

**DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
SITE RESTORATION SUB GROUP**

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002

Minutes of the DSG Site Restoration sub group meeting held on Wednesday 16th April 2014 at 1900 hours in the Pentland Hotel (Large lounge), Thurso.

Present:	Bob Earnshaw	Thurso Community Council (chairman)
	David Flear	DSG Chairman
	Alastair MacDonald	DSG Honorary member
	Ian Leslie	SGRPID
	Deirdre Henderson	Buldoo Residents Group
	Mike Flavell	Health Service
	Cllr Willie Mackay	Highland Council
	Thelma MacKenzie	Dounreay Unions
	David Broughton	DSG member
	Roy Blackburn	DSG member
In addition:	June Love	DSRL / DSG Secretariat
	Nigel Lowe	NDA Head of Programme
	Dyan Foss	Deputy Managing Director, Dounreay
	Christine Lee	Site End State Project Manager, Dounreay
	Phil Cartwright	DSRL Socio Economic & Communications Manager
	Cdr Ken Dyke	MOD, Vulcan
	Peter Watson	ONR (Dounreay)
	Stewart Ballantine	SEPA

MINUTES

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Bob Earnshaw welcomed everyone to the meeting. He noted that Phil Cartwright (Dounreay) was in attendance in his new capacity as DSRL Socio Economic and Communications Manager.

Bob thanked members for re-electing him to the chair of the sub group and noted that last year Cllr Roger Saxon had been nominated as deputy sub group chair. He noted, that while Roger Saxon, was unable to attend this evening he had intimated he would continue to act as deputy chair if no other nomination was forthcoming. Members agreed that Cllr Roger Saxon should continue in the role of deputy chair for the site restoration sub group.

Bob Earnshaw also noted that this would be Dyan Foss' last meeting as her secondment to Dounreay had come to an end. He thanked Dyan for her contribution over the past two years and members joined with Bob to wish Dyan success in the future. David Flear presented Dyan with a small gift from DSG.

2. APOLOGIES

Apologies have been received from:

- Russ Hayley Caithness West Community Council
- Cllr Roger Saxon Highland Council
- John Deighan Dounreay Unions (Thelma Mackenzie deputising)

- Cllr George Farlow Highland Council
- Ian Miller DNSR (for Vulcan)
- Jim Williams ONR (for Vulcan)
- Tor Justad DSG member

3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

The minutes of the last meeting – DSG/SRSG(2014)M001 – had been circulated to members in advance. These were agreed as a true reflection of the meeting. This was proposed by David Flear

Roy Blackburn asked about progress on the action placed on Mark Rouse with regards the silo incident. (Action DSG(2013)M004/A005) refers). June Love noted she had received a copy of the incident report and this would be brought forward at the business meeting. Deirdre Henderson added that they had also received a copy of the report noting that the fact the tanks were now banded by stones showed that this should have been there in the first place. David Flear stated that a short note would be issued to DSG following the business meeting.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A002: David Flear, DSG Chairman to issue a short update to the silo incident report following the DSG Business meeting.

Roy Blackburn asked what the outcome was of the discussion between Dyan Foss and Alan Scott regarding training for decommissioning operatives (DSG(2013)M004/A017 refers). Dyan Foss stated she had met with Alan Scott. Subsequently Dyan had met with Commercial Department who had indicated it was not their intention to focus on one sort of training but recognised that different people would require different types of training. Therefore it was not as rigid as it was laid out in the contract.

5. VULCAN UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw noted the correspondence from Commodore Corderoy regarding the occurrence at Vulcan in 2012 (DSG(2014)C015 refers). The Business meeting would discuss and report back to the main meeting, in June, how to move forward with Vulcan reporting. He encouraged members to provide June Love with any questions or issues they would like to raise before the business meeting was held so that all comments could be considered.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A003: All DSG members to provide June Love with any questions/ comments on Vulcan reporting.

Bob Earnshaw stated that written papers had been provided as follows:

- DSG(2014)P009: DNSR report for Vulcan, Jan to March 2014
- DSG(2014)P011: ONR report for Vulcan, Jan to March 2014

David Flear noted that in DSG(2014)P011 mention was made of a forthcoming emergency exercise. He asked whether a DSG observer could attend. Ken Dyke said that this could be arranged and would speak to the secretary to discuss the logistics.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A004: June Love to circulate note to all DSG Site Restoration sub group members to see if anyone is interested in attending Vulcan emergency exercise in an observer capacity.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A005: June Love to liaise with Commander Ken Dyke on arrangements for DSG observer to attend Vulcan emergency exercise.

Bob Earnshaw then handed over to Ken Dyke who reported the following:

- The plant was shutdown at present for the annual maintenance period and is due to complete in late May.
- Information booklets have now been distributed to local residents for emergency purposes.

- A buried ruptured diesel fuel pipe had resulted in approx. 500 litres of diesel seeping into the ground. The ground water was checked and SEPA were informed.
- MOD was aware that they needed to bring more information to DSG and would await the response for the Business meeting.

Roy Blackburn stated that he was not looking for lots of detail but would welcome a matrix, similar to the one Dounreay provided, on health, safety and environment. Bob Earnshaw said he would take this to the business meeting for inclusion in discussions.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A006: June Love to take the suggestion of a health, safety and environment matrix for Vulcan to business meeting for consideration.

David Broughton noted that when members had visited Vulcan he had been very impressed with the commercial work carried out by Rolls Royce. It would be useful for this sort of information to be provided as this was an economic activity within Caithness. David Flear agreed that the economic activity was indicative of the quality of staff at Vulcan.

6. NDA UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw noted correspondence circulated to members in advance.

- **DSG(2014)C021:** the strategic position paper on management of waste graphite.

David Flear asked whether Dounreay had graphite on site. Nigel Lowe responded that there was some but not in significant quantities.

- **DSG(2014)C022:** DECC consultation on the management of overseas origin nuclear fuels held in the UK.

June Love noted that this document would have an impact on the fuels that were currently held at Dounreay. Bob Earnshaw asked members to read the consultation document and provide June with any comments/questions so that a response can be drafted.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A007: June Love to write to members requesting comments/questions on DECC's consultation on the management of overseas origin nuclear fuels held in the UK.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A008: June Love to collate responses from DSG members for approval and submission to DECC in response to consultation on the management of overseas origin nuclear fuels held in the UK.

Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme reported the following:

- The ASFL (Annual Site Funding Limit) was progressing with options being considered to allow one preferred option to be identified. This would be completed within the next 2 months and once approved would result in a Category O change control. Current projections were that this would be submitted to NDA in September/October and would then go through 'due process'. At the appropriate time a full update to the DSG would be provided.

- The National Audit Office (NAO) was scheduled to visit Dounreay in early May to carry out a major project review which would concentrate on how the NDA Site Facing Team managed the Dounreay contract. A full agenda was currently being worked up.
- Cavendish Fluor Partnership (CFP) had been named as the preferred bidder for the Magnox/RSRL competition.

David Flear asked if Fluor was an American company. Nigel Lowe responded that it was. David Flear noted that there had been speculation in the press that those who had not won the contract may be launching a legal challenge. Nigel Lowe stated that he was not aware of any legal challenges although he was aware there had been enquires from some of the bidders to the NDA.

June Love noted that she had also circulated the NDA Site Stakeholder Group briefing for April – DSG(2014)C027 refers.

7. DOUNREAY UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw noted that there was a number of written papers received and suggested that each one was taken with questions to follow.

He invited Dyan Foss to pick out the key highlights from DSG(2014)P013 (Dounreay Progress report). Dyan noted the following:

- As Nigel Lowe had reported, work was concentrating on the re-profiling of the decommissioning plan, looking at the different scenarios and potential impacts.
- During financial year 2013/14, an additional £10M was requested and full funding was spent in accordance with the plan. Considering the work being undertaken to reprofile the plan it was pleasing to see a lot of decommissioning work continue during the year.
- Safety statistics were heading in the right direction and were slowly improving although the site recognised they could not be complacent.

David Broughton noted the poor schedule performance of the shaft/silo project and asked why this project was so far behind. Dyan Foss responded that the site had taken a pause to consider the design work going forward. The shaft/silo had an interesting history and had initially been on the critical path. However, the programme had subsequently changed (and was continuing to evolve as the re-profiling commenced) and this project was now no longer on the critical path. This was a big construction project with a lot of capital work and it was recognised that the site could not carry out both the fuels and shaft/silo decommissioning at the same time.

David Broughton asked whether SEPA and ONR did not regard the shaft/silo such a safety or environmental problem as they did in the past. Stewart Ballantine responded that SEPA did not have the legislative remit to formally agree or disagree the changes to the programme. Linda Buchan leads for SEPA on this project and was constantly looking at this supported by SEPA's hydrogeologist. If SEPA was not happy with the situation then a formal action is an option available. Peter Watson added that the situation for ONR was the same as for SEPA. Dyan Foss responded that the PBO was taking a keen interest in this project and this would continue as the project evolved. With the shaft especially the site had one chance of emptying this and therefore it was important to ensure that the cost and schedule was robust.

David Flear noted that the site had been awarded the British Safety Council's International Safety Award in recognition of the site's proven commitment to workplace health and safety. He congratulated the site for this achievement.

David Flear noted that, at the socio economic sub group held in the afternoon of 16th April, had discussed procurement and a request had been made at that meeting for a quarterly report on all contracts so that the ratio of contracts that contained socio economic commitment could be identified. Bob Earnshaw added that there had also been a discussion in relation to the contract for a new guard force at Dounreay and had been pleased to hear that there was no planned redundancies for CNC and the new contract was to allow CNC to safeguard the site while the new guard force would carry out gate entries and bag searches.

David Flear asked Commander Ken Dyke whether this also related to the Vulcan site. Commander Dyke responded that there was a security requirement to meet (set by MOD) and to achieve that Vulcan was also looking at how to meet this requirement which may require an increase in their unarmed guards. This would not result in a massive number of additional jobs and Rolls Royce are currently looking at this. David Flear asked whether this would result in local recruitment and asked to be kept up to date with this. Ken Dyke responded that he would update at the next meeting and that this work fitted into a wider piece of work.

Roy Blackburn asked whether the NaK optimisation programme in DFR was completing the residual NaK. Dyan Foss responded that this was correct.

Roy Blackburn noted that a review of Zone 1B had been discussed with SEPA. He asked what the outcome of these discussions had been. Christine Lee responded that the Groundwater Daughter Directive was a compliance issue which the site was required to comply with. Discussions were on-going with SEPA to work out the details of what this means to the restoration of the zones. The other area currently being considered was how to demonstrate a suitable interim end state, ie when no further remediation action is required. In relation to Zone 1B this was the first time this was done and things had been found that had not been expected. Stewart Ballantine added that SEPA had devoted suitable resources to consider this. DSRL had provided some data and the purpose of that were for SEPA to feedback their thoughts.

Roy Blackburn noted that a preferred supplier had been identified for waste containers. He asked who had won the contract. Dyan Foss said she was not aware of who the preferred bidder was but would provide a response following the meeting.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A009: Dyan Foss to provide details of who the supplier was low level waste containers.

Site end state update:

Christine Lee reported:

- That the first edition of the processes, forms and procedures required had been developed and were now part of the DSRL Management Process System. These procedures demonstrate how to remediate the zones to achieve the interim end state.
- The re-profiling of the decommissioning programme was consuming a lot of time and the Environment Restoration Department were heavily involved with this.

- The safety case, for restoration and demolition, had been submitted to the safety working party for approval.

David Broughton noted that care was needed when describing the interim end state as Scottish Government policy on higher activity waste means that there will be waste stores on site as well as security continuing at the site.

SEPA update

DSG(2014)P008 refers. Stewart Ballantine reported the following:

- There had been a number of incidences over the last quarter.
- A final warning had been issued to the site with regards the Kr85 occurrence.
- SEPA were satisfied that, in relation to the fire within the equipment maintenance and decontamination facility, that there had been no discharge to the environment.
- SEPA were continuing to investigate the potential issue in relation to the fuel can within a pond in the PFR facility.
- Since the written report had been distributed DSRL had reported to SEPA that there had been a small spill at DFR of bund water. This was non-active water which had been released down the non-active drain. SEPA were looking at this and have taken its own sample of the bund water, which has been sent for independent analysis and will report once investigation is complete.
- SEPA have discussed with site the worrying trend of occurrences.
- Scottish Government have now confirmed that they are content with the RSA Authorisation and this should now been issued this month.
- Article 37 submission was still ongoing.
- SEPA were awaiting information from DSRL for the D3100 (low level waste facility) to allow it to become operational.
- SEPA continued to work with DSRL on determining the interim end state work.

Bob Earnshaw asked what timeframe the Kr85 discharges had occurred. Stewart Ballantine responded that the limit had been exceeded three times over a 3 month period. He felt that this should have been recognised sooner. It was noted this was a small exceedence of what was a very small limit. Dyan Foss added that the site was taking this very seriously and were looking at ways of improving reporting across the site.

David Broughton asked whether the Article 37 submission covered the whole of the decommissioning programme at Dounreay. Stewart Ballantine confirmed this was the case.

ONR report

DSG(2014)P010 refers. He reported the following:

- Discussions continue on the organisational capability and Annual Site Funding Limit (ASFL).

- ONR shares SEPA's concerns about the trend of occurrences on the site.
- Simon Boniface, who had been investigating the stop/start on all operation, maintenance and modification work on safety significant facilities, had been pleased with progress made. It was expected that the next ONR paper will conclude this is now complete.
- Sheila Hutchison had reported that the investigation into the foam fire equipment was going well and ONR's review will continue.
- Two of ONR's new Conventional Health and Safety Team will be on site in June to carry out planned inspections. Included in this will be a review of workplace transport safety in light of two recent transport incidents.
- Simon Boniface was the lead ONR inspector into the PFR caustic release and has reported that he is very happy with how PFR personnel reacted. ONR were following up generic issues related to this and it was expected this would be closed out by the end of June.
- A review of the asset management for civil engineering structures has been undertaken and the initial results fed back to the Director of Assurance.

Buldoz Residents Group meeting

Bob Earnshaw noted that the independent chair had provided a summary of the last meeting held on 25th February 2014. Deirdre Henderson noted that the residents did not view the meetings as a 'waste of their time' but felt that the issues which had been raised and had not been addressed in a timely manner had been a waste of their time.

8. HERITAGE UPDATE

Bob Earnshaw noted that an update on heritage activities had been received – DSG(2014)C025 refers. He indicated the report would be taken as read unless anyone wished to raise any questions.

Roy Blackburn asked whether the communication of heritage activities had been reviewed. David Flear responded that he had held discussions with the NDA and DSRL on this and that Mark Rouse had indicated that DSG would be regularly engaged with this topic, hence the report provided to the sub groups. David added that to continue to argue that the DFR Control Room should be housed in the National Nuclear Archives would have meant that there would have been a potential to affect the viability of the archives. One of the positives coming out of this discussion was there was now a better relationship between the Science Museum in London and Caithness Horizons. June Love noted that a quarterly report would be provided for each sub group meeting from now on.

9. CORRESPONDENCE

Bob Earnshaw noted there was no further correspondence.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Bob Earnshaw invited members to raise items. Of note:

- **Higher Activity Waste implementation:** David Broughton noted that he was the DSG representative on the Scottish Government's Higher Activity Waste Implementation Project Board. A meeting had been held on the 14th March and there was two points of interest for DSG. The final version of the consultation document would be produced by Scottish Government and it was expected they would provide a presentation to DSG before

consultation responses were due to be submitted. During these meetings there had been quite a discussion on the interim end state, permanent and interim storage. Scottish Government policy does not allow for deep disposal and therefore there were still a number of unresolved issues for Dounreay. It was expected that the consultation would be published early summer and the consultation period may be extended to ensure that the independence vote would be complete.

In addition, Scottish Government will hold discussions with NDA on the future of Site Stakeholder Groups as decommissioning progresses. On this particular issue Dounreay is at the forefront and it useful to have that discussion in a timely manner.

Bob Earnshaw noted that this had been a topic for discussion at previous NDA national events. David Broughton responded that the discussion was about how SSGs should be re-organised as a locality or community allowing access and knowledge to the legacy that would be left behind.

- **CORWM visit:** David Flear noted that CoRWM would be visiting Caithness in early July.
- **Contractors at Vulcan:** Thelma MacKenzie asked whether the numbers of contractors at Vulcan was increasing or reducing. Commander Ken Dyke responded that this was for Rolls Royce to respond although he thought that it was fairly static at present.
- **Caithness Conversation:** David Flear noted that a meeting had been held on 7th April with a small group of organisations who receive funding from wind farms. The areas explored were the aspirations of those who received funding and how they could spend their funding appropriately. One of the suggestions was that there was some Scottish Government funding which would allow a development officer to support these groups.

Roy Blackburn asked whether there was any appetite for a Caithness-wide fund. David Flear responded that some groups were supportive while others were not.

- **NDA meeting:** A meeting had been held between David Batters (NDA Chief Financial Officer), David Flear, Derrick Milnes and others. David Flear noted that this had been a positive meeting
- **Major Project Review:** David Flear had been asked by the NDA to take part in the National Audit Office's review to be held in May.
- **Scottish Government Scottish Sites meeting:** David Flear noted that he would be attending the Scottish Sites meeting on the 1st May in Edinburgh.

There being no further business Bob Earnshaw thanked everyone for their input and formally closed the meeting.

Bob Earnshaw
DSG Site Restoration sub group chairman
21st April 2014

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A001: Stewart Ballantine, SEPA to ask Paul Dale for a deadline date for the production of the PRAG(D) report.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A002: David Flear, DSG Chairman to issue a short update to the silo incident report following the DSG Business meeting.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A003: All DSG members to provide June Love with any questions/ comments on Vulcan reporting.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A004: June Love to circulate note to all DSG Site Restoration sub group members to see if anyone is interested in attending Vulcan emergency exercise in an observer capacity.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A005: June Love to liaise with Commander Ken Dyke on arrangements for DSG observer to attend Vulcan emergency exercise.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A006: June Love to take the suggestion of a health, safety and environment matrix for Vulcan to business meeting for consideration.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A007: June Love to write to members requesting comments/ questions on DECC's consultation on the management of overseas origin nuclear fuels held in the UK.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A008: June Love to collate responses from DSG members for approval and submission to DECC in response to consultation on the management of overseas origin nuclear fuels held in the UK.

DSG/SRSG(2014)M002/A009: Dyan Foss to provide details of who the supplier was low level waste containers.