG would be kept updated as the feasibility study progresses.

John Deighan noted that Graham Construction had been awarded a contract for the low level waste facility. He asked how DSG could ensure that young local workers were given an opportunity to be employed (and perhaps complete apprenticeships). He believed this was a once in a lifetime opportunity and DSG should be active in taking this forward.

Bob Earnshaw agreed. Ronnie Johnstone asked how this would be taken forward. Ronnie noted that the West Church had recently completed a £3/4M refurbishment project and had undertaken this extensive work using local labour and supplies.

Tony Wratten stated that DSRL was publicly funded and operated under value for money and European guidelines when awarding contracts. DSRL's Commercial Manager was currently considering how to maximise local gain within the boundaries of European law. It was agreed that the Commercial Manager should be invited to the next sub group meetings to outline his current thinking on the inclusion of local gain within site contracts.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A015: Secretary to invite DSRL's Commercial Manager to socio economic and site restoration sub group meetings on 20th April 2011.

Trudy Morris, Chamber of Commerce responded that she would take up the points raised at this meeting with Graham Construction. However, if conditions to use local labour were not included in the contract then it would be more of an influencing role. Trudy agreed to make contact with Graham Construction to start dialogue with them.

Gordon Jenkins, North Highland College, added that the college was open for business and would be willing to take on additional work if this was identified. He noted that there were two ways that the college could provide support. This includes the provision of courses and responding to employers' needs for apprenticeships. The college has places and Skills Development Scotland has funding which can be provided for modern apprenticeships but can only be done by direct funding to employers.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A016: Trudy Morris to make contact with Graham Construction to discuss the use of local gain within the low level waste contract and report back, via the Site Restoration sub group.

For completeness the actions arising from the site restoration sub group meeting are recorded here:

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A017: Simon Middlemas to circulate socio economic benefits in contracts when complete.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A018: All site restoration sub group members to provide comment on the Scottish Governments consultation on Dounreay's Radioactive waste substitution.

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A019: Secretary to write to authors of the Dounreay heritage (save the sphere) to acknowledge receipt of the report. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)155.*

8. SOCIO ECONOMIC UPDATE

Derrick Milnes, socio economic sub group chairman provided an update. The socio economic sub group met on 19th January and the minutes (DSG/SRSG(2011)M005 refers) were circulated in advance. Of note:

- Congratulations were given to the Chamber of Commerce for securing £2.3M funding for a workforce transition programme as well as funding for the Town Centre Development and Business Development projects. It was pleasing to see the Chamber going from strength to strength and was important that the business focus remains strong as the regeneration partnership moves forward with its programme of activities.
- There had been recent correspondence in relation to the national nuclear archives. DSG had written to the NDA on 11th February asking for clarification and a timescale for this project. A response had been received (DSG(2011)C159 refers) and this would be considered at the next socio economic sub group meeting.
- DSG members discussed in detail DSRL's socio economic development plan and will be provided with the final version following approval from the NDA.
- DSG also wrote to Scottish Government regarding Scrabster and a response had been received. It was hoped that the final funding would be in place soon to allow Scrabster to move forward with its development.
- DSG responded to the scoping request on the proposed Tidal Site, Ness of Duncansby (DSG(2011)C157 refers).
- DSG representative, in conjunction with the Thurso and Wick Trade Union Council, attended the Lib Dem party conference in Perth on 4th and 5th March. A number of contacts were made and follow up invitations to visit Caithness following the election will be progressed. Representatives would also be attending the Conservative party conference in Perth on the 18th/19th March.

Derrick Milnes then invited updates from the following:

CNSRP

Eann Sinclair noted the following:

- Following on from the CNSRP progress report submitted to the socio economic sub group meeting on the 19th January a number of projects had moved on significantly.
 - the regeneration partnership executive board met with Jim Mather, Energy, Economy and Tourism minister on the 1st February where Mr Mather endorsed the CNSRP action plan and the 10 year vision document.
 - On a more local level the CNSRP have been discussing how to set the environment to maximise funding from the partners in taking forward initiatives for energy and business sectors.
 - John Thurso, MP had raised questions in Parliament regarding energy zones and encouraging Government to identify as Caithness as the first energy zone area. As a follow up the CNSRP will register its interest in setting up an energy park.
 - A number of stakeholders had met with the two bidders for the Dounreay site. This was a separate meeting from the Dounreay Unions which also took place.

Meetings with both bidders had been positive and had indicated areas where stakeholders should focus on in the coming weeks.

- A socio economic impact study had now been commissioned with an inception meeting taking place at the end of the week. The study should be complete by the end of May and will provide an update from the study undertaken in 2006.
- HIE had recently announced funding of £1.8M in grant assistance to the redevelopment of the John O’Groats redevelopment.
- HIE had also come to the end of its research phase for inward investment in both the energy and business sectors. A number of leads had been identified and these would be followed up as inward investment opportunities.

DSRL

There was no additional update.

NDA

Stuart Chalmers noted:

- That a lot of hard work had been carried out by a number of people to secure funding for various projects and they should be congratulated.
- NDA had provided funding to various projects including the Engineering Skills Centre, the Chamber’s transition training project and Scrabster Harbour redevelopment and had taken a lot of hard work to get to this position.

Caithness Chamber of Commerce

The Chamber believed that 2011 would be a milestone year for the area in terms of other projects going forward and those involved should take pride in what they have managed to achieve so far.

HIE

Roy Kirk noted:

- HIE echoed the support for partnership working and key to this would be working in a unified way.
- The investment in John O'Groats was a very positive step forward allied by the work done on skills.
- HIE were working, in partnership with the NDA, on a project which would be communicated at the appropriate time.
- While lots had been done during 2010/11 the partnership could not afford to get complacent and would continue to work hard to realise the potential for the people living in the county.

For completeness the actions arising from the Socio economic sub group meeting are recorded here:

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A020: June Love to speak to Eann Sinclair to see if details information on job numbers can be provided on a regular basis to the CNSRP Advisory Board. *Action complete – information will be provided at CNSRP Advisory Board on regular basis.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A021: Secretary to write to Stuart Chalmers, copied to CEO, asking for assurance that, once NDA can identify funding, the project will remain as the National Nuclear Archives. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C146.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A022: Ken Nicol to provide members with a copy of the DSRL Socio Economic Development plan was approved by NDA (after March 2011).

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A023: June Love to speak to Scrabster Harbour Trust with regards Scottish Government's response to DSG's letter. *Action complete – no further follow up action to take.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A024: June Love to finalise response to NDA's business plan consultation and submit by the 26th January 2011. *Action complete – DSG(2011)C132.*

Action: DSG(2011)M005/A025: Secretary to clarify who the PBO representative for DSG sub group should be following Philip Behan's involvement in the competition process. *Action complete – PBO and DSRL looking at new integrated way of working (along with NDA) on socio economics. Ken Nicol will represent PBO/DSRL at sub group.*

9. NDA SITE COMPETITION UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw provided an update. On the 10th February DSG members received an update from Graeme Rankin, NDA Competition Programme Manager on the current situation of the competition. A note for the record was written following the meeting (DSG(2011)C156 refers).

In addition, NDA facilitated discussions with a number of stakeholders and a separate meeting with the Dounreay Unions took place on the 24th February.

The next steps for the competition programme include:

- A major project review group meeting was held on 9th March.
- The competition programme board meeting meets on the 15th March.
- Preparation of documents for the Governance board will continue through April and May.
- The Invitation to Tender will be issued on 27th May.
- Tenders to be submitted by August.
- Tenders will be evaluated between August and November.
- The preferred bidder will be announced in November with the new Parent Body Organisation taking over at the beginning of April 2012.

Bob Earnshaw invited Stuart Chalmers to provide any further details. Stuart Chalmers responded that he was not directly involved in the site competition and therefore he had nothing further to add.

Bob Earnshaw noted that he had been present at the NDA facilitated dialogue meetings and he personally felt that the meetings had been positive. Eann Sinclair, who also attended the discussions, agreed and re-iterated that those who attended these meetings understood the issues that they would need to focus on in the coming weeks.

10. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

Bob Earnshaw invited members of the public to raise any issues or questions.

John Crowden asked Tony Wratten whether the staff training and competencies review was a routine matter or as a result of the number of post reductions. Tony Wratten responded that it was a matter of routine whereby the site management had to ensure that staff based appointments were kept updated and that any refresher training was undertaken to keep competencies up to date.

11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Before opening up to members, Bob Earnshaw noted the following:

- The next socio economic and site restoration sub group meetings will take place on 20th April.
- The NDA would be organising a site stakeholder group chair's forum sometime between April and June.
- There will be a CoRWM meeting in Edinburgh on the 10th May and attendance will be considered via the business meeting.

Final – endorsed at DSG on 15th June 2011

- At the end of March the 2nd report of the Particles Retrieval Advisory Group is due to be published. This will be discussed in detail at the next site restoration sub group meeting.
- At the end of March the NDA business plan and strategy is due to be published. An invitation to the launch of the NDA strategy had been received. [*Secretary's note*: Derrick Milnes will represent DSG at the Parliamentary reception to launch NDA strategy on the 21st March).
- At the June DSG meeting DSRL will provide a presentation on the site's annual environmental report.

No further business was raised.

12. **CLOSE**

Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for their contributions and closed the meeting.

Bob Earnshaw
DSG Chairman
11th March 2011

APPENDIX 1 – STATUS OF ACTIONS

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG(2011)M005/A001: Secretary to write to Hamish Pottinger thanking him for his involvement with DSG over the years. [Secretary's note – a letter would also go to Katrina MacNab].

DSG(2011)M005/A002: Secretary to put attendance report on next DSG business meeting

DSG(2011)M005/A003: Secretary to amend Terms of Reference as per circulated document.

DSG(2011)M005/A004: Secretary to send card to Elizabeth Gray wishing her well for the future.

DSG(2011)M005/A005: Secretary to write to Babcock International to ask for an update on the Pensions Review and the proposed relocation to Forss.

DSG(2011)M005/A006: Secretary to circulate work package for attendance at the Forum of Stakeholder Confidence in Sweden for comment.

DSG(2011)M005/A007: Secretary to update financial report at end of February for distribution to members for AGM on 9th March 2011. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C147.*

DSG(2011)M005/A008: Bob Earnshaw to comment on draft chairman's report for AGM. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C151.*

DSG(2011)M005/A009: June Love to update DSG agenda for March and distribute to members. *Action complete.*

DSG(2011)M005/A010: Secretary to complete NDA questionnaire on stakeholder preferences and also respond to the NDA draft national engagement plan. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C152.*

DSG(2011)M005/A011: : Secretary to speak to Anne Chard to check availability for attendance at FSC conference in Sweden. *Action ongoing – awaiting confirmation of availability to attend.*

DSG(2011)M005/A012: Secretary to write to National Skills Academy, Nuclear declining invitation to the awards dinner. *Action complete – emailed confirming no DSG attendance.*

DSG(2011)M005/A013: Secretary to write to Vulcan Trade Unions to invite them to become a member of the DSG. *Action complete – an invitation has been sent to the Vulcan unions inviting them to become a member of DSG and to indicate their representative and deputy arrangements.*

DSG(2011)M005/A014: Secretary to write to Anne Bergmans indicating DSG's interest in being involved and also offering to host one of the project workshops in Caithness. *Action complete – emailed Anne Bergmans on 14th February confirming DSG's interest and offer to host a project workshop in Caithness. Response received saying that they would keep invitation on file to consider when project is developed in full.*

DSG(2011)M005/A015: Secretary to invite DSRL's Commercial Manager to socio economic and site restoration sub group meetings on 20th April 2011.

DSG(2011)M005/A016: Trudy Morris to make contact with Graham Construction to discuss the use of local gain within the low level waste contract and report back, via the Site Restoration sub group.

DSG(2011)M005/A017: Simon Middlemas to circulate socio economic benefits in contracts when complete.

DSG(2011)M005/A018: All site restoration sub group members to provide comment on the Scottish Governments consultation on Dounreay's Radioactive waste substitution.

DSG(2011)M005/A019: Secretary to write to authors of the Dounreay heritage (save the sphere) to acknowledge receipt of the report. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)155.*

DSG(2011)M005/A020: June Love to speak to Eann Sinclair to see if details information on job numbers can be provided on a regular basis to the CNSRP Advisory Board. *Action complete – information will be provided at CNSRP Advisory Board on regular basis.*

DSG(2011)M005/A021: Secretary to write to Stuart Chalmers, copied to CEO, asking for assurance that, once NDA can identify funding, the project will remain as the National Nuclear Archives. *Action complete – see DSG(2011)C146.*

DSG(2011)M005/A022: Ken Nicol to provide members with a copy of the DSRL Socio Economic Development plan was approved by NDA (after March 2011).

DSG(2011)M005/A023: June Love to speak to Scrabster Harbour Trust with regards Scottish Government's response to DSG's letter. *Action complete – no further follow up action to take.*

DSG(2011)M005/A024: June Love to finalise response to NDA's business plan consultation and submit by the 26th January 2011. *Action complete – DSG(2011)C132.*

DSG(2011)M005/A025: Secretary to clarify who the PBO representative for DSG sub group should be following Philip Behan's involvement in the competition process. *Action complete – PBO and DSRL looking at new integrated way of working (along with NDA) on socio economics. Ken Nicol will represent PBO/DSRL at sub group.*

ACTIONS CONTINUING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

DSG(2009)M004/A008: Secretary to invite COMARE to present their findings once the extended study on cancer excesses in the vicinity of Seascale and Dounreay was complete. *Action ongoing: emailed on 14th asking for a further update response received on 14th Feb was that work is still being carried out.*

DSG(2010)M001/A001: Elizabeth Gray to update DSG on low level waste issues relating to policy (and including licensing issues) at the appropriate time. *Update was provided on the 9th March. There are two separate lines on this subject.*

- *Bulk Quantities for storage*
- *Paris and Brussels Convention (liability insurance)*

The Bulk Quantities for storage is being taken forward by the Health and Safety Executive (HSE) and a consultation exercise will get underway shortly. This is a follow up to the pre consultation workshops and meetings which took place in 2010 and which assisted in shaping the consultation.

The consultation paper on the implementation of amendments to the Paris and Brussels Convention on nuclear third party liability has been published and the consultation period finishes on 28 April 2011. There is a dedicated web page on the DECC website. The papers include the consultation paper, draft Order and impact assessment. The link is as follows:

http://www.decc.gov.uk/en/content/cms/consultations/paris_brussels/paris_brussels.asp
[X](#)

The revised Paris and Brussels Convention now brings nuclear waste disposal facilities within the definition of a “nuclear installation” and therefore within the liability regime.

The UK Government proposes to bring such facilities within the 1965 Act liability regime but considers that the liability regime should only apply to nuclear waste disposal facilities which present the level of hazard which the Paris and Brussels Convention was designed to cover. Government therefore proposes to amend the 1965 Act to apply all of the aspects of the liability regime in the revised Convention (and the Brussels Convention) to disposal sites but without extending the scope of the existing nuclear licensing regime to cover them.

DSG(2010)M002/A004: Alan Scullion to consider how to best to present sampling results and discuss with Deirdre Henderson to ensure the information is what is required.

DSG(2010)M002/A012: Eann Sinclair to develop a model on the economic impact and how this could be monitored to be shared with DSG and CNSRP Advisory Board. *Action ongoing – study has been commissioned.*

DSG(2010)M003/A008: June Love to send a letter of invitation to Sir Anthony Cleaver to attend DSG meeting to update on CNSRP Executive Board. *Action ongoing – Eann Sinclair indicated this would likely to be April 2011.*

DSG(2011)M004/A013: Simon Middlemas to provide schematic of buildings in site report to DSG and to report on the five main projects in relation to schedule and budget.

DSG(2011)M004/A015: Phil Cartwright to liaise with the Secretary when the barge is due back in Caithness to invite members of the DSG to visit the barge before operations started.

DSG(2010)M003/A015: Secretary to organise a convenient date for members of SCCORS to meet with DSG members (and visit site). *Action ongoing – currently awaiting information from SCCORS.*

DSG(2011)M004/A016: Roger Wilson, SEPA to provide information on comparisons of levels of Caesium in Caithness & North Sutherland against other areas.

DSG(2011)M004/A020: Deirdre Henderson to discuss with Buldoo Residents Group what issues should be considered within the local liaison group and what should be taken forward within DSG.

DSG(2011)M004/A024: June Love to invite Sandy Cummings to provide presentation on off-shore renewables to main DSG. *Action ongoing – invitation to attend a future DSG has been sent – currently awaiting a response.*

ACTIONS COMPLETED

DSG(2011)M004/A001:: June Love to ask Eann Sinclair to invite Brian Wilson to Caithness on behalf of CNSRP. *Action complete – Eann Sinclair has spoken to Martin Wenban and, in conjunction with Chamber of Commerce, visit is likely to take place in end of March/beginning of April.*

DSG(2011)M004/A005: June Love to provide further information on the Forum on Stakeholder Confidence (FSC) in Stockholm on 4th May 2011. *Action complete – information was provided at business meeting and it was agreed that Anne Chard would attend.*

DSG(2011)M004/A010: June Love to circulate SEPA's consultation document on environmental regulation to DSG members. *Action complete – provided to members at site restoration sub group meeting on 19th January 2011.*

DSG(2011)M004/A014: Phil Cartwright to ensure that it is made explicit in reports that the barge is not searching for particles in Scrabster bay and is situated there in times of inclement weather. *Action complete – Phil Cartwright has requested DSRL Communications to report this when appropriate.*

DSG(2011)M004/A018: Secretary to ask DSG Socio economic sub group to consider the impact of the removal of rescue tugs from the Pentland Firth. *Action complete – discussed at meeting on 19th January. It was agreed that the group would keep an eye on developments and respond at the appropriate time.*

DSG(2011)M004/A028: Philip Behan to provide secretary with remit that Babcock have provided to Aon for review of Pensions Office. *Action complete – information was provided.*

DSG(2011)M004/A030: Cllr David Flear to keep DSG Socio Economic sub group updated on progress of the feasibility study for the Berriedale Braes. *Action complete – feasibility study will be carried out by March 2011.*

DSG(2011)M004/A033: Stuart Chalmers to confirm the policy in one of the competition participants pulled out. *Action complete:* Dialogue has now commenced, and it is clear to the NDA that both participants are fully committed to the competition. There is no reason to believe the competition process will not complete successfully. Against that background, no firm policy decision has been made in relation to circumstances where one participant pulled out. However, it has been noted that a range of options would be open to the NDA if such circumstances did unexpectedly arise. These options would include continuing with a single participant, launching a revised competition or terminating the competition process.

DSG(2011)M004/A034: Stuart Chalmers to put question on criteria weighting to the NDA competition team for response. *Action complete:* a high weighting has been attributed to cost reflecting the importance of value for money in the determination of the competition outcome. However, this certainly does not mean that the "cheapest bid" is certain to win. The application of a threshold evaluation approach means that acceptable, robust standards have to be attained before any bid qualifies for consideration. Specifically in relation to socio-economic factors, the NDA has taken the following steps to underpin the desired outcomes:

- All socio-economic performance requirements requested by stakeholders have been incorporated in the draft contracts
- Bidders have been informed unequivocally through the ITPD and related discussions:
- that their tender responses must show how these socio-economic requirements will be met;
- that these responses will be evaluated; and
- that a threshold approach applies - meaning that a failure to meet the specified requirements would render the bid unacceptable irrespective of any other factor (including cost)

The effect of the foregoing is that the importance of socio-economic requirements has been fully recognised in the evaluation model. The NDA has applied a high weighting to cost but, irrespective of that, no bid can be accepted which fails to meet the full range of socio-economic requirements identified by stakeholders, and articulated by the NDA to bidders through the ITPD.