

**DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
SITE RESTORATION SUB GROUP MEETING**

DSG/SRSG(2015)M004

Minutes of the DSG Site Restoration Sub Group meeting held on Wednesday 11th November at 1900 hours in the Pentland Hotel (large lounge).

Present:	Bob Earnshaw	Chairman, Site Restoration sub group
	David Flear	DSG Chairman
	Cllr George Farlow	Highland Council
	Alastair MacDonald	DSG Honorary member
	Deirdre Henderson	Buldoos Residents Group
	Cllr Roger Saxon	Highland Council
	John Deighan	Dounreay Unions
	David Broughton	DSG member
	Roy Blackburn	DSG member
In addition:	Nigel Lowe	NDA Head of Programme
	Bob Kury	Dounreay Deputy Managing Director
	Craig Brown	Dounreay Support Services Director
	Ella Feist	Dounreay Environmental, Closure and Demolition Manager
	Lt Cdr Andy Mole	MOD, Vulcan
	Sheila Hutchison	ONR (for Dounreay)
	Stewart Ballantine	SEPA

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Bob Earnshaw welcomed everyone to the meeting. He introduced Craig Brown, Dounreay Support Services Director and Ella Feist, Dounreay Environmental, Closure and Demolition Department Manager to their first meeting. Craig Brown now replaces Phil Cartwright and Ella Feist attends to update on site end state topics.

For the benefit of Craig Brown and Ella Feist introductions were made round the table.

2. APOLOGIES

Apologies have been received from:

- Brian Mutch, SGRIP (has taken over from Ian Leslie).
- Cllr Willie Mackay, Highland Council
- Mike Flavell, Health Service
- Tor Justad, DSG public member
- Chris Layton, DNSR (for Vulcan)
- Cdr Ken Dyke, MOD Vulcan (Lt Cdr Andy Mole deputising).

3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

Bob Earnshaw noted that the minutes – DSG/SRSG(2015)M003 – had been circulated to members in advance. There were no changes to the minutes and it was agreed that these represented a true reflection of the meeting. This was proposed by David Flear and seconded by David Broughton.

No issues were raised from the minutes.

4. STATUS OF ACTIONS

Bob Earnshaw noted that the status of actions had been circulated in advance to members. Of note:

- **DSG(2014)M003/A009:** Emma Forbes, Highland Council Planning, to look into the issue of excessive noise at the CNC Firing Range and report back to DSG. **Action ongoing.**

June Love noted that she had received a response from Environmental Health confirming they were content that there was no breach of Planning conditions. It was, however, noted that the noise recording sheets which had been posted out to four residents had not been returned. It transpired that some of the residents had found it difficult to find time to complete at the time these were distributed and others had believed these sheets were to be collected. It had been agreed that Environmental Health would re-issue the noise monitoring sheets and these would be collected three weeks after receipt. Therefore the action would remain open until such times as the noise sheets and assessment were finalised.

- **DSG(2015)M003/A003:** All members to provide June Love with any comments, views or observations on NDA's draft strategy. **Action complete.**
- **DSG(2015)M003/A004:** June Love to bring forward at next site restoration sub group meeting with draft response for discussion. **Action complete.**
- **DSG(2015)M003/A005:** Ken Dyke to update on the action about timelines in 2016 for the assessment of options for the Vulcan site.

Lt Cdr Andy Mole noted that clarification was still being sought. Early discussions with NDA had indicated it would likely be towards the end of 2016/beginning of 2017. It was agreed to close out this action at present and include it on the rolling list of topics administered by the DSG Secretariat to allow it to be raised again at the appropriate time (ie September 2016).

- **DSG(2015)M003/A006:** Bob Kury, Dounreay Deputy MD to clarify what information could be released with regards the determination to empty the existing low level waste pits. **Action complete:** information provided as per status of actions.

David Broughton noted that the original BPEO for the management of low level waste had indicated the preferred option would be to empty the existing pits, although it had also noted the low hazard relating to this waste. George Farlow stated he would like to see some monitoring of particles at that time. Bob Kury responded that monitoring of particles on the Dounreay foreshore and at other beaches continued and would do so under SEPA's RSA Authorisation.

- **DSG(2015)M003/A007:** Stewart Ballantine to provide feedback from SEPA's meeting with DSRL on interim end state following meeting in August. **Action complete:** response provided in SEPA's written update (DSG(2015)P024).

5. VULCAN UPDATES

Bob Earnshaw noted that members had received three written papers from Vulcan. These were:

- DSG(2015)P026: Update from Vulcan
- DSG(2015)Po23: Rolls Royce update
- DSG(2015)P019: ONR quarterly report for April to June 2015

Bob Earnshaw invited Lt Cdr Andy Mole to provide a verbal update. Lt Cdr Andy Mole reported the following:

- On 31st July, during a manual handling activity, an operator experienced a calf strain which resulted in more than 7 days off work which makes it RIDDOR reportable.

- Rolls Royce Submarines continue to benchmark and share good practice with participation in the UK BP Safety Reps Forum and the National Operating Experience Learning Group (OELG). The June OELG was hosted by Vulcan.
- There had been no environmental non-compliances during this period.
- The final shutdown of the Shore Test Facility was completed on 21st July 2015. The plant is now at a stage of reducing the decay heat prior to commencement of defueling operations.
- The annual discharge limits were detailed in the written report. This is reported to regulators as a rolling 12 month programme.
- A number of inspections and audits are planned and the 2016 is currently being developed.

Bob Earnshaw thanked Lt Cdr Mole for his update. There were no issues raised by members.

6. **DOUNREAY UPDATE**

Bob Earnshaw noted a number of written papers had been received.

NDA

Bob Earnshaw invited Nigel Lowe to provide the NDA update. He noted that the NDA quarterly performance report had been provided for information to members in advance of the meeting. Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme noted the following:

- The primary issue for NDA is the Corporate Spending Review which would impact on NDA and across the SLCs. It is expected that this information will be available on 25th November and following that the NDA will review the implications and how these will impact on sites.
- The NDA Nuclear Archive, being built in Wick, is progressing to schedule.
- On behalf of NDA, Nigel Lowe met with Dr Paul Monaghan, MP and updated him on NDA and Dounreay issues.
- The change of Sellafield contract model is progressing for the conversion of operations becoming a wholly-owned subsidiary of NDA.

Nigel Lowe also intimated that this would be his last meeting of the Site Restoration Sub Group as he would be taking on a new position as Head of Programme for Magnox and Dounreay which will involve relocating to Manchester. David Flear noted that the DSG had very much appreciated Nigel Lowe's input which had been very helpful. Bob Earnshaw echoed David Flear's comments.

George Farlow asked whether there had been any progress with DRS and the railway loops. Nigel Lowe said he did not have this information but would take an action and report back.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A001: Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme to provide an update on DRS and passing loops from Inverness to Thurso.

John Deighan also thanked Nigel Lowe for his input and support for DSG and the Dounreay site.

Dounreay

Bob Earnshaw noted that a written update had been provided. DSG(2015)P022 refers. Bob Kury, Dounreay Deputy Managing Director reported the following:

- The update on Dounreay Improvement Team is now an integral part of the Dounreay report. DIT has gained a lot of traction and is on track to deliver on the milestones and actions being undertaken. This

includes closing out actions relating to the RSA Authorisation which is due to be complete in December.

- The site had a run of 124 days without a lost time accident – on 12th October a contractor's employee was injured after walking behind a vehicle which reversed resulting in an injury to the right knee.
- Site received a warning letter from SEPA regarding the corrosion found in the ventilation system. As background, in July corrosion was discussed in the ventilation ducting leading from the D1200 labs to D1226 discharge stack. The work was immediately stopped and regulators were notified. Interim repairs were carried out and an internal investigation identified areas for improved inspection and maintenance which we shared with SEPA. The site fully accepts the warning letter issued by SEPA and SEPA acknowledged the impact on the environment and human health from this event was very low.
- There was a release of non-radioactive low hazard powder at the encapsulation plant which resulted in a release off-site. A full investigation was carried out and actions identified. The plant was started back up last week and is now functioning.
- The priority for the site at present (noting that Safety is always the priority) is to get the programme back on schedule for the fuel transports to Sellafield.
- Extraction of NaK from the hot traps in DFR had commenced with the treatment of the first batch underway. The process is expected to take two months and is an important step in preparing the reactor for water vapour nitrogen treatment of the residual NaK.
- Tanks 3 and 4 of the PFR Tank Farm have now been sealed which progresses preparations for final treatment.
- A fault in the software at the WRACS facility was discovered. The fault trips the compactor and discussions are ongoing with the vendor and sub-contractor to identify a solution.
- On recruitment, the total headcount for DSRL employees currently sits at 1237. This includes the recruitment of 15 new graduates, 8 apprentices and 6 trainee project control programmers.
- Phil Craig replaced Mark Rouse as Dounreay Managing Director and took up his post at the beginning of October.

Bob Earnshaw thanked Bob Kury for his input and invited questions from members.

- David Flear noted that Phil Craig had continued to alert the DSG Chairman to issues relating to the site. He had provided briefing to the chairman with regards the corrosion of the ducting and the SEPA early warning letter.
- Roy Blackburn noted that it was good to see the TRIRs come down. He also asked what the outcome was of the RAM Transport exercise. Bob Kury confirmed that the exercise had been deemed satisfactory.
- Roy Blackburn asked whether there had been any underlying weaknesses identified in the asset management arrangements. Bob Kury responded that during the investigation some opportunities for improvement had been identified to track assets with the appropriate amount of detail required.
- David Broughton stated he was interested in knowing a little bit more about the lifting failure which had occurred at PFR. Bob Kury provided a full explanation of this.
- David Broughton felt that the words describing the PFA incident was not particularly technical. June Love noted that there was a balance between providing technical information and information for those not so technically minded.

- Deirdre Henderson noted that it was one of the neighbours who had alerted the site to the PFA release. She had opened her window to take a photograph of the powder and the dust had stuck in her throat which was not a nice experience. She also noted that some of the nearest neighbours had not been alerted. Craig Brown stated that this had been raised at the Buldoo Residents Group and action had been taken to improve communications of this type. David Flear asked how the PFA release was assessed. Bob Kury responded that this was through the material data safety sheet. Craig Brown re-iterated that this powder was non-hazardous material that was released. Bob Kury agreed that inhaling this powder would not have been a pleasant experience for the neighbours.
- John Deighan noted the recent correspondence by DSG and the Wick and Thurso Trade Union Council to the recent GMB press release on site morale and job creation. David Flear responded that DSG and the Trades Council had taken the opportunity to respond as they were puzzled with the timing of the GMB press release given that DSG had been pursuing these subjects for over a year. It was noted that the GMB press release invited Fergus Ewing, MSP to discuss these issues. June Love noted that a holding response from the minister had been received and she was currently awaiting a formal response which would be circulated around members.
- David Broughton asked whether the nitrogen required for the DFR gas blanket was stored nitrogen or within a nitrogen plant. Bob Kury responded that there were tanks for storing nitrogen once it was delivered to site.
- David Broughton asked what the timeline was for receiving the Letter of Compliance for the PFR Raffinate cementation. Bob Kury responded that he did not have that information to hand but would take an action and report back.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A002: Bob Kury, Dounreay Deputy Managing Director to provide the timeline for receiving a Letter of Compliance for the PFR raffinate cementation.

- Bob Eanshaw asked whether the removal of nuclear material was still the site's priority. Nigel Lowe responded that safety and security were always the over-riding priorities for all NDA sites. The removal of the fuels would be taken into account when the extent of the spending review was known.

There being no further questions on the Dounreay report, Bob Earnshaw handed over to Ella Feist for an update on the site end state and related projects. Ella Feist, Environmental, Closure & Demolition Department Manager reported the following:

- As noted in the written report, the site was currently developing the Dounreay Planning Framework 3 document which covers the site decommissioning activities from 2018 to interim end state. A number of environmental projects will help inform the site end state, including:
 - Site end state review
 - Old Diffuser remediation
 - Landscape concept design

The Environmental, Closure and Demolition Department will be undertaking a number of stakeholder engagement activities to get views on the options in taking these projects forward which will in turn feed into the planning framework at the appropriate time.

Ella Feist noted that she was aware that the DSG had carried out an extensive consultation on the site end state and a review of this was normal practice. Discussion on the various projects coming forward will continue to be tabled at DSG and a clear timetable will be developed for stakeholder involvement for 2016.

Bob Earnshaw invited members to raise any questions. Of note:

- David Broughton asked why there was so much discussion on site end states considering that the position for Dounreay with HAW stores, LLW disposal site and attendant security was well defined. Nigel Lowe responded that end states were periodically reviewed to ensure best practice.
- George Farlow asked whether the Corporate Spending Review would impact on the interim end state. Nigel Lowe responded that it could potentially push out the interim end state date but should not impact on the physical work that would be required. George Farlow asked how it was possible to plan for the interim ends stage when funding could be changed. Nigel Lowe responded that the spending review would not impact on the definition of the interim end state but could potentially impact on the date to reach that state.

There being no further questions, Bob Earnshaw thanked Ella Feist for her input.

SEPA

Bob Earnshaw noted that SEPA had provided a written report – DSG(2015)P024 refers. He invited Stewart Ballantine to provide a verbal update. Of note, Stewart Ballantine reported the following:

- A number of inspections had been undertaken by SEPA, including the close out of the Environmental Improvement Plan. The information provided by DSRL had led to the close out of these actions.
- An update of the meetings held to discuss site end states had been reported via the written report. SEPA was currently developing guidance for the revocation of Authorisations under the RSA 1993 (as amended) and this is expected to be available for SLCs in the form of a consultation document early in the New Year. Additional guidance assessing the impacts from the water environment is expected to be finalised and available in the near future.
- The local team had inspected the PFA incident and left a number of forward actions with DSRL to confirm details of the revised design. This had been previously discussed in the meeting.
- Following completion of its investigation into the holes in the ventilation ducting at the on-site laboratories SEPA sent a warning letter to DSRL.
- SEPA's RIFE report had been published which had resulted in a media story relating to honey.

Bob Earnshaw invited questions from members.

- David Flear noted that he had seen the article relating to the honey and was disappointed as it was a non-story.
- David Flear asked if there was an update on the PRAG(D) report (Particles Retrieval Advisory Group). Stewart Ballantine responded that there was no change.
- David Broughton asked why there was so much discussion on site end states. Nigel Lowe responded that the bulk of discussion around interim end states was to ensure that these were defined in sufficient detail. Ongoing discussions ensured that the right things were in place to allow sites to reach their interim end states and that these were clear. It was good due diligence to constantly review and update.

There being no further questions, Bob Earnshaw thanked Stewart Ballantine for his input.

ONR

Bob Earnshaw noted that ONR had provided a written report – DSG(2015)P021 refers. Bob invited Sheila Hutchison to provide a verbal update. Sheila Hutchison stated she would take the paper as read and noted:

- On inspections, the site inspectors had generally found an adequate standard of compliance against the Licence Conditions.

- The lifting incident at PFR and the ductwork corrosion had been followed up and ONR were content that they had been adequately investigated relevant actions identified.
-
- The Industrial safety inspector had visited the site to obtain a broad view on how conventional health and safety is managed. The inspector was satisfied with DSRL's approach.
- Dr Andy Hall, Chief Nuclear Inspector had retired and Richard Savage had been appointed as Acting Chief Nuclear Inspector pending a process to fill the role on a permanent basis. Bob Kury noted that Richard Savage had recently visited Dounreay.

Bob Earnshaw invited questions from members.

- David Flear noted that Peter Watson, ONR Inspector had contacted him to inform him of his retirement. David asked to put on record thanks to Peter Watson for his time at DSG and wished him well on his retirement.
- Roy Blackburn asked whether the organisational change inspection had been focussed around the number of changes taking place. Sheila Hutchison responded that this was a specific inspection on the management arrangements looking at due process, how the baseline was being put together and whether it was justified and appropriate. This then forms a good base for assessing the impact of other proposed changes.
- Roy Blackburn asked whether organisation changes were still coming through. Sheila Hutchison responded that this was the case but not as the same level as it was before.
- Roger Saxon asked whether there was a problem with the essential supplies. Sheila Hutchison responded that there was no problem. A routine inspection had been carried out as identified in the site intervention plan.
- David Flear reminded members that the rotation of senior staff had been something brought up at previous DSG's following the PFR fire. The then MP, John Thurso, had also raised this as an issue with NDA. It was pleasing to hear that Phil Craig had been appointed for a three year duration.

Bob Earnshaw thanked Sheila Hutchison for her input. He noted that there was no CNC representative in attendance and therefore no report from CNC.

7. CORRESPONDENCE FOR NOTING

Bob Earnshaw noted the following correspondence had been included:

- DSG(2015)C057: Note for the Record on the last Scottish Government's Higher Activity Waste Project Board. Bob Earnshaw invited David Broughton to provide a brief update on this.

David Broughton noted the following:

- This was the last meeting of the Implementation Steering Group.
- He believed there were still anomalies of the policy.
- On a positive note, many of DSG's comments on the consultation document had been taken on board.
- It would appear there is still some confusion on some of the language being used, ie retrievability.

- The issue of higher activity waste, especially at Dounreay, which cannot ever be disposed of in near surface facilities still needs to be addressed.
- The NDA is looking at what is happening within Europe and other countries about deep geological disposal. This is part of a 10 year review which will get infeed from NDA.

David Flear noted that this was also the subject of a conference held in Brussels last year. David Flear also noted that a presentation on the HAW had been provided at the Scottish Government's Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting held in November – DSG(2015)C063 refers.

George Farlow asked if SCCORS had attended the meeting. June Love noted that the vice-chair of SCCORS had attended and had indicated that the group had not met for a number of months. A new chair had been appointed recently.

- Bob Earnshaw noted that the investigation report into the fire on the Parida had been circulated electronically to all members. Hard copies were made available at the meeting.

George Farlow noted that the report had pointed out that the skipper had the absolute right to sail but this may change if legislation was amended. David Flear added that the report also stated that the cargo on the boat had been irrelevant to the incident. George Farlow asked if the ship had gone down how the waste would have been retrieved. David Flear noted that the containers, which were cemented, would not be damaged. George Farlow noted that there had been calls for a tug vessel to accompany all nuclear ships and asked whose responsibility this was. June Love responded this had been previously discussed and actions raised regarding tug vessels and agreed to recirculate these.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A003: June Love to recirculate all correspondence on emergency tug vessels.

8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Bob Earnshaw reported that at the last DSG public meeting members had received a presentation on the NDA draft Strategy III. Full consultation had been rescheduled for January but SSG members had been invited to respond to anything in the document now including whether the questions were the right sort of questions. Members had provided initial comments and this had resulted in a draft DSG response which had been circulated.

Members considered the draft response and agreed that no further comments were required.

Action: DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A004: June Love to finalise DSG's response to NDA Draft Strategy III and submit to NDA.

Bob Earnshaw invited members to raise any other business. No further topics were raised.

9. CLOSE

Bob Earnshaw thanked members and observers for their input and formally closed the meeting.

Bob Earnshaw
DSG Site Restoration sub group chairman
15th November 2015

ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A001: Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme to provide an update on DRS and passing loops from Inverness to Thurso.

DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A002: Bob Kury, Dounreay Deputy Managing Director to provide the timeline for receiving a Letter of Compliance for the PFR raffinate cementation.

DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A003: June Love to recirculate all correspondence on emergency tug vessels.

DSG/SRSG(2015)M004/A004: June Love to finalise DSG's response to NDA Draft Strategy III and submit to NDA.

ACTIONS ONGOING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

DSG(2014)M003/A009: Emma Forbes, Highland Council Planning, to look into the issue of excessive noise at the CNC Firing Range and report back to DSG.