

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

**DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
SITE RESTORATION SUB GROUP**

DSG/SRSG(2013)M002

Minutes of the DSG Site Restoration Sub Group meeting held on Wednesday 17th April 2013 at 1900 hrs in the Pentland Hotel, Thurso.

Present:

Bob Earnshaw	Thurso Community Council (sub group chairman)
Alastair MacDonald	DSG Honorary member
Ian Leslie	SGRPID
Cllr Roger Saxon	Highland Council
Cllr Willie Mackay	Highland Council
Alan Scott	Caithness Contractors Consortium
Anne Chard	Caithness West Community Council
David Broughton	DSG member
Roy Blackburn	DSG member

In addition:

June Love	DSG Secretariat, DSRL
Dyan Foss	Deputy Managing Director, Dounreay
Christine Lee	Site End State Project Manager, Dounreay
Marta Green	Particles Project Manager, Dounreay
Nigel Lowe	NDA Head of Programme
Ken Dyke	Vulcan, MOD
Stewart Ballantine	SEPA

MINUTES

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Bob Earnshaw, Site Restoration sub group chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting. He welcomed David Broughton and Roy Blackburn who were attending their first meeting as DSG members and noted that two new members had also been identified (John Crofts and Tor Justad) who had both tendered their apologies. Bob also welcomed Marta Green to the meeting.

Before moving on, Bob reminded members that the AGM had been held in March where he had been elected as sub group chairman. It had been agreed that a deputy would be identified at the first sub group meeting and therefore asked for nominations for deputy sub group chair.

Alan Scott nominated Cllr Roger Saxon and this was seconded by Anne Chard. There being no further nominations it was agreed that Roger Saxon would take over the role as deputy chairman for the site restoration sub group.

Bob noted that David Flear had recently undergone a major operation and it was expected he would be recuperating for a few months. Bob was currently standing in as acting chair. Members wished David a speedy recovery.

2. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from:

- John Deighan
- Jean Lipa
- John Crofts
- Tor Justad
- Peter Watson, ONR
- Rob Wharton, ONR
- Ian Miller, DNSR

3. **MINUTES OF LAST MEETING**

The minutes of the last meeting – DSG/SRSG(2013)M001 – had been circulated to members in advance of the meeting. The minutes were accepted as a true reflection of the meeting. This was proposed by Alastair MacDonald and seconded by Alan Scott.

No issues were raised from the minutes.

4. **PROGRESS ON ACTIONS**

A status of the actions was provided. Of note:

- DSG(2013)M001/A019: To put a standing agenda item for large contracts on both site restoration and socio economic sub group meetings.

It was noted that procurement would be discussed during the meeting (agenda item 8 refers).

- DSG(2013)M001/A007: Secretary to request NDA's strategy and timeline for the next step for the GDF location

This action was ongoing. Anna MacConnell would provide an update on GDF in due course.

All other actions (relating to the site restoration sub group) were now complete.

5. **VULCAN UPDATE**

David Broughton asked if there was a difference between the aspirations of MOD and Rolls Royce for the Vulcan site. Bob Earnshaw responded that the MOD were currently the decision makers for the future options for the site while Rolls Royce were actively seeking new commercial work for its Caithness workforce.

Commander Ken Dyke provided a verbal update. Of note:

- An emergency preparedness exercise would take place on 19th June. ONR and DNSR will be present during the exercise.

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

- A MOD representative would now be attending the Scottish Government Scottish Sites meeting. The representative will be covering all MOD sites within Scotland.

Bob Earnshaw noted that two papers had been submitted as follows:

- DSG(2013)P006: ONR report for October to December 2012.
- DSG(2013)C017: Rolls Royce update. March 2013

No issues were raised.

6. **DOUNREAY UPDATE**

DSG(2013)P009, Dounreay update (end March 2013) had been circulated to members in advance of the meeting. Bob invited Dyan Foss to provide an update. Of note:

- There had been no RIDDOR reportable incidents in February and March 2013.
- The Annual Review of Safety and Dounreay Regulatory forum took place in March. The Chief Inspector's report on Dounreay was favourable.
- Mark Rouse took over as Dounreay's new managing director on 2nd April 2013.
- The Post Irradiation Examination Cave (PIE) in D1251 has now been decontaminated and the area declassified. The complex is now ready for demolition.
- The Preliminary Safety Report for the Shaft and Silo has been submitted to ONR. Four target fee milestones have just been closed out.
- Year end results showed that the schedule performance index was .92 and cost performance index was .94. While the ideal would be for both indexes to come out as 1 it was recognised that the targets met were met in the first year of the new contract.

Roy Blackburn noted that the MTR raffinate transfer to D1208 had been completed. He asked whether the heels (the residue sludge) was still left and was being dealt with. Dyan Foss responded that they were in the process of cleaning out the remaining sludge from one tank.

Roy Blackburn asked what the RIDDOR reportable incident had been in January. Dyan Foss responded that a contractor had been climbing down some steps, had landed awkwardly and had broken a bone.

David Broughton noted that the report stated that the statistics for injuries had improved. He questioned whether improved was the correct word when compared to the graph presented. Dyan Foss responded that the statistics were collected on a rolling yearly basis and indeed had improved over the last quarter.

Alan Scott said that BDP had recently carried out a safety culture survey and noted it was pleasing that this was also been extended to contractors working on the site. He asked whether DSG could see the results of the survey when available. Dyan Foss responded that they were currently reviewing the report and this would be discussed at a

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

forthcoming Executive Committee. She agreed to share the output of the survey with DSG at the appropriate time (sometime in May 2013).

Action: DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A001: Dyan Foss to provide DSG secretary with the results of the safety culture survey when available.

Bob Earnshaw said he had heard that the security fence that had recently been installed was not satisfactory and further work was required. Nigel Lowe acknowledged further work was being carried out but emphasised that, at no stage, had security been compromised.

Alan Scott noted he had been approached by someone who had enquired whether it was likely that the CNC firing range could be used by local groups, ie the Caithness Rifle Club. Nigel Lowe said that beyond the site end state there was no reason why the community could not use it and suggested that if there was a marginal investment to make it more flexible this was something NDA would consider. Dyan Foss added that this had been discussed with CNC to see whether this could be an option at times when CNC did not require to use it.

The secretary noted that the firing range was currently going through the planning process and if the planning was approved it was likely that there would be planning conditions placed. It would be useful to wait to see how planning progressed.

Alan Scott added that another potential use would be North Highland College to allow them to deliver their game-keeping course. This would be investigated with North Highland College.

Site End State: Christine Lee reported that it had been eventful year. In terms of closure, the Environmental Restoration Programme Plan had been defined which provided the 'roadmap to closure'.

The Regulators were fully engaged and work was ongoing to explore what the clean up was going to look like going forward. The work was based on a risk model and the aim was to get to clean-up levels as low as practicable.

Christine noted that a reference booklet would be issued in the coming months as a guide to closure and said she would ensure that copies were provided to DSG members when printed.

Roy Blackburn asked if any parts of the site would be de-licensed at the interim end state. Christine Lee responded that it would not. The contract was to take the site to interim end state. Delicensing would be something that happened further down the line.

David Broughton asked if all the structures would be removed to foundation plinth level. He asked about PFR (Prototype Fast Reactor) and whether the foundations would be dug out. Christine Lee responded that it would depend whether the criteria for clean-up is met, some of the ground level foundations may remain.

Alastair MacDonald stated it was one of the problems when talking about a site end state because people had to remember it was the interim end state with further work required beyond that point. Christine Lee responded that by reaching the interim end

state the site will be left in a condition, with a site license, that could be used for industrial use.

Particles: Marta Green reported. She outlined the strategy for particle clean-up as following:

DSRL's strategy for particles management is to continue monitoring of local beaches and the Dounreay foreshore as required by the RSA Authorisation. Additionally, non-statutory beach monitoring will continue pending issue of the new RSA Authorisation or agreement by PRAG(D)/SEPA to cease or modify this monitoring. Off-shore seabed monitoring will not be performed in 2013/14.

The basis for the strategy is:

- BPEO recommendations for off-shore monitoring and recovery of targeted areas containing significant particles as well as further monitoring and recovery from the larger area have been implemented.
- Neither transport further afield or re-population of significant particles is evident.
- Occasionally mostly minor particles are recovered from Sandside beach and particles including significant particles recovered from the Dounreay foreshore.

The basis for work to implement the strategy is:

- PRAG(D) final report
- New RSA authorisation
- Ongoing assessment of the number and activity of particles recovered from Sandside beach and the Dounreay foreshore.

In addition to submitting the forward strategy to SEPA, Nuvia, on behalf of DRSL, had recently tested a modification to the particle detection equipment to assess the capability to detect a beta-rich particle such as the one recovered from Sandside beach in February 2012. The test was conducted at Dunnet beach. The result of the test confirmed that the existing equipment was capable of detecting this type of particle and demonstrates that the modified equipment provides a small improvement in beta detection efficiency. DSRL have undertaken to implement the modifications to Nuvia's beach monitoring vehicles at Dounreay and this is expected to be deployed in the next couple of months.

Marta noted that once PRAG(D) had submitted its final report she would like to present the findings and recommendations to the site restoration subgroup.

Anne Chard noted that there were no plans to do off-shore work during the year. Marta Green responded that while she couldn't say for certain whether off-shore work will be performed in the future as the off-shore clean-up data and beach monitoring data are being assessed by PRAG(D).

Anne Chard asked if the modelling data had predicted less numbers of particles turning up on Sandside beach. Marta responded that currently they had data for one full year at Sandside beach and DSRL had recommended to SEPA continued monthly monitoring on Sandside for a further year to gain confidence in the data being collected.

Stewart Ballantine noted that Paul Dale, Technical Secretariat for PRAG(D) had offered to attend the next sub group meeting to discuss the PRAG(D) report in detail. If members had any specific questions for Paul that could be provided in advance this would be allow Paul to provide the fullest answer possible at the meeting. This was accepted by members.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A002: June Love to invite Paul Dale to the next site restoration sub group meeting to outline PRAG(D) final report.

Roger Saxon noted that if the off-shore clean-up was being stopped it would be important to ensure that the public understood the reasoning behind this. Marta Green agreed with this.

Alan Scott asked if the aim was to explore the removal of the fishing exclusion zone. Christine Lee responded that there was no specific aim at present and noted that the fishing exclusion zone had resulted in an improved nursery for sealife.

David Broughton asked whether it was felt that the clean-up offshore had had a significant effect on the on-shore finds. Christine Lee responded that this was one of the things that PRAG(D) was considering. Initial DPAG (Dounreay Particles Advisory Group) had done some modelling work to identify the extent of the particle plume off-shore and it was generally accepted that the modelling work was correct. PRAG(D) is currently considering the data.

SEPA report: DSG(2013)P008 refers. Stewart Ballantine noted the following:

- SEPA had assessed the site's environmental performance for 2012. The results were found to be good (liquid), excellent (gaseous and solid). This was the first year that the compliance assessment scheme had been used to assess compliance under the RSA authorisations.
- Linda Buchan was currently determining the site's application for new discharge limits under the RSA authorisation and is awaiting further information from DSRL in support of its application.
- The Environmental Agency (SEPA's equivalent in England/Wales) had visited Dounreay as part of an initiative to share ideas and experiences on decommissioning techniques and approaches.
- SEPA was currently participating in meetings with DSRL, ONR, Highland Council and the NDA to discuss progress by DSRL in the development of clean-up standards for the site.
- SEPA had requested further information in relation to potential flood risk in relation to Highland Council's planning consideration for phase 2 decommissioning. This information has now been received and addressed SEPA's concerns
- ONR would be providing specialist support to SEPA to review DSRL's assessment of the early stage thermal cracking identified in the walls in the demolition low level waste vault.

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

Nigel Lowe asked whether NDA's report on the thermal cracking would also be reflected in the assessment. Stewart Ballantine responded that it was the NDA's report that would inform the assessment with the proviso that if more detailed information was required that would be requested from DSRL by SEPA.

Roy Blackburn asked what the mechanisms were for thermal cracking. Stewart Ballantine responded that the thickness of the walls were different between the low level waste vault and the demolition vault leading to a greater thermal gradient through the thicker walls necessary for the demolition vault, which in turn led to the cracking. Dyan Foss added that the concrete will continue to cure over time and that the cracking was not unexpected.

David Broughton asked whether these were fibre cracks and a series of individual cracks or through wall cracks. Stewart Ballantine said they were both adding that concrete heals overtime which would provide a seal both inside and out. Stewart agreed to feedback on the outcome of the review being undertaken by ONR on behalf of SEPA.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A003: Stewart Ballantine to feedback the outcome of the review of the thermal cracking report undertaken by ONR on behalf of SEPA.

Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for their input. He noted that Peter Watson, ONR was unable to attend the sub group due to the change of date. Peter had indicated that if there were any questions for ONR he would be happy to address these outside the meeting. No issues were raised relating to ONR.

7. NDA UPDATE

Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme reported:

- The new contract has completed its first full year in operation. All contractual milestones were met. The key financial parameters for the next contract year (eg which inflation figures to use, establishment of Performance Based Incentives etc) have all been agreed and are in place. The new organisational arrangements put in place by DSRL are beginning to bed in and the NDA is very supportive of the changes DSRL have initiated.

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

identified the technical specification. The NDA would currently be turning their attention to a build contract and also looking for a commercial partner to operate the facility.

The secretary noted that a number of DSG members had recently met with Simon Tucker who had provided an update of the NNA project. (DSG(2013)C023 refers).

Roy Blackburn stated he had been surprised not to see the NNA in NDA's strategy document. Nigel Lowe responded it was a timing issue. The strategy for the NNA was ongoing to identify what documentation was required to be kept and for how long. Information was being provided by all sites and then NDA would need to carry out a gap analysis to assess the extent of the information required to be archived.

8. PROCUREMENT TOPICS

Bob Earnshaw reminded members that DSG had asked whether local benefits could be included in Dounreay contracts. Following a presentation by Dounreay at the December meeting Alan Scott and Trudy Morris had met with Dounreay Contracts Manager to discuss this issue. This had resulted in an action being placed for DSG to draft a paper for ongoing discussion with Dounreay. Bob handed over to Alan Scott to discuss.

Alan noted that he and Trudy Morris had worked up a draft document which provided an overview of the issues in terms of socio economics related to the decommissioning project for the Dounreay site. The paper was compiled primarily for the use of organizations interested in working on the site with the aim of encouraging such organizations to explore areas where they could contribute to the socio economic well-being of the area. The document concludes with a simple 'shopping list' and evaluation approach which could be adopted by organizations interested in demonstrating their commitment to supporting the long term socio economics of Caithness and North Sutherland.

Alan Scott also stated that the site should be congratulated in its desire to support a socio economic approach while continuing to comply with EU legislation. He noted that the site had currently tendered a contract with a desire to see 5% of the workforce made up of apprentices.

The secretary noted that there had also been a discussion at the Socio Economic sub group meeting and there had been agreement that members would provide any comments on the draft paper by close of play Friday (19th April). It was agreed that members would consider this paper and respond in the same timescale.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A004: All members to consider the draft paper on "The supply chain and Dounreay – socio economic considerations" by Friday 19th April 2013.

Bob Earnshaw thanked Alan Scott for his work in this area and felt this was something positive that DSG was involved in and looked forward to a successful outcome.

David Broughton commented that he had been Chairman of the Dounreay Apprentice Board many years ago and that he had encouraged apprentices to look outwards for opportunities. He could not see a comment referring to aspirations of people to join a company working in Caithness and then possibly work elsewhere, i.e. someone could

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

undertake an apprenticeship in Caithness but could continue to progress with that company elsewhere in the country. The secretary noted that while this would always be a consideration the aim of the regeneration of the area was to retain jobs in Caithness if possible. However, she noted that this was an individual's choice.

Roger Saxon stated it would be useful if Dounreay tendered smaller contracts which in turn would benefit small/medium size companies in the local area. Dyan Foss responded that this was a consideration with some contracts and as an example the shaft and silo contracts had been split into eight smaller contracts.

The secretary introduced a case study outlining the socio economic benefits to the local community from the Graham Construction's contract for phase 1 of the new low level waste facility at Dounreay.

The case study showed that was possible Graham Construction had sources materials and equipment locally. Due to the specialist nature of parts of the construction work equipment was not available locally.

The study was carried out following a number of comments made regarding Graham Construction and local benefits.

Bob Earnshaw stated he was pleased to see this document which reflected a decent percentage of local benefits considering the contract awarded did not outline any socio economic benefits.

Nigel Lowe suggested that if, following agreement by Dounreay that local benefit can be supported DSG should consider reflecting on this after 12 months and presenting a Caithness prize for the most successful contractor. Members agreed that this was something that could be considered.

9. **CORRESPONDENCE**

Bob Earnshaw noted that the following correspondence had been received:

- DSG(2013)C013: Response, by Dounreay, to an action to provide information on the positioning of the third low level waste vault.
- DSG(2013)C019: summary of the site's discharge authorisation which is currently being considered by SEPA.

Following distribution of this briefing note, the secretary had circulated an update. The earlier briefing indicated increases in tritium and caesium. Having reviewed this again the site have now gone back to SEPA informing them that they no longer require increases and have asked SEPA to reduce the existing limit for caesium and maintain the existing limit for tritium.

- DSG(2013)C024: technical note of measured noise levels of existing firing range with modelled impacts of new proposed range.

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

This piece of work was done following issues raised at the noise levels of the proposed new range.

- DSG(2013)C025: the Strategic Environmental Assessment for the Dounreay site.

Bob Earnshaw noted that following the DSG review a request had been made to see where DSG could get involved with site emergency exercises. Dyan Foss had responded (DSG(2013)C021 refers) inviting members of DSG to observe.

Bob Earnshaw stated that it would be useful if one member would volunteer (with a deputy) to observe site emergency exercises. It was agreed that Anne Chard would be the nominated observer with Roy Blackburn as deputy. The exercise would take place on 18th September 2013.

10. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

Before opening up to members, Bob Earnshaw noted the following:

- Bob Earnshaw and Anne Chard had dinner with David Batters, Chief Financial Officer, NDA on 11th April. Topics covered at the dinner included:
 - David Batters agreed to take the issue of outline planning for the archives to the Board.
 - SSG Chair's forum
 - Raised a new topic of how DSRL could trade (outside of the Dounreay contract). It was agreed this was a good idea but would only be considered if contained within the nuclear industry.

Bob Earnshaw noted that he would like to put this on a future DSG sub group meeting to take this forward further.

- PBO generally doing well, meeting all targets but keeping an eye on the safety aspect.
- Scottish Government Scottish Sites meeting will be held on 25th April. An update from DSG will be provided. In David Fear's absence Bob Earnshaw would be attending.
- Scottish Government Higher Activity Waste meeting will be held on 29th April. David Flear has been the link into this meeting and since it was short notice it was agreed that the secretary who would be already south at this time June would attend as an observer for this meeting.
- The business meeting would be considering all the meetings attended outside of DSG and agree the most appropriate person to represent DSG.
- The secretary noted that she had a copy of the Transcript of oral evidence for Managing Risk at Sellafield. If anyone wanted a copy they were asked to get in touch with June who would provide copies as requested.

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

There being no further business Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for their attendance and input and formally closed the meeting.

Bob Earnshaw
DSG Site Restoration sub group chairman
21st April 2013

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A001: Dyan Foss to provide DSG secretary with the results of the safety culture survey when available.

DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A002: June Love to invite Paul Dale to the next site restoration sub group meeting to outline PRAG(D) final report.

DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A003: Stewart Ballantine to feedback the outcome of the review of the thermal cracking report undertaken by ONR on behalf of SEPA.

DSG/SRSG(2013)M002/A004: All members to consider the draft paper on “The supply chain and Dounreay – socio economic considerations” by Friday 19th April 2013.

ACTIONS ONGOING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

DSG(2013)M001/A007: Secretary to request NDA's strategy and timeline for the next step for the GDF location. **Action ongoing** - Anna MacConnell will provide.

ACTIONS COMPLETED SINCE LAST MEETING

DSG (2012)M004/A011: Secretary to speak to DSRL to see how consistent figures can be used between performance report and swipe-in system. **Action complete:** The performance report records the numbers of employees (and contractors with gate held passes) while the site access data records those people who swipe in on a daily basis. On any given day there is a number of staff that do not enter the site for various reasons, ie shift workers, those on maternity leave, the low level waste project team, Dounreay.com personnel. An example in December there was 266 people (for the reasons detailed above) who did not enter the site.

DSG(2012)M004/A015: Dyan Foss to provide DSG with information on size of vaults at the new low level waste facility. **Action complete** – diagrams with dimensions provided at Site Restoration sub group on 16th January 2013.

DSG(2012)M004/A015a: DSRL to discuss procurement topics with representatives of the Chamber of Commerce and the Caithness Contractors Consortium. **Action complete** – meeting held on 23rd January 2013.

DSG(2013)M001/A010: NDA, Site and Regulator's reports should be provided to DSG 10 working days before sub group meetings. **Action complete** – see DSG(2013)C014.

DSG(2013)M001/A011: The Site End State to become a standing agenda item for site restoration sub group. **Action complete** – now a standing item on the agenda for site restoration.

DSG(2013)M001/A019: To put a standing agenda item for large contracts on both site restoration and socio economic sub group meetings. **Action complete** - discussed under agenda item 8.

DSG(2013)M001/A023: DSRL to provide a timeline for the engineering studies associated with the low level waste concrete cracking. **Action complete:** The independent report is now complete. In addition, the project team have also completed

Endorsed on 24th July 2013

an internal study. The NDA have agreed the independent assessor who will undertake a further independent check and this has started (wb 11th February). The NDA report is due to report at the end of the month. Ongoing discussions continue with SEPA.

DSG(2013)M001/A024: DSRL to provide information to DSG (and Buldoo residents) of the positioning of the 3rd vault once it had been discussed in detail with NDA and regulators. **Action complete** – see DSG(2013)C013.