

DSG(2018)M003

Minutes of the Dounreay Stakeholder Group held on Wednesday 5<sup>th</sup> September 2018 at 1900 hrs in the Pentland Hotel, Ballroom.

Present:	Roger Saxon	DSG Chairman
	Derrick Milnes	DSG Vice-chair (Wick and Thurso Trades Council)
	Bob Earnshaw	DSG member
	Alastair MacDonald	DSG Honorary member
	Andrew Taylor	SGRIP
	Trudy Morris	Caithness Chamber of Commerce
	Sandra Owsnett	Dounreay Unions
	Ron Gunn	CHAT
	Eann Sinclair	CNSRP
	Roy Blackburn	DSG co-opted member of the public
	Tor Justad	DSG co-opted member of the public
	Cllr Stephen Clackson	Orkney Island Council
	Ronnie Johnston	Church of Scotland
	George MacDougall	Caithness West Community Council
	Gillian Coghill	Chair, Bulldoo Residents Group
	David Broughton	DSG co-opted member of the public
	Cllr Struan Mackie	Highland Council
In addition:	June Love	DSG Secretariat, Dounreay
	Mark Raffle	NDA Lead Programme Manager
	Phil Craig	Dounreay Managing Director
	Sam Usher	Waste Director, Dounreay
	Adreain Gill	Interim End State Delivery Manager, Dounreay
	Wendy Newton	MOD Vulcan
	Supt Martin O'Kane	CNC

## MINUTES

### 1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Roger Saxon, DSG Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting. He noted that in addition to the normal attendance Sam Usher, Waste Director and Adreain Gill, Interim End State Delivery Manager were also in attendance to provide presentations later in the agenda.

Roger Saxon also congratulated Eann Sinclair on his recent appoint as HIE's acting Area Manager for Caithness & Sutherland. This had been announced last week with Roy Kirk now focussing on space and would be leading the UKVL Sutherland project. He asked Eann to explain what was happening in terms of the CNSRP Programme Manager's post. Eann Sinclair thanked Roger for his kind words and stated that at present he would carry out both roles and therefore for the short term not much would change with regards to CNSRP. The CNSRP had a defined programme and the various groups would continue to meet to progress the projects identified. He expected his interim role as Acting Area Manager would

last around 3-6 months. Further consideration beyond the 3-6 months would be required dependent on whether the temporary position at this time became permanent. Roger Saxon asked whether Eann would be representing CNSRP and HIE at these meetings for the foreseeable future and Eann Sinclair confirmed this was correct. Roger Saxon commented on Roy Kirk's involvement with DSG over the last 10 years and took an action to write a letter to thank Roy for his involvement.

Action: DSG(2018)M003/A001: Roger Saxon to write, on behalf of DSG, to thank Roy Kirk for his involvement with DSG and to congratulate him on his new position as Director of Space.

Roger Saxon also noted the pending retirement of Cdr Ken Dyke and acknowledged his successor, Cdr Shaun Southwood, who was sitting in the audience. Roger Saxon noted he would also write to Ken Dyke thanking him for his contribution over the years.

Action: DSG(2018)M003/A002: Roger Saxon to write, on behalf of DSG, to thank Cdr Ken Dyke for his input into DSG.

Roger Saxon noted that some DSG members had visited the Dounreay site earlier that day where they received an update on the decommissioning programme as well as a tour of the site. All who attended had found it worthwhile and for those who had been on site previously had acknowledged some skyline changes which had taken place since their last visit. He thanked Dounreay site management for affording DSG members the opportunity to visit.

Before moving on to apologies, Roger Saxon stated he was making a small change to the running order of the agenda to allow the Dounreay update to be taken before the two presentations. This was agreed.

## 2. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from:

Thelma Mackenzie	Thurso Community Council
Brian Mutch	SGRPID (Andrew Taylor deputising)
David Flear	DSG Honorary member
Cllr Matthew Reiss	Highland Council
Cllr Kirsteen Currie	Highland Council
Roy Kirk	HIE
Malcolm Bell	Shetland Island Council
Donald MacBeath	North Highland College
Cllr Willie Mackay	Highland Council
Stewart Ballantine	SEPA
Danny Gregory	ONR

## 3. MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

Roger Saxon noted that members had received the draft minutes of the previous meeting in advance of the meeting – DSG(2018)M002 refers. He asked whether anyone wished to

make any amendments. No amendments were raised and the minutes were taken as a true reflection of the meeting. This was proposed by Derrick Milnes and seconded by Alastair MacDonald.

Roger Saxon invited members to raise any issues from the minutes.

) Tor Justad noted that the last update had reported that the DFR crane was back in limited service and asked whether it was now back into full service. Phil Craig, Dounreay Managing Director, responded that it has been returned to service to allow the nuclear material in the reactor to be moved from A to B. It had not been completely refurbished but was serviceable for the activities required for the breeder fuel retrieval work. Therefore one arc of the crane had been refurbished for this activity. If there was a requirement for further use then the crane would be further serviced to ensure it was safe to do the job.

) Tor Justad noted that comments in the Site Restoration sub group minutes had reported through the incident with DRS and felt that the minutes did not reflect the media statements that had been issued. The external statements seemed to intimate this was not a signal failure. Phil Craig noted that the initial statement which had been released had reported that the train had passed through a red signal. DRS then worked with Network Rail and the findings from the investigation showed there had been a signalling operational abnormality which Network Rail was directly responsible for. Following this incident Network Rail led on the investigation with DRS supporting. Phil Craig also noted that there were two mechanisms which essentially takes the operation of the train out of the driver's hands ensuring that the train would stop. The train driver was not given a pre-signal because of the irregularity. As soon as the driver saw the red signal the driver stopped the train which remained in the safe zone. As soon as this occurred, DRS acted on the procedures and the train driver was replaced and tested to ensure the driver had been fit to drive. It appeared that the driver had actually been very diligent.

Tor Justad noted that while this may be the train, carrying nuclear material, was stationary for a considerable amount of time. He asked whether there would be any independent reports on this incident carried out as he felt that the impartiality of reports was dependent on who writes them. He asked if DSRL had full visibility of the investigation through DRS.

Trudy Morris noted that the Caithness Transport Forum had received an update on this incident and this had been reported at the meeting held this afternoon. She confirmed the report was consistent with Phil Craig's explanation. Roger Saxon stated that shortly after this incident Network Rail had announced the upgrading of the signals.

There being no further issues arising from the minutes, Roger Saxon moved on to the status of actions.

#### 4. STATUS OF ACTIONS

Roger Saxon noted that members had received the status of actions in advance. These actions had also been reviewed at the Business meeting. Roger Saxon highlighted the following:

- J DSG(2018)M004/A001: Wendy Newton to send June Love website links on MOD recruitment activities for Vulcan. Action complete: The links had been provided for three posts. Details of the links had been circulated.
- J DSG(2018)M004/A031: Cllr Matthew Reiss to confirm with Stage Coach that coaches were not stipulated for the Dounreay contract. Action complete: Cllr Matthew Reiss notified Stage Coach (7<sup>th</sup> July 2018) on the discussion at the June DSG. Stage Coach has now confirmed that the current contract does not specifically refer to coaches rather than buses however the individual services have strictly defined seating capacity requirements. As a result the only way Stage Coach can practically deliver the required minimum seating capacity on several of the services is by using coaches. Stage Coach team is in the process of reviewing the capacity requirements for each route with Dounreay with a view to matching SC capacity supply with demand on each route. This may result in some changes to the vehicles operating on the Dounreay services.
- J DSG(2018)M004/A032: June Love to provide information on Dounreay bus contract to Caithness Transport Forum to clarify again that coaches were not a stipulation in the contract. Action complete: Information passed to Caithness Transport Forum at end of June 2018.

Those outstanding actions included:

- J DSG(2018)M001/A001: Wendy Newton to present the options for the future of the Vulcan site to the Site Restoration sub group meeting in January 2019.
- J DSG(2018)M001/A009: June Love to write to The Safety Assessment Federation (SaFed) regarding the Vulcan boiler incident. Action ongoing: correspondence sent on 1<sup>st</sup> May – response awaited and chased again.
- J DSG(2018)M004/A011: June Love to request a meeting with Alan Cummings and DSG members when next visiting the Dounreay site. Action ongoing: Request made to NDA on 5<sup>th</sup> July 2018.
- J DSG(2018)M004/A012: June Love to respond on behalf of DSG to Rick Wylie, Lancaster University, requesting further information on the research he wished to undertake with DSG involvement. Action ongoing: Further information was received from Rick Wylie on 17<sup>th</sup> August. This will be further discussed at the Business meeting to agree a way forward.

The actions from the various sub group meetings were also included in the status of actions and it was noted these were being progressed.

#### 5. UPDATES FROM DOUNREAY

Roger Saxon reminded those reporting activities should confine these to information not already provided at the sub group meetings held in July, noting that a number of written updates had been provided for the sub group meetings, including:

- ) DSG(2018)P017: Dounreay Socio Economic Alliance update
- ) DSG(2018)P018: Dounreay site restoration update
- ) DSG(2018)P019: SEPA update
- ) DSG(2018)P020: ONR update
- ) DSG(2018)P024: CNSRP update

Before opening up for verbal updates, Roger Saxon noted the following:

- ) At the socio economic sub group meeting Bill Hamilton, NDA Head of Stakeholder Relations, had attended to provide some clarity on socio economic spend across the NDA estate. DSG members had received an NDA socio economic spend report and had written to Bill Hamilton to request clarification on the number of issues relating to socio economics. Bill attended the meeting to discuss the comments set out in the letter and had taken an action to provide a written response. The written response had just been received and this would be discussed at the next business meeting before being taken at the next socio economic sub group. Slightly related to this was a report from Oxford Economics on the social impact for Sellafield and a press article from one of Allerdale Councillor who reported that one area of Cumbria was being favoured over others. Some of the information from this report seems to be at odds with what had been discussed with Bill Hamilton and the business meeting would review this in more detail.

Roger Saxon stated that rather than go through the topics discussed at the sub groups he would take the minutes as read. He then handed over to the following for updates:

NDA: Mark Raffle, Lead Programme Manager, NDA reported:

- ) NDA and DSRL had welcomed the Secretary of State, Greg Clark to site following his successful visit to the site for the UKVL spaceport. While on site, he was provided with a tour of the site, site updates, and met with apprentices/graduates as well as visiting the CNC facilities.
- ) In terms of the UKVL Spaceport a meeting had been organised for NDA to meet with HIE to discuss funding mechanisms for NDA support.
- ) Three visits of Japanese visitors were scheduled to take place shortly. Next week the Parliamentary vice-minister would be visiting following a site visit to Sellafield. The

following week members of NDA (Japan's equivalent to the NDA) would also be visiting looking at supply chain models and sodium destruction. In the same week a further visit was due to take place by JAEA with a visit to the archives.

Tor Justad asked if there was any progress on a date for DRS's trial for commercial freight which appeared to be taking a long time to set up. Mark Raffle noted that DRS had not yet indicated a date but it appeared that the logistics were being put place.

David Broughton noted the number of Japanese and other such visits to the site and asked if there were any studies undertaken to identify the business benefit of these visits. Mark Raffle noted that INS, a subsidiary of NDA, were responsible for such visits and the Intellectual Property belonging to the NDA was dealt with appropriately. He added that it was not just the NDA looking for business and that these visits had a wider remit. He was aware, however, that some of the suppliers working on the shaft project had been involved in further discussion with Japanese companies and therefore there may be a wider benefit to these visits.

David Broughton asked whether there was any evidence that the UK had benefitted. Mark Raffle said he would take this away and respond in writing.

Phil Craig added that while these visits concentrated on Sellafield and Dounreay the NDA was representing UK plc and knew of instances where it was not just the NDA that gained value but the NDA were also supplying a platform into these markets for some of the SMEs.

Action: DSG(2018)M003/A002: Mark Raffle to explore as to whether UK Government retained evidence of business benefit for business visits to the UK.

Dounreay: Phil Craig, Dounreay Managing Director, reported:

- ) The site had now gone 324 days without a lost time accident and noted how proud he was of the workforce for achieving this. The TRIR stood at 0.08 and was industry leading. Having achieved these statistics no-one on site was complacent and there was a drive to continuously improve.
- ) The Parent Body Organisation and DSRL had welcomed the announcement by the UK Space Agency regarding the potential site at Sutherland for the UK's first vertical launch spaceport. This was a demonstration of what people in the room had been trying to achieve and while there was still a lot of work to do on this and other CNSRP projects, the work undertaken to date had started to show real progress. While Roy Kirk had led this project support had been provided by DSRL and Cavendish Nuclear to get the project to where it was at present.
- ) Eight new apprentices had joined the site this week and a further 10 graduates had been recruited.

- ) The site had also taken part in the Secretary of State's visit and he had spent a lot of time talking to the apprentices about skills and their aspirations for the future.
- ) Later this week the site would be holding the apprentice indentures to allow those in the scheme to celebrate with friends and family the end of their apprenticeship and transition into employee status on the site.
- ) The site management had also recognised an enormous amount of work undertaken on safety, environment and EDI (Equality, Diversification and Inclusiveness). With that in mind, a Dounreay Professional Awards scheme had been set up and colleagues had been encouraged to nominate people/teams that they believed had worked and should be recognised for their efforts. Sixty-nine nominations had been received for various categories and these had now been shortlisted with the winners being announced at a forthcoming awards evening.
- ) This Saturday the site was again holding Family Day where staff and their relatives can come to site.
- ) Two new appointments had recently been announced, Alexander MacGill (Mac) would be returning to his homework to take up the post of Security and Resilience recently vacated and David Hubbard, Construction Director.
- ) Decommissioning progress continues with the breeder fuel removal project starting up again following the repairs to the crane.
- ) Filming on the Dounreay site had been undertaken recently for the Hidden Britain by Drone programme. While exemptions to the no-fly zone were afforded to allow this filming to take place it was stressed that the flying of drones near the site was not permitted.
- ) Following receipt of a Sellafield flask, Dounreay monitors detected low level contamination. Both ONR and SEPA were immediately informed.
- ) Previous reports had reported on the site wide impacts and putting some stability into the programme. This had been submitted to the NDA at the end of July and NDA were currently assessing this. Once this is complete the updated performance plan and resource plan would be updated.
- ) The Annual Safety Demonstration would take place on 12<sup>th</sup> September 2018.
- ) Finally, Phil Craig was due to complete his three year secondment as Managing Director at the end of September and therefore this was likely to be his last DSG meeting. His successor was yet to be formally announced and therefore a firm departure date was not yet identified however it would likely be between now and end of November. As soon as his successor could be announced he would inform staff first and then inform a number of key external stakeholders.



Sandra Owsnett stated that on behalf of the Dounreay Unions she would like to thank Phil Craig for his support over the past three years and wished him all the best for the future.

Tor Justad asked if an explanation in laymen terms could be given in regards to the contamination found of the Sellafield flask, ie what an acceptable figure for contamination to be detected is. Phil Craig noted that the transport of nuclear material was heavily regulated and the levels of contamination detected were well below the regulatory threshold. The reason why he mentioned it today was to continue to be open, honest and transparent. Noting that this did not address the question Phil Craig agreed to provide information following the meeting.

Action: DSG(2018)M003/A004: Phil Craig, Dounreay MD to provide information on levels of contamination with regards regulation.

Tor Justad also noted comment in previous minutes regarding LINC and the Cumbria remote handling systems asking whether these technologies were being utilised on site. Phil Craig noted that Dounreay had instigated the LINC scheme which was to encourage companies to come forward with innovation which would result to lower costs. Since its inception there had been four LINC opportunities advertised to date. Sellafield had also taken this initiative on board.

Councillor Stephen Clackson noted that number of days without a lost time accident and asked if the TRIRs could be explained in more detail. Phil Craig noted that the TRIR was the Total Recordable Incident Rate which was an internationally recognised safety metric which covered all sorts of incidents including slips, trips and falls. This process allowed sites to gauge their safety performance. As an example, BP were regarded as world class and they are deemed that with a performance of 0.2. At present the Dounreay site sits at 0.08 and this is assessed on a 12 month rolling scale however he noted that if an incident occurred tomorrow the figure would rise and it would take 12 months to reflect the fact it had then dropped off the statistics. Councillor Clackson asked if there was a maximum figure. Phil Craig responded that a high number was bad and low is good. Cllr Clackson asked whether a score of 1 would be bad. Phil Craig that it would vary dependent on the number of employees the company had. Currently, the Magnox sites sat at 0.26 and it was recognised that Dounreay was leading the NDA estate in this performance.

Tor Justad noted the recent grounding of a ship in the Pentland Skerries in August in calm weather which had taken a while to get it refloated. Given this and the fact there was only one tug available for incidents such as this he asked whether this was of concern to the site in terms of nuclear material shipments from Scrabster. Phil Craig responded that the site was always made aware of these types of incidents but noted that he did not run ships and could not comment on what was a political decision. Mark Raffle added that, as discussed before, NDA had previously provided DSG comments on tug vessels to the responsible Government Department (Department of Transport). Tor Justad asked whether the report on the grounding would be made public. Phil Craig responded that while, for security reasons, the shipping routes or methods of transport of nuclear material could not be made public but if a shipment was going by sea it would not be sailing in the direction of where the boat ran aground.



Councillor Struan Mackie added his thanks to Phil Craig for the openness of the site reporting noting that other such Government organisations could learn from Dounreay on transparent reporting. He also noted that with the LINC initiative and innovative piece it appeared that Dounreay was 2-3 steps ahead of other companies.

ONR:

Roger Saxon noted that Danny Gregory, ONR had tendered his apologies. He stated that if any member wished to raise anything in relation to ONR it would be actioned through for a response. No questions were raised.

SEPA:

Roger Saxon noted that Stewart Ballantine, SEPA had tendered his apologies. Again, he stated any queries would be actioned through. No questions were raised.

CNC: Chief Inspector Martin O’Kane reported:

- ) CNC continued to support Dounreay’s clean-up mission and also continued to support Police Scotland with advanced search of Castle of Mey prior to HRH visiting and also supported the search for a missing person. In addition, CNC officers had responded to a road traffic accident until such times as Police Scotland arrived to take over.
- ) Two new recruits were now working on site. One was local while the other officer came from the Central Belt.

There being no further questions, Roger Saxon thanked everyone for their input.

For completeness the actions from the Site Restoration Sub Group, Socio Economic Sub Group and Business meeting are recorded below:

DSG(2018)M003/A005: June Love to contact David Lowe to request that any impact on staffing resources identified in the new decommissioning plan is communicated in a timely manner.

DSG(2018)M003/A006: June Love to request a meeting with Phil Craig and his successor at the earliest opportunity.

DSG(2018)M003/A007: June Love to draft letter on behalf of DSG Chairman to send to NDA requesting that the next stakeholder summit be held in Caithness.

DSG(2018)M003/A008: June Love to co-ordinate meeting with DSG Socio Economic sub group chair and deputy chair along with Anna MacConnell and Eann Sinclair to discuss pipeline projects.

DSG(2018)M003/A009: June Love to finalise DSG response to STEM consultation and submit before the 17<sup>th</sup> August 2018.

Endorsed on 5<sup>th</sup> December 2018

DSG(2018)M003/A025: DSG to write to Cdr Ken Dyke thanking him for his involvement.

DSG(2018)M003/A026: June Love to circulate the letter received from Rolls Royce.

DSG(2018)M003/A027: June Love to contact John Hook to confirm when intakes of apprentices will cease.

DSG(2018)M003/A028: June Love to provide correspondence DSG(2018)C021: BEIS workshop, Edinburgh 6<sup>th</sup> June to Buldoo Residents Group.

DSG(2018)M003/A029: June Love to change the wording from High Activity waste to Higher Activity waste in DSG(2018)C025.

DSG(2018)M003/A030: June Love to provide DSG(2018)C025: DSG response to BEIS consultation on regulation of sites in final stages of decommissioning and clean-up to Buldoo Residents Group.

DSG(2018)M003/A031: June Love to circulate the link to the consultation on protecting the public from radioactive contamination in land, how to improve the protection of the public in contamination in land.

## 6. DOUNREAY WASTE PRESENTATION

Roger Saxon stated that members had received this presentation at the Site Restoration Sub Group meeting and had felt it important to extend this to the full DSG. He handed over to Sam Usher, Waste Director, who provided a presentation. See DSG(2018)C031.

) Roy Blackburn asked whether the potential treatment was for historical wastes only or would there be a possibility of future metals being treated in the same way dependent on the outcome of the feasibility study.

Sam Usher responded that the feasibility study, which would kick off shortly, would be looking at a family of "historic" wastes, for which it had not yet been possible to demonstrate disposal in the vaults as BPM (Best Practical Means). For future metallic wastes there may be a different situation, and this would be assessed using a similar process as the historic waste. It was estimated that quantities of historic waste considered in the feasibility study on the site were equivalent to around 5-10 non-containerised items and around 45 containers.

) Councillor Stephen Clackson asked whether these metals had become radioactive through contamination with other isotopes.

Sam Usher responded that for non-containerised metals the contamination was due to processing or had been in touch with bits of contaminated metal, while some were tritiated wastes. Tritium decays overtime and it would take around another 30-40 years or so before it decays enough to be below the thresholds for low level waste.

- ) Councillor Stephen Clackson noted that tritium was a gas and asked whether there was a possibility of this leaching out or would it be contained within ISOs?

Sam Usher responded that that he would provide additional information on this issue.

*Post meeting note: Tritium was produced in the Dounreay fast breeder reactors during operation (by numerous nuclear reaction processes). This tritium readily passed into the hot molten reactor coolant (ie sodium at PFR and sodium/potassium alloy at DFR), and at the high temperatures seen during reactor power generation, the tritium soaked (diffused) into all the steel the coolant came into direct contact with. When the Reactor stopped generating power and the temperature dropped significantly the tritium became far less mobile and any that had soaked (diffused) into the steelwork essentially becomes trapped there.*

Action: DSG(2018)M003/A032: Sam Usher to provide information on tritiated wastes.

- ) Tor Justad asked whether there would be continued monitoring once containers were filled and disposed of in the vaults. He queried what would happen if other material went into the vault that required further monitoring.

Sam Usher responded that waste, within the nuclear industry, was deemed a quality product with stringent compliance checks before it was signed off and disposed of. He added he was confident that nothing would be disposed of that should not be there at the point of closure of the vaults. In terms of monitoring between now and the interim end state monitoring of the facility would continue under SEPA's Radioactive Substances Authorisation (RSA) because the facility would not be closed off during these operations. Once the facility was closed and backfilled with grout, infilled and capped then the safety case would reflect the levels of monitoring required.

- ) Tor Justad asked what the Proximity Principle was,

Sam Usher explained that the Proximity Principle was the principle that wastes be managed close to where they are generated. This was one of the criteria to be taken into account in the BPM assessment.

Sam Usher added he would be happy to keep DSG informed as the feasibility study into these metallic wastes progressed.

- ) Tor Justad noted that one option was to transport the wastes to a country that would decontaminate the metals and recycle. He asked whether other countries, in addition to Sweden, Germany and France, had the capacity to do this.

Sam Usher noted that recycling facilities for this type of metal were undertaken by the private sector. There was a regulatory process in place to allow this to happen. Effectively the market is not big enough to develop more facilities. UK had looked at investing in this sometime ago and had reached the conclusion that the economics did not make good business sense. It was estimated that a melter would cost in the region of £20M and the

market was not big enough in the UK to justify investment in these facilities when services were available overseas.

There being no further questions, Roger Saxon thanked Sam Usher for his presentation.

## 7. DOUNREAY END STATE REVIEW PRESENTATION

Roger Saxon noted that the Site Restoration sub group had received the end state review presentation at the July meeting. Again it had been felt useful to roll this presentation out to all DSG members. He handed over to Adreain Gill, Interim End State Delivery Manager. See DSG(2018)C032 for presentation.

) Ronnie Johnston noted that during the presentation it had been mentioned that Dounreay had been one of the 'lead and learn' sites. While he accepted the principle in experimenting he asked what assurances could be given in relation to risk management. By the inference of lead and learn it would appear that the site was not sure where it was going.

Adreain Gill responded that NDA had asked that Dounreay, Trawsfynydd and Winfrith had been nominated as 'lead and learn' sites which meant that the three sites were the lead to consider all aspects of this in relation to new regulation. The findings from the three sites would be used to ensure a consistent approach across the NDA estate.

) Ronnie Johnston asked whether these would be controlled experiments.

Adreain Gill said they were looking at this and was approaching it through DSRL's processes and regulations. Phil Craig added that 'lead and learn' did not mean the site was carrying out experiments but was one of three sites that were working through the logistics which in turn would be rolled out consistently across the NDA estate. This was being carried out working alongside SEPA and the Environment Agency. Roger Saxon noted he had attended a workshop on the changing regulations which had led to this review.

) David Broughton noted that he was struggling with this because of the Scottish Government's policy on higher activity waste. Under that policy, the interim end state would have higher activity waste stores built on site and these would need to be replaced every 100 years or so. Therefore it would not be possible to restore the site completely while radioactive waste stores remained on the site indefinitely. He queried whether it was necessary to use a lot of taxpayers' money to clean up to a greenfield or indeed brownfield site when the site would have a continuing security force and restricted access.

Phil Craig responded that this was one of the reasons the NDA Chief Executive had asked that reviews be undertaken especially in light of the new GR regulations. The reasoning of having lead and learn sites allowed a fresh look to see whether flexible processes can be identified. This starts to address some of these issues and once the way forward was agreed it would be rolled out to all sites to ensure a consistent approach. The reason for informing stakeholders now was that this was at an early stage and it would require further

engagement as it evolved to ensure public confidence to deliver the remediation of the site and return it to what it was before Dounreay was built.

Mark Raffle noted that the Dounreay phase 3 planning application proposed that the site would be returned to a brownfield site. Adreain Gill added that looking at an optimised site end state did not necessarily mean restoring everything but was about doing the right thing.

) Bob Earnshaw noted he had previously been involved in a number of workshops looking at this and had confidence that this will work and would be overseen by Regulators. Dounreay, in his opinion, would never be a greenfield site but this did not exclude future use as a brownfield site can be utilised for industrial use.

) Tor Justad asked for clarification on a comment relating to radiation levels of E-6.

Adreain Gill responded that this was a nuclear term to ensure compliance. If there was 1 million tasks being undertaken on site HSE set limits which provides acceptable risks and equated to one death for every million tasks.

Phil Craig added that one in a million has the potential for harm to be caused and that includes harm to the environment or a person. It was a ratio which was acceptable to HSE within the risk sphere.

) Alastair MacDonald noted that he came to Dounreay when it was a greenfield site and asked what the future plans were.

Phil Craig noted that it was likely that there were areas of the site that could effectively be returned to greenfield but it would be mixed with some areas being restored to a brownfield site. If there was a robust business case it was possible to return parts of the site back to greenfield.

) David Broughton stated that many years ago one of the senior managers at Dounreay, Tony Judd, had written a book on fast reactors and in his concluding remarks it was noted that most industries don't work to anything like a one in a million risk factor.

) Bob Earnshaw stated that a brownfield site would not negate alternative use if this was identified.

There being no further questions, Roger Saxon thanked Adreain Gill for his presentation. He noted that this and the waste update were topics worthwhile keeping on the radar for DSG as these progressed. He felt that DSG members needed to ensure that while recognising that the NDA and site management's remit was to decommissioning the site in a cost effective way, DSG, as community members, need to also consider whether any changes to the way these things are done are carried out without dis-benefits to the community as a whole. Therefore he felt these were important topics to continue to explore.

## 8. UPDATE FROM VULCAN

Roger Saxon noted that Vulcan updates were provided at the Site Restoration Sub group meetings. At the last meeting a number of written papers were provided as follows:

- ) DSG(2018)P021: MOD update
- ) DSG(2018)P022: Rolls Royce update
- ) DSG(2018)P015: DNSR report
- ) DSG(2018)P019: SEPA report

He invited Wendy Newton to provide a verbal update. Wendy Newton reported:

- ) DNSR had been on site for their annual visit which included the annual review of safety last week. While the formal report had not yet been received the wash-up at the end of the visit was positive.
- ) As noted in the actions, recruitment is underway for a number of positions at Vulcan. The links had been sent to the DSG Secretary and Wendy thanked those who had retweeted, shared or cascaded the job advertisements. As a result 3 of the 4 positions had been filled with some very good candidates applying. One of the posts had now completed their security clearances while the other two were in the pipeline.
- ) As noted in the Chairman's introductory remarks, Commander Ken Dyke would be retiring from Vulcan this Friday. Commander Shaun Southwood, sitting in the audience, would be taking on this role and would attend sub group meetings to provide updates. Commander Shaun Southwood noted that at present there was nothing of significance to report.

Tor Justad asked whether it was likely that the DNSR report would be available for the next sub group meeting. Wendy Newton reported that she would expect to see something reported in the next written update.

Eann Sinclair noted that three of the four vacancies had been filled and asked whether MOD were still actively looking for a candidate for the 4<sup>th</sup> position. Wendy Newton responded that they had been unsuccessful in identifying a suitable candidate for the Waste Manager position and it was going to be re-advertised. It was likely that further positions would be required as the MOD look to increase their numbers of the Vulcan site into next year.

## 9. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

Roger Saxon invited members of the public to raise any issues. No questions were raised.

## 10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Before opening up to members, Roger Saxon noted the following:

- ) Prior to this meeting, NHS had requested some time on the agenda to provide the redesign presentation. As the agenda was already quite full it had been agreed not to agree to this request. However, he noted that it was important for the future of the area that good health provision was in place. He asked members whether they had an appetite to hold a stand-alone presentation with the NHS or to respond to NHS



consultation direct. It was agreed that the DSG secretary would solicit member's preferences before finalising any arrangements.

Action: DSG(2018)M003/A033: June Love to email DSG members to explore appetite for NHS presentation or response to consultation information.

- J Derrick Milnes and David Flear had attended the NDA Stakeholder Summit in Berkeley along with June, Anna MacConnell and Phil Cartwright. Following on from this DSG wrote to Bill Hamilton to request that the next stakeholder summit be held in Caithness. Bill has responded saying that they are considering a number of venues and would get back in due course.
- J Derrick Milnes and David Flear had attended a stakeholder dinner with a Japanese delegation on 19<sup>th</sup> July. There appeared to be a lot of interest from the Japanese on decommissioning and more importantly on community engagement. With that in mind, the NDA has extended a dinner invitation on the 12 September to meet with the Japanese Parliamentary Vice-minister who is keen to learn about decommissioning but is also interested in meeting with community representatives.

Roger Saxon invited member to raise any other business.

- J Tor Justad noted that he had also attended the NDA stakeholder summit and was there as a NGO. He had noted an interesting comment by DSG members that there appeared to be a missed opportunity for the SSG chair's forum who had met with no agenda or paperwork. Those NGOs present at the event had also felt there was a missed opportunity in that there was no real opportunity for people to question the nuclear industry and appeared to be a series of glossy presentations with speakers who were quite obviously pro-nuclear. He also felt that the socio economic information was somewhat limited. He added that he would be feeding these comments back to NDA.
- J Ron Gunn noted the discussion around the NHS redesign consultation and emphasised the need for a good local health service. He felt it was good that the NHS was working hard to get feedback and stated that this was a unique opportunity to take local opinion into account. He encouraged members to get involved and input into this consultation.

Before closing, Roger Saxon acknowledged that this was likely to be Phil Craig's last DSG meeting. He asked that it be placed on record DSG's thanks to Phil for his continued commitment to DSG and community engagement during his three years as Managing Director. He thanked Phil for his honesty and commitment during his time at Dounreay and wished him well for the future. Roger added that he hoped that Phil would now always carry a little bit of Caithness with him as he moves into a new chapter of his career and hoped that he could look back at this time here with some fond memories of what he achieved in his time on the site. Roger then presented Phil Craig with a small token of DSG's appreciation.

Phil Craig thanked Roger for his kind words and for the gift presented to him. He stated that he could honestly say this was the best job he has had in his career and he was extremely

proud of how everyone had stepped up to make the site a successful decommissioning site, the way the teams have worked and have engaged with DSG. He added he had enjoyed Ronnie Johnston's pushing on socio economics and was extremely proud that this was now starting to show benefit through the site's contracts. He acknowledged Tor's challenge on fuel transport and noted that it was always interesting taking questions from members of the public. As a UK taxpayer the importance of DSG as a body holding the site to account in a fair and transparent way could not be understated even if there had been some interesting times. He thanked DSG members for their involvement.

There being no further business, Roger Saxon thanked everyone for attending and formally closed the meeting.

Roger Saxon  
DSG Chairman  
8<sup>th</sup> September 2018

#### ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING

DSG(2018)M003/A001: Roger Saxon to write, on behalf of DSG, to thank Roy Kirk for his involvement with DSG and to congratulate him on his new position as Director of Space.

DSG(2018)M003/A002: Roger Saxon to write, on behalf of DSG, to thank Cdr Ken Dyke for his input into DSG.

DSG(2018)M003/A003: Mark Raffle to explore as to whether UK Government retained evidence of business benefit for business visits to the UK.

DSG(2018)M003/A004: Phil Craig, Dounreay MD to provide information on levels of contamination with regards regulation.

DSG(2018)M003/A005: June Love to contact David Lowe to request that any impact on staffing resources identified in the new decommissioning plan is communicated in a timely manner.

DSG(2018)M003/A006: June Love to request a meeting with Phil Craig and his successor at the earliest opportunity.

DSG(2018)M003/A007: June Love to draft letter on behalf of DSG Chairman to send to NDA requesting that the next stakeholder summit be held in Caithness.

DSG(2018)M003/A008: June Love to co-ordinate meeting with DSG Socio Economic sub group chair and deputy chair along with Anna MacConnell and Eann Sinclair to discuss pipeline projects.

DSG(2018)M003/A009: June Love to finalise DSG response to STEM consultation and submit before the 17<sup>th</sup> August 2018.

DSG(2018)M003/A010: June Love to clarify with SSG Chair's forum their thoughts on website hosting for SSG information.

DSG(2018)M003/A011: June Love to record the history of the chair/vice-chair's emolument and decisions made to share these costs with sub group chairs.

DSG(2018)M003/A012: Cllr Struan Mackie to discuss with The Highland Council requirements for planning applications relating to NDA funding.

DSG(2018)M003/A013: Bill Hamilton to provide a written response to DSG letter regarding clarity around NDA socio economic spend by 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2018.

DSG(2018)M003/A014: June Love to send David Swanson contact details for Phil Cartwright to discuss social media for Community Sports Hub.

DSG(2018)M003/A015: June Love to write to CNSRP Programme Manager asking for an update on progress with Wick harbour high water gate with regards funding from HIE.

DSG(2018)M003/A016: Cllr Struan Mackie to find out how much of the City Region Deal (£370M) had been spent (or earmarked) outside of Inverness.

DSG(2018)M003/A017: All DSG members to provide comment/additions to the DSG response to STEM engagement across the NDA estate.

DSG(2018)M003/A018: David Lowe to provide a simple A3/A4 page highlighting key milestone dates for delivery of site decommissioning to interim end state based on the SWI-R BCP once accepted by NDA.

DSG(2018)M003/A019: DSG to write to DRS to ask for an update on the incident reported in July 2018 when a DRS train went through the red signal.

DSG(2018)M003/A020: Mark Raffle to speak to DRS with reference to information on the DRS incident in July being reported factually.

DSG(2018)M003/A021: June Love to circulate website link to members for GRR regulations.

DSG(2018)M003/A022: David Lowe to clarify the recent change of guarding arrangements for the Fuel Cycle Area.

DSG(2018)M003/A023: Sam Usher to ask for Chapelcross examples of low level waste treatment and transfers.

DSG(2018)M003/A024: June Love to include waste and interim end state presentations on the agenda for the September DSG public meeting.

DSG(2018)M003/A025: DSG to write to Cdr Ken Dyke thanking him for his involvement.

DSG(2018)M003/A026: June Love to circulate the letter received from Rolls Royce.

DSG(2018)M003/A027: June Love to contact John Hook to confirm when intakes of apprentices will cease.

DSG(2018)M003/A028: June Love to provide correspondence DSG(2018)C021: BEIS workshop, Edinburgh 6<sup>th</sup> June to Buldoo Residents Group.

DSG(2018)M003/A029: June Love to change the wording from High Activity waste to Higher Activity waste in DSG(2018)C025.

DSG(2018)M003/A030: June Love to provide DSG(2018)C025: DSG response to BEIS consultation on regulation of sites in final stages of decommissioning and clean-up to Buldoo Residents Group.

DSG(2018)M003/A031: June Love to circulate the link to the consultation on protecting the public from radioactive contamination in land, how to improve the protection of the public in contamination in land.

DSG(2018)M003/A032: Sam Usher to provide information on tritiated wastes.

DSG(2018)M003/A033: June Love to email DSG members to explore appetite for NHS presentation or response to consultation information.

#### ACTIONS ONGOING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

DSG(2018)M001/A001: Wendy Newton to present the options for the future of the Vulcan site to the Site Restoration sub group meeting in January 2019.

DSG(2018)M001/A009: June Love to write to The Safety Assessment Federation (SaFed) regarding the Vulcan boiler incident. Action ongoing: correspondence sent on 1<sup>st</sup> May – response awaited and chased again.

DSG(2018)M004/A011: June Love to request a meeting with Alan Cummings and DSG members when next visiting the Dounreay site. Action ongoing: Request made to NDA on 5<sup>th</sup> July 2018.

DSG(2018)M004/A012: June Love to respond on behalf of DSG to Rick Wylie, Lancaster University, requesting further information on the research he wished to undertake with DSG involvement. Action ongoing: Further information was received from Rick Wylie on 17<sup>th</sup> August. This will be further discussed at the Business meeting to agree a way forward.

#### ACTIONS COMPLETED SINCE LAST MEETING

DSG(2018)M001/A014: June Love to invite Chairman of Community Sports Hub to provide an update on the Community Sports Hub at the next Socio Economic sub group meeting. Action complete: Chair of CSH could not attend meeting on 8<sup>th</sup> May. An update was received however action ongoing to invite Chair to next sub group to provide an overview of the whole project as this appears to have changed following funding discussions. Item on agenda for meeting to be held on 25<sup>th</sup> July 2018.

DSG(2018)M004/A001: Wendy Newton to send June Love website links on MOD recruitment activities for Vulcan. Action complete: <https://www.civilservicejobs.service.gov.uk>. Three MoD jobs at Vulcan NRTE are advertised on Civil Service job website: A Project Manager to lead the Decommissioning project <https://www.civilservicejobs.service.gov.uk/> Two engineers, one for Nuclear Waste and Decommissioning the second within the MoD operations oversight team <https://www.civilservicejobs.service.gov.uk/>

DSG(2018)M004/A002: June Love to request information from Dounreay on total number agency workers leaving. Action complete: The reduction of agency workers was dependent on the completion of the Exotics programme as those being released from this programme would have been used to backfill vacant positions still required. Since the Exotic programme continues ASW have been utilised to backfill the vacant posts and will continue to do so until DSRL staff are released.

DSG(2018)M004/A003: Derrick Milnes to write to Anna MacConnell asking for a timeline for the actions to be delivered. Action complete. All actions now closed out.

DSG(2018)M004/A004: June Love to investigate the format of the CNSRP, NDA and Dounreay socio economic presentation at the next DSG public meeting (June 2018). Action complete: presentation took place at DSG public meeting on 13<sup>th</sup> June 2018.

DSG(2018)M004/A005: DSG Socio economic sub group members to provide any additional questions or comments on socio economic activities. Action complete.

DSG(2018)M004/A006: : June Love to collate all questions/comments raised regarding socio economic activity and draft response. Draft response would be tabled at DSG business meeting for discussion and agreement. Action complete: discussed and final letter agreed.

DSG(2018)M004/A007: DSG Socio Economic sub group to provide any comments on the Dounreay Socio Economic Plan 2018/19–2021/22 by the 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2018. Action complete: no comments received.

DSG(2018)M004/A008: June Love to contact Craig Brown regarding Caithness Horizons museum status with the recent loss of CH curator. Action complete: Caithness Horizons has maintained its museum status. The appointment of the curator 2 days per month allows this status to be maintained.

DSG(2018)M004/A009: June Love to ask Phil Cartwright, Chair of CSH to provide a full update of the CSH project at the next sub group meeting. Action complete: on agenda for 25<sup>th</sup> July 2018

DSG(2018)M004/A010: – June Love to include visits in the comments currently being collated. Action complete.

DSG(2018)M004/A013: Trudy Morris to provide an update from DRS or HiTrans on the commercial freight trial that was due to be undertaken in March 2018. Action complete: update from DRS provided via Caithness Transport Forum and circulated to members early June.

DSG(2018)M004/A014: David Lowe to provide information on the different categories of particles (minor, relevant, significant). Action complete: The Dounreay Particles Advisory Group’s Third report classified particles as:

**Dounreay Particles Advisory Group (DPAG) – classification of particles**

<b>Significant</b>	<b>Caesium 137 activity greater than 1,000,000 Bq</b>	<b>Likely to cause serious ulceration (visible after 1-2 weeks). This may take several weeks to heal along with the associated risk of infection which might require medical treatment.</b>
<b>Relevant</b>	<b>Caesium 137 activity between 100,000 and 1,000,000 Bq</b>	<b>Would require a minimum of 7 hours stationary contact with the skin to have any discernable effect. Indeed, time periods of 1-2 days would be required for any reddening with small lesion of the skin to be observed. The affected area of skin would be expected to heal completely within 2-4 weeks without further problems. Anyone coming into contact with this type of particle is unlikely to experience any observable effects.</b>
<b>Minor</b>	<b>Caesium 137 activity less than 100,000 Bq</b>	<b>Will not cause discernable health effects.</b>

DSG(2018)M004/A015: DSG members to read and provide comments to June Love on SEPA’s consultation on draft standard conditions for radioactive substances authorisation. Action complete: consultation closed.

DSG(2018)M004/A016: Roger Saxon to distribute any additional information to DSG members on the consultation of regulation of nuclear sites in the final stages of decommissioning and clean-up. Action complete – information provided to all DSG members along with draft consultation response for additional input.

DSG(2018)M004/A017: DSG Site Restoration sub group members to provide any comments on the consultation of the regulation of nuclear sites in the final stages of decommissioning and clean up. Action complete: See DSG(2018)C025 for DSG response.

DSG(2018)M004/A018: David Lowe to provide a simple bar chart of key projects with indicative delivery dates. Action Complete. David Lowe commented that he has provided the current 'plan on a page' (simplified high level schedule) and identified what the closure mission was to achieve the interim end state. It generally lines up with what would be provided to the NDA next week providing information on the site wide impact. The plan had been divided into major project directorates. The BCP on site wide impacts described the impacts on the contract baseline due to the exotics programme, and this would be issued to the NDA. From there it would go through a NDA review and approval process. In parallel, site management will be looking at the performance plan and considering other aspects; including changes to decommissioning approaches and future opportunities to allow the achievement of the interim end state. The performance plan should be in

place in January 2019 and following this a more definitive schedule with interim end state dates will be provided to DSG. David Lowe intimated that there needed to be a clear understanding that the schedule would remain fluid.

DSG(2018)M004/A019: : Stewart Ballantine to provide an update on SEPA's Habitat Survey. Action complete: Work is progressing to collect the data for the habitat survey. In addition, an open afternoon will be held in Reay Village Hall on Saturday 7<sup>th</sup> July (which will be during Strathclyde's fieldwork survey period). Local adverts will be published.

DSG(2018)M004/A020: DSG members to consider whether additional engagement with ONR would be useful. Action complete: Member views were that there is adequate engagement with ONR at present via DSG and sub group meetings, recognising that if there was a specific topic that required fuller detail then a request would be made for further engagement.

DSG(2018)M004/A021: Cdr Ken Dyke to provide information on the surplus housing due to be auctioned shortly. Action complete: As discussed at yesterday's DSG's sub group, please find the link to the MoD houses which are being auctioned on 6th June 2018. <https://onlineauction.lsh.co.uk/search>

DSG(2018)M004/A022: June Love to contact John Hook, Rolls Royce to find out when their recruitment will cease in this area and how many apprentices have been recruited in the last 4 years. Action completed: We have recruited 16 apprentices at our Vulcan Business Unit as part of the overall Company scheme over the last 4 years (intake 4 / year). A total of 16 Rolls-Royce apprentices continue in training at Vulcan at any one time. This continues and indeed 4 new apprentices join and start careers with the Company at Vulcan in September 2018.

DSG(2018)M004/A023: Stewart Ballantine to provide a link to the SEPA sector plan consultations. Action complete: Following last night meeting please find below link to the SEPA sector plan consultations for onward circulation to members. <https://consultation.sepa.org.uk/communications/sector-approach-to-regulation-consultations-on-sco/>

DSG(2018)M004/A024: David Lowe to find out if there are any implications for Dounreay with the change of ONR's enforcement management model. Action complete: At the DSG public meeting held on 13<sup>th</sup> June, Danny Gregory (ONR Site Inspector) confirmed that there would be no impact to the site as the model had been changed to reflect the way in which ONR already regulates and means no impact to the site.

DSG(2018)M004/A025: June Love to make changes to the socio economic letter for the chair to sign off. Action complete.

DSG(2018)M004/A026: June Love to write to NHS representative re sub group role/remit in relation to attending alternative sub group. Action complete.

DSG(2018)M004/A027: June Love to invite deputy sub group chairs to future business meetings. Action complete.

DSG(2018)M004/A028: June Love to circulate Caithness Transport Forum paperwork to members seeking any

discussion at the June DSG. Stage Coach have now confirmed that the current contract does not specifically refer to coaches rather than buses however the individual services have strictly defined seating capacity requirements. As a result the only way Stage Coach can practically deliver the required minimum seating capacity on several of the services is by using coaches. Stage Coach team is in the process of reviewing the capacity requirements for each route with Dounreay with a view to matching SC capacity supply with demand on each route. This may result in some changes to the vehicles operating on the Dounreay services.

DSG(2018)M004/A032: June Love to provide information on Dounreay bus contract to Caithness Transport Forum to clarify again that coaches were not a stipulation in the contract. Action complete: Information passed to Caithness Transport Forum at end of June 2018.