

**DOUNREAY STAKEHOLDER GROUP**

**Minutes of the DSG meeting held on Wednesday 13<sup>th</sup> March 2019 at 700pm in the Pentland Hotel (Ballroom), Thurso.**

<b>Present:</b>	Roger Saxon	DSG Chair
	Cllr Struan Mackie	Highland Council (DSG Vice-chair)
	Cllr Willie Mackay	Highland Council (Site Restoration sub group chair)
	Davie Alexander	Thurso & Wick TU Council (Socio economic sub group chair)
	Cllr Matthew Reiss	Highland Council
	Gillian Coghill	Independent chair, Buldoo Residents Groups
	David Broughton	Co-opted member of the public
	Tor Justad	Co-opted member of the public
	Ronnie Johnstone	Church of Scotland
	George McDougall	Caithness West Community Council
	Alastair MacDonald	DSG, Honorary member
	David Flear	DSG, Honorary member
	Bob Earnshaw	DSG, Honorary member
	Sand Owsnett	Dounreay Unions
	Thelma Mackenzie	Thurso Community Council
	Derrick Milnes	Co-opted member of the public
	Ron Gunn	CHAT
	Roy Blackburn	Co-opted member of the public
	Trudy Morris	Caithness Chamber of Commerce
	Eann Sinclair	HIE/CNSRP
	Linda Bremner	Association of Caithness Community Councils
<b>In addition:</b>	June Love	DSG Secretariat, DSRL
	Mark Raffle	NDA, Lead Programme Manager
	David Lowe	Deputy Managing Director, Dounreay
	Stewart Ballantine	SEPA
	Danny Gregory	ONR
	Cdr Shaun Southwood	MOD (Vulcan)
	Supt Martin O’Kane	CNC

**MINUTES**

**1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS**

Roger Saxon welcomed everyone to the meeting. He stated that the Annual General Meeting had just been held and for those who had not attended, he had been re-elected as chair for a further term. The following office bearers were also elected:

- Vice-chair: Cllr Struan Mackie
- Socio Economic sub group chair: David Alexander
- Site Restoration sub group chair: Cllr Willie Mackay

After agreement at the AGM, Derrick Milnes who had stepped down as Vice-chair and Socio Economic Sub Group Chair has been given a co-opted member of the public role. Roger Saxon stated that Derrick had worked tirelessly for the DSG since it started in 2005 and this was in

recognition of the many years he has been involved, allows some continuity going forward and also allows ensures that the numerous contacts Derrick has remains to provide support.

Before moving on, Roger Saxon placed on record his thanks to all those DSG members who had stepped down and to those still present for their support, input and commitment to DSG.

Roger Saxon welcomed to Ian Rogers, ONR who would be taking over from Danny Gregory as the lead site inspector for Dounreay and would also have a role as ONR regulator for Vulcan. He also noted that David Lowe, Deputy MD, was standing in for Martin Moore at this meeting but that this would be his last involvement with DSG as his secondment period at Dounreay had come to an end. Roger Saxon thanked both Danny Gregory (ONR) and David Lowe (Dounreay) for their involvement in DSG and wished them well for the future.

Before moving on, Roger Saxon thanked MOD who had agreed to pay for the room hire and coffees for this meeting as part of their commitment to DSG.

## **2. APOLOGIES**

Apologies were received from:

- Cllr Kirsteen Currie
- Cllr Stephen Clackson
- Brian Mutch, SGRIPD
- Murray Lamont
- Martin Moore, Dounreay Managing Director (David Lowe deputising)
- Wendy Newton, MOD Vulcan (Cdr Shaun Southwood deputising)
- Sandy Mackie
- Donald MacBeath
- James Bryson

## **3. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

Roger Saxon noted that the minutes of the last meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> December had been circulated to members in advance of the meeting – DSG(2018)M003 refers. He invited comments from members. No amendments were tabled and the minutes were accepted as a true reflection of the meeting. This was proposed by Cllr Willie Mackay and seconded by Derrick Milnes.

Before moving on, Roger Saxon invited members to raise any topics from the minutes. The following was discussed:

- Tor Justad asked about the latest status of the DRS Geogemas trials. Roger Saxon noted that this had been mentioned at the Caithness Transport Forum held last week. Trudy Morris responded that an update had been received from DRS who had recognised the delays following their commitment last March but were pleased to advise that the equipment to facilitate this trial was now in place, the new equipment had arrived at the railhead and an initial trial would take place shortly. A further trial would follow and DRS intended to invite a number of stakeholders to view this. Mark Raffle added that the equipment had been successfully tested today and the full trial with locomotive would take place within the next few months.
- Tor Justad noted the North Highland College (NHC) update and had been surprised that it did not include any nuclear decommissioning course. No-one from NHC was in attendance to respond and therefore David Lowe responded that DSRL continued to work with NHC and were looking at various opportunities. At this time they were in discussions relating to a safety case course.

Regular meetings continued to be held to discuss potential opportunities. In addition, the site's apprentices attended ETEC as part of their apprenticeship training. On-site training continued and the discussions with the NHC were in relation to the future requirements for Dounreay and beyond.

Following on from Tor's questions, David Flear stated that he was aware there were courses being developed in Forres in relation to space and wondered whether the NHC were also exploring this. June Love noted that meetings had been held between HIE and NHC to discuss potential training opportunities around the space industry.

- Tor Justad noted the update on the Cavendish Dounreay Partnership nuclear services project and asked what this was. David Lowe responded that, while at an early stage, it was currently being explored as to whether an engineering hub could be established in Caithness to service other parts of the UK with engineering services. This could be a mixture of nuclear and non-nuclear work. This project was at a very early stage with discussions ongoing with NDA.

#### 4. ACTION STATUS

Roger Saxon noted that members had received an update on the status of actions. He stated he did not propose to go through these actions as the majority were now complete with sub group actions being progressed. He invited members to raise anything of interest.

- David Flear noted there had been an action on Cllr Willie Mackay to raise the City Region Deal at the next HC Caithness Ward business meeting. Cllr Willie Mackay confirmed this had been done and there was a willingness to look at taking this forward.

#### 5. DOUNREAY UPDATES

Roger Saxon noted a number of written reports had been provided at both the Site Restoration and Socio Economic sub group meetings. The papers provided were:

DSG(2018)P031	DNSR update, October 2018
DSG(2019)P001	ONR report for Dounreay
DSG(2019)P002	Dounreay Socio economic report, January 2019
DSG(2019)P003	Dounreay site update, January 2019
DSG(2019)P004	SEPA progress report, January 2019
DSG(2019)P005	Rolls Royce update, January 2019
DSG(2019)P006	Vulcan update report, January 2019
DSG(2019)P007	CNSRP update, January 2019
DSG(2019)P008	Vulcan ONR report - October to December 2018

Before moving on, Roger Saxon noted that this year it was expected that the Halliday enquiry into the NDA Magnox contract would conclude. In addition it was expected that the new decommissioning plan for Dounreay, alongside the people resource plan, would be developed and provide some clarity on taking the site to its interim end state. These would be some of the topics that the DSG would be interested to learn more about during the year.

Roger Saxon also stated that Dounreay was going through an organisation restructure and again DSG would look forward to seeing this in more detail once finalised.

He noted that member were in receipt of the draft minutes of the last sub group meetings and suggested that members raise any topics from the minutes during the relevant verbal updates. He invited the following to provide verbal updates:

**NDA Update:** Mark Raffle, NDA Lead Programme Manager reported:

- The NDA had now appointed Tony Perry to the post of NDA Head of Programme. He would start in April 2019 and would be looking to meet with stakeholders at the earliest opportunity. He had over 40 years' experience and his background included some nuclear and non-nuclear experience.
- The consultation on the draft NDA business plan had now concluded. The DSG submission had been received and a response would be provided shortly.
- NDA were sponsoring the Mey Invictus Games this year. These games had been trialled in 2018 and had been expanded following the success of last year. NDA had provided sponsorship under an EDI (Equality, Diversity and Inclusiveness) sponsorship scheme.
- NDA were also sponsoring the Women in Nuclear Highland event which was being held on 28<sup>th</sup> March 2019 in Nucleus.
- Rick Wylie, Lancaster University had carried out a survey on Nucleus as part of his research into public value. Thanks were provided to all those who had responded to the electronic questionnaire and David Flear, the nominated DSG representative for Nucleus, had represented DSG views. Rick Wylie would be visiting Nucleus on the 15<sup>th</sup> April where he would outline the output from this research.

Roger Saxon invited members to raise any questions.

- Trudy Morris asked what progress had been made on the decommissioning framework contracts as last time this had been discussed it had been estimated that these would be finalised around March/April 2019. Mark Raffle stated that the case was going to the next NDA Sanction Committee within the week and dependent on how this went it would be submitted to the NDA Board for approval. Trudy Morris asked when this was likely to be taken to the Board. Mark Raffle responded that it would be April 2019 at the earliest.
- Cllr Willie Mackay noted the NDA's sponsorship of the Mey Games and welcomed this support stating he was a trustee of the games. He noted that this year there were competitors coming from all over the world and the funding provided by the NDA had been very much appreciated.
- David Flear asked whether the NDA had any interaction with MOD/Vulcan over the future of the Vulcan Site and its' eventual end state. Mark Raffle stated NDA were in dialogue with MOD, but it was for MOD to lead any discussions. Therefore, any interaction on the Vulcan site should be directly with MOD. David Flear noted that he had asked the question to enquire whether NDA could take the points being made regarding community involvement into the future options of the site back to MOD. Mark Raffle responded that he thought that DSG had already made their feelings clear with MOD on this.

Roger Saxon thanked Mark Raffle for his input and passed on to David Lowe for an update on the Dounreay site.

**Dounreay update:** David Lowe, Dounreay Deputy Managing Director, reported:

- While this was a topic that continued to be discussed at DSG, road safety continues to be a safety focus on the site. All Project Directors were requested to speak to their staff and

reinforce the very clear expectation that people drive to the appropriate standard, both on the site and in the community.

- During the cold snap, a scaffolder lost his footing on a ladder and fell back. Luckily, he is making a full recovery but it was an example of how easily someone can get injured and the need to constantly be on guard. The site management recognise that there are a number of projects coming up in the next few years that will see the use of scaffolding increase, so the site is working with supply chain partners and have asked a consultant to review the arrangements in place to provide assurance that best practice is being utilised. This was the first lost time accident to occur in more than a year and was a meaningful reminder of the need to stay focused and achieve zero harm.
- There was a newspaper article last week about particles. It related to the unusual particle found in 2016 that had been discussed several times at DSG meetings and was first reported in the press around a year ago. The next phase of testing the particle was underway and an update would be provided to the sub group when it becomes available.
- The site is working towards ensuring compliance with the two new EASR18 (Environmental Authorisation Scotland Regulations 2018) environmental permits that will be issued on 1 April 2019. An implementation plan is underway.
- On the people front, the site was delighted to hear that Phil Craig, former Managing Director, was named 'Ally of the Year' at the Women in Nuclear UK awards. This recognised the efforts of the workforce in the last few years to focus on equality, diversity and inclusion.
- Along with every other large business in the country, DSRL are now required to publish details of the gender pay gap annually. Last year DSRL had one of the smallest gender pay gaps in the NDA estate and it is expected that our second report will be released at the end of March 2019. While reducing the gap to zero is a long-term programme, the results of some of our early work is starting to show.
- Many members of Dounreay's Women's Network have been involved in launching a Highlands branch of Women in Nuclear UK. Other organisations, such as Vulcan and many supply chain businesses are also involved and there will be more information shared when the branch is launched at the end of the month.
- On the recruitment front, the deadline for this year's graduate recruitment was this Friday. Details on how to apply are on the recruitment pages of the website.
- As noted earlier, plans to make some changes to the executive team is underway. There will be no impact to the community engagement with the site. The re-organisation will group together more of the decommissioning projects to try and take the 'One Dounreay' approach to the next level where the workforce can share, learn and co-ordinate better across the site. More focus will also be placed on strategy, both in terms of decommissioning delivery and in people

resource. Currently, the appropriate approvals and consents are being sought and the aim is to have the structure in place from April 2019.

- Progress continues with breeder fuel being removed from DFR. A spent fuel transport flask, which was consigned as empty at Sellafield and returned to Dounreay, was recently found to contain a small amount of metallic debris. The flask is specifically designed to safely transport spent fuel and therefore there was no risk to the environment or the public. Regulators were informed and Sellafield is investigating.
- Previous sub group meetings had received updated from Sam Usher, Waste Project Director about a project looking at the feasibility of sending some larger bulk items of metal waste for recycling, which is a widely accepted as good environment practice. A contract had now been awarded to Cyclife (part of EDF) to carry out a feasibility study. As part of this study, there are plans to undertake an initial trial with 4 items of metal waste sent off site to be recycled. The items selected for the trial present a very low radiological challenge and these trials will support the understanding and underpin the process. Different options were considered for this trial and the most effective option is to move the 4 items to Cyclife's facility in Workington by lorry. From there, 3 of the items will be transported to their leading recycling plant in Sweden for treatment with the remaining item treated in Workington. This process is similar to many other sites, including one of NDA's other Scottish sites at Chapelcross. It is expected that the outcome of the feasibility study will be complete within the next 3 months and DSG members will be kept updated on progress.
- Updates at the sub group meeting on the implementation of GRR and the end state had continued with Adreain Gill, Interim End State Delivery Manager providing updates. Earlier this month, at the request of NDA, the site held a series of workshops looking at unconstrained end state. Updates to DSG will be provided once further information is available.
- The contractors responsible for the construction of the DCP store extension and DMTR demolition have now arrived on site and are setting up their teams. DSRL is also in the final stages of sanction for the decommissioning services framework and are hopeful that an announcement of the outcome can be made soon.
- From a socio economic point of view it was disappointing to read about the demise of Caithness Horizons. The Dounreay site has proudly supported the Caithness Horizons Board since its creation and despite agreeing to continue match funding for the next three years, the challenges faced by the Board to cover increasing costs and be sustainable was recognised. Discussions are ongoing between CH Board Chairman, DSRL and Highland Council to consider options going forward.
- The Dounreay Socio-Economic Board met recently and looked at the Dounreay Communities Fund which had £20,000 per year funding allocated to small community projects managed by the Dounreay Stakeholder Group. It was recognised that it had been a few years since this budget was set and a decision was made to increase the annual funding to £25,000. Full details about what is supported and how to apply is available on the website.

Before concluding, David Lowe noted, as mentioned earlier, this would be his final meeting of the DSG having completed his 3+ years secondment to the site later this month. He would be returning to the US. He stated that he had enjoyed the opportunity to meet and interact with the sub group, as well as the main meetings, and thanked DSG members for their constructive dialogue and support over the years. Due to the ongoing management restructure the Dounreay representative would not be direct replacement for the role of Deputy MD but the Business Services Director would pick up many of his responsibilities. As soon as the representative for the sub group was identified DSG would be informed.

Roger Saxon thanked David Lowe for his update and invited questions from DSG members.

- Tor Justad enquired about the metallic debris found in the container which had been transported from Sellafield asking if Sellafield Ltd would be conducting an investigation. If an investigation was undertaken he queried how long it would take and whether the outcome would be publicly available. David Lowe responded that it was small amount of material found where Dounreay took receipt of the container and this was immediately reported to the regulators and to Sellafield. He believed that Sellafield had already launched an investigation. Tor repeated his question as to when the investigation would be finalised, and would the outcome be made publicly available.

**Action: DSG(2019)M001/A001: Mark Raffle, NDA to provide a response as to whether there was a timeline for Sellafield Ltd to complete its investigation into the findings of low contaminated debris being found in the container that was transported to Dounreay and to also confirm whether this would be publicly available.**

- Tor Justad noted that the feasibility study and trial for the recycling of large pieces of low level contaminated wastes from Dounreay and asked whether the trial had been successful. David Lowe noted that transportation of the waste had not yet started. Tor Justad noted that this material would be transported by road and asked whether any additional security arrangements were required noting that this was a new method of transport opening up alongside sea, air and rail. David Lowe responded that he was unable to discuss anything which related to security of radioactive material. He did state that LLWR (near Drigg) was responsible for the transport and waste from Dounreay to the Cyclife facilities, and that it would be conducted in a fully compliant manner to the applicable regulations. David Lowe indicated that an update would be available at the next sub group meeting.

**Action: DSG(2019)M001/A002: Sam Usher, Waste Project Director, to provide an update on the recycling of large low level contaminated waste for the next DSG Site Restoration sub group meeting.**

Roger Saxon noted that this was bulk equipment with small amounts of contamination but large quantities of steel. David Lowe responded that this was correct adding that it provided an opportunity to provide more effective use of the low-level waste vaults instead of large pieces taking up large volumes of the vaults in relation to small amounts of radioactivity. These trials if proved could be beneficial.

- Tor Justad enquired about the conditions placed on the site's phase 3 planning. David Lowe responded that a number of the conditions were related to ensuring that prior to site construction (as an example of the shaft and silo) notification to the HC would be provided. Other conditions were tied to specific projects and milestones.

- Gillian Coghill noted that it had been a pleasure working with David Lowe over the past three years and wished him good luck with his new post. Gillian went on to ask whether the first block in D1217 had now been cut. David Lowe responded that there had been some difficulty with the sub-contractor and therefore the contractor had been changed which had caused some delays. Therefore at this time the work was not yet complete.
- Cllr Struan Mackie thanked David Lowe for his services to the site and to the DSG. In relation to the Dounreay Communities Fund, he welcomed the increase in funding in the strongest possible terms, given that not only was the site committing to maintaining the fund but had agreed to increase it and this could not have happened at a more welcome time.
- David Broughton noted that with the proposed restructuring of the site management it appeared there was a renewed interest in strategy. He asked whether all the materials and waste now on site had a defined route. David Lowe noted that some strategic decisions were made in relation to the NDA's strategy and this continued to be a topic of discussion across the whole of the NDA estate. The Dounreay site management, on a regular basis, go through the status in relation to certain types of materials. For the most part there was a final disposition identified but the 'how' was still being developed.
- Tor Justad noted that in the Site Restoration sub group minutes no waste had been disposed of in the LLW vaults for some time. David Lowe confirmed this was correct as the site was currently ensuring the quality of records and characterisation of the fingerprints. Once this quality work had been completed it was expected that the facility will be compliant against its authorisation to receive waste for disposal. The site was working with SEPA prior to disposing of waste into the vaults to ensure all processes were robust. Bob Earnshaw asked that an update on low level waste disposals in the new vaults be provided at the next sub group meeting.

**Action: DSG(2019)M001/A003: Sam Usher to provide an update on the new LLW vaults at the next site restoration sub group meeting.**

Following on from Tor Justad's comment, David Flear stated that he believed there was some waste material that did not conform to the Scottish Government's Higher Activity Waste policy and it would be interesting to understand the extent of this.

Roger Saxon thanked David Lowe for his update and invited ONR to provide their update.

**ONR:** Danny Gregory, Site Inspector, reported the following:

- The written report provided at the sub group set out the routine inspections being carried out.
- ONR were reviewing the proposals for the site management restructuring with a specific emphasis on compliance with Licence Condition 35. At present DSRL were undertaking its own due process and these proposals would come to ONR for approval.

Roger Saxon thanked Danny Gregory and invited questions from members.

- Sand Owsnett asked if there had been a positive outcome of the Annual Review of Safety. Danny Gregory responded that meeting would take place the following day.



- Tor Justad noted there had been a suggestion of an ONR presentation at DSG. Danny Gregory responded that ONR would be happy to provide a presentation at one of the public meetings. June Love noted that this would be programmed in for a future meeting following discussion at the Business meeting.

There being no further questions for ONR, Roger Saxon handed over the Stewart Ballantine, SEPA.

**SEPA:** Stewart Ballantine, SEPA reported:

- The update from Dounreay had covered most of SEPA interactions.
- The new Environmental Authorisation (Scotland) Regulations 2018 (EASR18) came into force in September 2018 and replaces the Radioactive Substances Act (RSA). The existing RSA Authorisations for the Dounreay Site and D3100 LLWF were transferred under the EASR18 Regulations and will come into effect at the end of March. There would be no additional burden on the site to comply with these regulations.
- The consultation on the Nuclear sector plan had now closed and it was noted that DSG had submitted a formal response to that consultation.
- On the LLW metal transport trials, SEPA have been in discussion with the site on this and will provide further detail at the sub-group meeting.

Roger Saxon thanked David Broughton, DSG co-opted member for his involvement in drafting the DSG response to SEPA's nuclear sector plan. He then invited questions on SEPA's update.

- Tor Justad asked whether there was any new information on the HEPA filters. Stewart Ballantine noted that the final warning letter had been the end point of SEPA's enforcement action. DSRL had now replaced all filters that were over 10 years old and a programme was now in place to ensure these were replaced at an appropriate time going forward. SEPA had reached the end point of this with the final warning letter and this issue would now revert back into the regulator site inspections.
- Gillian Coghill noted SEPA's Nuclear Sector Plan and felt that this would be a useful document, adding that it was essential to have strong regulators to ensure the NDA and Dounreay were kept on their toes.

There being no further questions for SEPA, Roger Saxon handed over to Superintendent Martin O'Kane.

Supt Martin O'Kane, CNC noted the following:

- DCC Simon Chesterman QPM had been appointed as the CNC Chief Constable and will take up his appointment in April. He will visit Dounreay in May.
- CNC continue to work with partner agencies across a number of initiatives.
- A number of local incidents had been supported by CNC on behalf of Police Scotland. This had included a couple of road traffic accidents where CNC provided initial support to individuals until Police Scotland had been in a position to take over.

- Continued to support MOD and the MDP at Vulcan.

Roger Saxon then invited questions from members.

- Cllr Matthew Reiss stated that he continued to lobby for traffic camera vans to be positioned in Caithness locations. Since the last meeting there had been discussions with the Manager of Police Scotland North who is based in Dundee. The current system of deciding where these cameras are situated did not favour the Highlands as it is worked on a point system. Discussions were continuing and would be extended to include Transport Scotland to look at the potential to position camera vans outside local schools, build up areas as well as the A836 at the Forss straight.
- Sand Owsnett also noted that Police Scotland had been on site recently providing safety roadshows which had proved to be very worthwhile.
- Ronnie Johnston noted there were plans to integrate Transport Police with Police Scotland and asked if there were any plans for further integration with CNC and MOD police. Supt O'Kane stated that CNC was not part of the PSoS/BTP plans. A wider UK project under Infrastructure Policy had been considered by the UK Government regarding CNC/MDP/BTP integration but due to EU Exit this was on hold.

There being no further questions, Roger Saxon invited members to raise any other issues.

- Sand Owsnett noted that the Dounreay Unions continue to engage with the local MP and MSP and were hoping to meet with Jamie Stone, MP in London shortly to discuss socio-economics in connection with NDA . Discussions would also continue with the local MSP and the unions were looking to hold a similar discussion at Holyrood.
- Sand Owsnett noted the recent HC motion on a Nuclear Free Highlands and thanked the local Councillors for their involvement in seeking an amendment.
- Sand Owsnett also took the opportunity, on behalf of the unions, to thank David Lowe for his support over the years he had been at Dounreay.
- David Alexander noted that the Dounreay Unions had recently written to the Wick and Thurso Trade Union Council inviting them to work together. He added that the Trades Council had also been in discussion with the local MP and was also looking at doing something broadly similar to a reception at Westminster. David Alexander also commented that the Trades council would be raising a motion on socio economics and the community at the STUC.
- Roger Saxon noted the recent Highland Council motion on a Nuclear Free Highlands and invited the Councillors to provide an update.

Cllr Struan Mackie stated that last Thursday the original Motion for a Nuclear Free Highlands had been defeated 46 to 13 votes following the original motion and an amendment tabled. The motion carried was "We, the Highland council, will not be joining NFLA. The HC recognises the economic and social impact on Caithness & North Sutherland, the depopulation and decommissioning at pace with the need to have a diverse economy so work with CNSRP. The nuclear skill set was viewed as an opportunity.

Cllr Matthew Reiss added that the media reports were fairly accurate and while Cllr Mackie had been quite restrained when talking about the anger this had raised with Caithness Councillors this

had been quite polite in comparison to the feelings that had been mooted. He added he had been extremely annoyed at the implied assumption that nuclear was bad for development. The Caithness Councillors had come together to ensure that the vital contribution that Dounreay had provided to economy had been stated. He added that some Caithness Councillors had been elected on a pro-Caithness and pro-nuclear commitment and he was happy that they could continue to stand up for what is required for Caithness and North Sutherland.

Cllr Willie Mackay agreed with his fellow councillors adding it had been a ludicrous motion which had been heavily defeated.

Tor Justad stated he must have listened to a different meeting as he felt there had been only one mention of Dounreay in the whole debate recognising that decommissioning would continue until around 2036. There had never been an attack on the Dounreay site and it was how those who tabled the amendment had chosen to interpret it. The nuclear free motion was about ensuring that there was sufficient renewable and carbon-type projects to allow the areas to become nuclear free.

Roger Saxon reminded members that the DSG was a non-political organisation and therefore discussion on party politics should be kept to a minimum. Tor Justad noted he was simply stating party political policy in reference to the Conservative policy.

Ronnie Johnston said he had a real objection to DSG not 'doing' politics as this was something that all members needed to do to ensure their voice was heard. Roger Saxon responded saying that DSG played their part in politics with a small 'p' but did not want to get into a Party political arguments as each member was entitled to their own opinion in that respect.

Member of the public, John Deighan asked how much money went into the economy because of Dounreay. June Love noted that estimates were around £80m per annum.

David Flear stated that DSG had never held a particular political stance noting that however this was different from having a political stance for Caithness and North Sutherland. He had listened to the podcast of the Highland Council and noted that a number of Councillors who had spoken up for the area had been from various political parties. What he had observed was Councillors being political for Caithness and North Sutherland and not necessarily for their own party politics. This was the way it should be.

David Broughton stated that many years ago he had worked on the BPEO for the low level waste disposal facility which had included medical waste from Inverness hospitals. While he noted the motion for a Nuclear Free Highlands he wondered if people actually understood the extent of radioactivity within the region already with radio-isotopes for hospital treatments. He felt that having a full nuclear free area was completely debatable.

Cllr Struan Mackie stated he took umbrage at the statement about his party's policy on nuclear. He added he had been elected by the people of Caithness and as far as he was concerned Caithness was his boss and he would continue to fight for his area noting that the amendment had been voted for across all political parties.

There being no further discussion, Roger Saxon thanked everyone for their frank and forthright comments.

For completeness actions raised in the sub group meetings are recorded here:

## Endorsed on Wednesday 26<sup>th</sup> June 2019

DSG(2019)M001/A004: Cllr Willie Mackay to raise City Region Deal at next Caithness Ward Business meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A005: Roger Saxon to raise City Region Deal at the next CNSRP Advisory Board.

DSG(2019)M001/A006: Roger Saxon to write to Ian Ross, CNSRP Independent Chairman regarding City Region Deal.

DSG(2019)M001/A007: Roger Saxon to raise Japanese presentation and how momentum can continue at the next Scottish Sites meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A008: June Love to write to Simon Middlemas requesting CDP presentation be presented at the DSG public meeting in June 2019.

DSG(2019)M001/A009: Roger Saxon to raise Scottish Government's policy on nuclear at the next Scottish Government Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A010: June Love to add plan on a page to the DSG forward look diary for September 2019.

DSG(2019)M001/A011: June Love to ask Cavendish Nuclear for a response to financial forecast and the potential effect for the Dounreay contract.

DSG(2019)M001/A012: David Lowe to advise what contract was awarded to Nuvia.

DSG(2019)M001/A013: June Love to contact ONR for presentation at a DSG Public Meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A014: June Love to send an extract of the DSG December Minutes to Wendy Newton.

DSG(2019)M001/A015: Cllr Struan Mackie to contact the defence minister Gavin Williamson with a view to holding a meeting with DSG on MOD's plans to decommission the site.

DSG(2019)M001/A016: Wendy Newton to confirm that a presentation will be provided at the March DSG public meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A017: DSG members to provide comments on the NDA Draft Business Plan to June Love by Friday 1<sup>st</sup> February.

DSG(2019)M001/A018: DSG members to provide comments to June Love before 15<sup>th</sup> February on SEPA's nuclear sector plan.

DSG(2019)M001/A019: Roger Saxon to raise City Region Deal at the CNSRP Advisory Board.

DSG(2019)M001/A020: Cllr Struan Mackie and CNSRP programme manager to look at potential funding opportunities for Caithness and North Sutherland within the next round of the City Region Deal funding.

DSG(2019)M001/A021: Cllr Struan Mackie to continue to update DSG on city region deal and the potential Caithness seminar/meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A022: Councillor Matthew Reiss to provide information where the figures of depopulation had originated from.

DSG(2019)M001/A023: All DSG members to provide comments to June Love by Friday 1<sup>st</sup> February on the draft DSG response to the NDA Draft Business Plan.

## 6. VULCAN UPDATE

Roger Saxon noted that as is the norm, written updates from Vulcan and its regulators were provided at the Site Restoration Sub Group meeting in January. These discussions were fully recorded in the sub group minutes.

He noted that Wendy Newton had tendered her apologies this evening due to sickness and Cdr Shaun Southwood had stepped in at the last moment. He suggested that if members had any questions on the presentation on future options for the Vulcan site this was left until the next agenda item. For this particular item, members should focus on the site operations update.

Cdr Shaun Southwood noted there was nothing further to add from a Vulcan site perspective since he had reported at the last sub group meeting.

## **7. VULCAN PRESENTATION**

Roger Saxon stated that at the last Site Restoration Sub Group meeting held in January members had received a presentation from Vulcan on the future of the site. Members had been somewhat disappointed that after two years of waiting for this information it appeared that MOD were not at a stage where they knew what the preferred option were as they were only at the appraisal stage of the options.

As Chairman, Roger Saxon stated he was extremely disappointed with this and reminded members that they had challenged MOD to provide a presentation at the public DSG meeting that would not prejudice any procurement activity but provided confidence that all options were being considered. Unfortunately this presentation did not go ahead. In addition, despite repeated requests MOD have indicated they would not publicly consult on the options as they did not have a statutory obligation to do this and that any consultation would be undertaken through the planning process. Roger Saxon added that by the time planning was submitted it would be too late to input into the options because a planning application would be based on one option going forward.

Roger Saxon went on to say that there had been a number of questions raised at the sub group meeting but given there was no presentation he felt that DG members would need to think how to take this forward in a different way. He emphasised the importance of this stating that it was imperative that Vulcan at the very least demonstrated some trust in the community. Given MOD had been part of DSG since its' inception it was disappointed that they had not managed to understand the way DSG operated and while MOD would repeat that their relationship with DSG was different to that of NDA/Dounreay the lack of information flowing into the community appeared to be borne out of arrogance of an MOD who did not understand community support and involvement.

Roger Saxon added that he believed there were many ways in which MOD could have included the community in their thinking process which might have assisted in getting to a final option. However, it appeared that MOD were simply going to decide, announce and defend; something that had been replaced a long time ago with a more open and honest approach.

Ronnie Johnston stated that this was outrageous behaviour from MOD and moved that the DSG regards this as "outrageous" and invite appropriate people to come forward with an explanation for their conduct.

Derrick Milnes stated that he was surprised by MOD's attitude. The presentation requested could have easily been about process and what MOD hoped to achieve as an outcome, it did not need to prejudice any procurement activities. Even in its infancy, the NDA had managed to stand up and

provide details of the site competition process which was a far more complicated procurement to run that without prejudicing procurement activities.

Gillian Coghill asked, if MOD did not yet have a decommissioning programme in place already, what plans they were actually working on right now. It would appear this site activity was being made up on a daily basis, effectively throwing taxpayers money down the drain if after two years no decision had been made and the potential options were just being appraised.

David Broughton asked whether the recent announcement of Rolls Royce moving out of the nuclear business would have any bearing on Vulcan operations.

**Action: DSG(2019)M001/A024: June Love to write to Rolls Royce to ask them about the future of Rolls Royce workforce in relation to the announcement of RR pulling out of nuclear.**

Cllr Willie Mackay noted he was not an expert in nuclear and the conditions that the site need to comply with and asked for an explanation as to what regulatory regime (operational or decommissioning) Vulcan worked under at present.

Danny Gregory, ONR noted that Vulcan was not a nuclear licensed site but an authorised site. As compared with Dounreay, Vulcan did not have Licence Conditions but did have Authorisation Conditions. Stewart Ballantine added in terms of the environment there was a letter of agreement in place which mirrored the RSA93 requirements that would be in place if Vulcan was an authorised site.

David Flear noted that DSG members may remember when Vulcan decided to tell DSG about a leak at the site two years after the event which had not helped MOD at that time. Scottish Government's Minister for Environment at the time, Richard Lockhead got involved and indeed, as chair of DSG at that time, he had received a letter from Commodore Corderoy on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2014 which said "The Dounreay Stakeholder Group has been an important means for us to communicate with the local community and I continue to value the trust and dialogue that exists between us. I realise that the effectiveness of the relationship relies on your Group's trust in MoD and on MoD being as open as we can be. I wish to provide you with my personal assurance that we have been and will continue to be open on site issues, subject only to the very real and necessary constraints of National Security. Notwithstanding this, the safety of the site, any effects on the local community, and safety of all persons remain my top priority." As an aside to the wording from the letter, it would appear that MOD had learned nothing since that time.

David Flear also noted that at the time of discussions concerning the Vulcan leak DSG noted their anger was not at the local site but with the decisions that MOD were making outside the site without any due consideration to a community that had supported them over the last five decades. He also noted that a couple of years ago at the Scottish Government Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting, Roseanna Cunningham had attended and each site had been given the opportunity to raise one question. DSG actually raised two one relating to Dounreay and the other on the future of the Vulcan site. He felt this needed to be raised again through Scottish Government.

Tor Justad noted that, in his experience, MOD were the most secretive organisation he had come across.

Roy Blackburn asked what DSG was actually asking for here as he had heard two messages – one being on the lack of commitment for MOD to consult on the options and the other on lack of

information following a promise two years ago that MOD would come forward with options. He noted clarity was required when considering what the next steps were.

Bob Earnshaw noted that the only opportunity the community would have in responding to the preferred option for the site would be through the planning process and added that he felt this was really poor.

David Flear reminded members of Dalgetty Bay and how MOD had dealt with that situation until Gordon Brown had stepped in.

Struan Mackie noted that he was pretty confident that he would be meeting with UK Government Ministers, Gavin Williamson and Tobias Ellwood in the near future and that DSG concerns would be included in the agenda for discussion. It was important for the workforce at Vulcan that those responsible focus on people and socio economics as part of the future options for the site. A presentation this evening on the optimal route with sub optimal options should have been addressed. Those meeting with the Minister would press for this and letters from DSG and the organisations sitting around the table would be helpful to ensure this message was a strong one. It was imperative that everyone ensured their voice was being heard and this may include discussion with our MP and MSP and members of the community to ensure these views were well understood.

Ronnie Johnston noted he had made a motion earlier on the outrageous behaviour of MOD and asked whether members agreed. Alastair MacDonald seconded this and it was agreed that DSG would ensure their voice was heard.

Alastair MacDonald added that in all his involvement with DSG it had been particularly difficult to get useful response from MOD and recalled a time when he had been invited down to Bristol on a Friday afternoon to discuss Vulcan topics.

Tor Justad stated he wished Cllr Struan Mackie luck with his meetings as his experience, as an NGO, to engage with MOD had not been forthcoming.

Roy Blackburn re-iterated the importance of DSG's disappointment and whether this related to having no statutory obligation to consult or whether this would be based around the lack of presentation and detail at this meeting after a two year promise that information would be available.

Roger Saxon repeated his disappointment and felt that despite everything that MOD could have learned during the announcement of the leak they continued to provide lip-service to DSG hiding behind different rules and regulations. He stated that while DSG had been content to wait and work with the site locally it now appeared that DSG had no other option than to raise this at higher level.

Roger Saxon added that DSG's next steps needed to be considered and therefore with members' agreement he would set up a Business meeting of DSG quickly and agree how to take this forward. The outcome of the discussion at the Business Meeting would be distributed to all DSG members for comment to ensure all organisations sitting around the table were involved. He felt that this had to be something DSG united in and ensured this was raised to a national level.

## **8. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC**

Roger Saxon noted that members of the public had been given an opportunity to ask questions or raise any topics during the agenda discussions. He asked whether anyone wished to raise anything further that had not already been covered.

- Alexander Glasgow asked whether there had been closure to the Vulcan boiler explosion as he had heard a similar incident elsewhere had resulted in serious injuries. Cdr Shaun Southwood responded that he did not believe that the incident at Vulcan could not have had the same magnitude of injury as the similar incident had reported. The information continued to be discussed via the Safety Directors Forum.

David Flear noted that the previous Vulcan representative on the DSG had always been helpful in respect of being as open as he could be on the operational aspects of the site and was pleased to see Cdr Southwood was also helpful in responding to any questions raised within the same bounds.

- Alexander Glasgow noted the statement made by Martin O’Kane regarding CNC Police working with Police Scotland and asked for clarification that if Police Scotland required assistance then CNC would assist. Martin O’Kane responded that if it was in an area of jurisdiction then CNC Police would act. If CNC were the first responders they would always notify Police Scotland who would take responsibility as soon as they could.
- Thelma Mackenzie enquired about the Caithness Horizons Board and asked whether the minutes of their AGM were made publicly available. June Love noted that there was no-one from the CH Board at the meeting and said she would take the action and report back.

**Action: DSG(2019)M001/A025: June Love to ask whether Caithness Horizons AGM minutes were made publicly available.**

## **9. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

Before opening up to members, Roger Saxon noted:

- DSG Chair and vice-chair had met with NDA representatives in October alongside Trudy Morris and Eann Sinclair where there was an opportunity to discuss NDA funding for socio economic projects.
- The next Stakeholder Group Chair’s forum is being held in London on 8/9<sup>th</sup> April.
- The Chair had attended the Caithness Transport Forum on 6<sup>th</sup> March along with a number of other representatives in the room.

He then invited members to raise topics. There being no further business, Roger Saxon thanked everyone for their input and formally closed the meeting.

**Roger Saxon**  
**DSG Chair**  
20<sup>th</sup> March 2019



**ACTIONS ARISING FROM THIS MEETING**

DSG(2019)M001/A001: Mark Raffle, NDA to provide a response as to whether there was a timeline for Sellafield Ltd to complete its' investigation into the findings of low contaminated debris being found in the container that was transported to Dounreay and to also confirm whether this would be publicly available.

DSG(2019)M001/A002: Sam Usher, Waste Project Director, to provide an update on the recycling of large low level contaminated waste for the next DSG Site Restoration sub group meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A003: Sam Usher to provide an update on the new LLW vaults at the next site restoration sub group meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A004: Cllr Willie Mackay to raise City Region Deal at next Caithness Ward Business meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A005: Roger Saxon to raise City Region Deal at the next CNSRP Advisory Board.

DSG(2019)M001/A006: Roger Saxon to write to Ian Ross, CNSRP Independent Chairman regarding City Region Deal.

DSG(2019)M001/A007: Roger Saxon to raise Japanese presentation and how momentum can continue at the next Scottish Sites meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A008: June Love to write to Simon Middlemas requesting CDP presentation be presented at the DSG public meeting in June 2019.

DSG(2019)M001/A009: Roger Saxon to raise Scottish Government's policy on nuclear at the next Scottish Government Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A010: June Love to add plan on a page to the DSG forward look diary for September 2019.

DSG(2019)M001/A011: June Love to ask Cavendish Nuclear for a response to financial forecast and the potential effect for the Dounreay contract.

DSG(2019)M001/A012: David Lowe to advise what contract was awarded to Nuvia.

DSG(2019)M001/A013: June Love to contact ONR for presentation at a DSG Public Meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A014: June Love to send an extract of the DSG December Minutes to Wendy Newton.

DSG(2019)M001/A015: Cllr Struan Mackie to contact the defence minister Gavin Williamson with a view to holding a meeting with DSG on MOD's plans to decommission the site.

DSG(2019)M001/A016: Wendy Newton to confirm that a presentation will be provided at the March DSG public meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A017: DSG members to provide comments on the NDA Draft Business Plan to June Love by Friday 1<sup>st</sup> February.

DSG(2019)M001/A018: DSG members to provide comments to June Love before 15<sup>th</sup> February on SEPA's nuclear sector plan.

DSG(2019)M001/A019: Roger Saxon to raise City Region Deal at the CNSRP Advisory Board.

DSG(2019)M001/A020: Cllr Struan Mackie and CNSRP programme manager to look at potential funding opportunities for Caithness and North Sutherland within the next round of the City Region Deal funding.

## Endorsed on Wednesday 26<sup>th</sup> June 2019

DSG(2019)M001/A021: Cllr Struan Mackie to continue to update DSG on city region deal and the potential Caithness seminar/meeting.

DSG(2019)M001/A022: Councillor Matthew Reiss to provide information where the figures of depopulation had originated from.

DSG(2019)M001/A023: All DSG members to provide comments to June Love by Friday 1<sup>st</sup> February on the draft DSG response to the NDA Draft Business Plan.

DSG(2019)M001/A024: June Love to write to Rolls Royce to ask them about the future of Rolls Royce workforce in relation to the announcement of RR pulling out of nuclear.

DSG(2019)M001/A025: June Love to ask whether Caithness Horizons AGM minutes were made publicly available.